# JOINT TRANSPORTATION RESEARCH PROGRAM 

INDIANA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
AND PURDUE UNIVERSITY

## Long-Term Pavement Performance Indicators for Failed Materials



Jaehyun Park, Chenxi Yuan, Hubo Cai

## RECOMMENDED CITATION

Park, J., Yuan, C., \& Cai, H. (2016). Long-term pavement performance indicators for failed materials (Joint Transportation Research Program Publication No. FHWA/IN/JTRP-2016/10). West Lafayette, IN: Purdue University. http://dx.doi.org /10.5703/1288284316333

## AUTHORS

## Jaehyun Park

Graduate Research Assistant
Lyles School of Civil Engineering
Purdue University

## Chenxi Yuan

Graduate Research Assistant
Lyles School of Civil Engineering
Purdue University

## Hubo Cai, PhD

Associate Professor of Civil Engineering
Lyles School of Civil Engineering
Purdue University
(765) 494-5028
hubocai@purdue.edu
Corresponding Author

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project was made possible by the sponsorship of the Joint Transportation Research Program (JTRP) and the Indiana Department of Transportation (INDOT). The authors acknowledge the valuable assistance and technical guidance from the members of the Study Advisory Committee in the course of performing this study.

## JOINT TRANSPORTATION RESEARCH PROGRAM

The Joint Transportation Research Program serves as a vehicle for INDOT collaboration with higher education institutions and industry in Indiana to facilitate innovation that results in continuous improvement in the planning, design, construction, operation, management and economic efficiency of the Indiana transportation infrastructure. https://engineering.purdue.edu/JTRP/index_html

Published reports of the Joint Transportation Research Program are available at http://docs.lib.purdue.edu/jtrp/.

## NOTICE

The contents of this report reflect the views of the authors, who are responsible for the facts and the accuracy of the data presented herein. The contents do not necessarily reflect the official views and policies of the Indiana Department of Transportation or the Federal Highway Administration. The report does not constitute a standard, specification, or regulation.

## COPYRIGHT

Copyright 2016 by Purdue University. All rights reserved.
Print ISBN: 978-1-62260-394-7
ePUB ISBN: 978-1-62260-395-4

TECHNICAL REPORT STANDARD TITLE PAGE


## 17. Key Words

Portland cement concrete pavement, hot mix asphalt pavement, failed materials, decision framework, life-cycle cost, long-term performance, PaveSpec, performance related specification, QRSS

## 18. Distribution Statement

No restrictions. This document is available to the public through the National Technical Information Service, Springfield, VA 22161.

| 19. Security Classif. (of this report) | 20. Security Classif. (of this page) | 21. No. of Pages | 22. Price |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Unclassified | Unclassified | 141 |  |

Form DOT F 1700.7 (8-69)

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## LONG-TERM PAVEMENT PERFORMANCE INDICATORS FOR FAILED MATERIALS

## INTRODUCTION

State Transportation Agencies (STAs) use quality control/ quality assurance (QC/QA) specifications to guide the testing and inspection of road pavement construction. Any pavement section that does not pass the testing is viewed as failed materials. Although failed materials rarely occur in practice, it is critical to have a sound decision framework to assist in making data-driven, informed decisions because such decisions have profound impacts on the long-term performance of pavement and the operation and maintenance costs of the responsible highway agencies.

At the Indiana Department of Transportation (INDOT), the Failed Materials Committee makes decisions regarding whether failed materials should be considered for "removal and replacement" or be "accepted with a heavy penalty." The "removal and replacement" option, most of the time, is not popular because the pavement section has to be closed for a long period of time. However, choosing the "heavy penalty" option leaves INDOT with questions regarding the reliability of pavement performance. Uncertainty about long-term pavement performance creates a dilemma for INDOT, and therefore a procedure is needed for assessing performance based on the reliability of sub-standard pavement materials. This procedure should be based on the predicted performance difference, which in turn causes the lifecycle cost (LCC) difference between as-designed and as-constructed pavement, to assist the Committee to make data-driven decisions.

In this study a decision framework was created to assist INDOT in making decisions regarding pavement sections of failed materials. The framework is based on the long-term performance modules available from existing performance-related specification (PRS) tools. A PRS is a quality acceptance (QA) specification that speci-fies the acceptable levels of key acceptance quality characteristics (AQCs) that are directly related to fundamental engineering properties, which in turn determine the long-term performance of construction end products (e.g., pavement). Pavement PRS tools are capable of analyzing input AQCs to predict the lifetime per-formance and life-cycle cost of the pavement through computer simulations for both as-designed and as-constructed pavement. Using the decision framework, INDOT can compare the LCC of the as-designed pavement to the LCC of the as-constructed pavement to calculate the LCC difference at various confidence levels and compare the LCC difference to the contract price to decide which option (i.e., "removal and replacement" versus "acceptance with a heavy penalty") is more economic.

Two PRS tools, PaveSpec for Portland cement concrete pavement (PCCP) and Quality Related Specification Software (QRSS) for hot mixed asphalt (HMA) pavement, were explored in develop-ing the decision framework. A large number of simulations of various scenarios in the context of INDOT pavement construction were conducted to fully develop and implement the decision framework. The newly developed framework was tested and validated using design and construction data from an INDOT construction project.

## FINDINGS

Valuable findings regarding the use of PRS tools to predict the long-term performance and to estimate the LCC of PCCP and HMA pavement as well as the interpretation of PRS analysis results to support decision-making regarding failed materials are summar-ized as follows.

## Using PaveSpec to Develop the Decision Framework for Failed Materials of PCCP

- PaveSpec takes five AQCs for PCCP: concrete strength, slab thickness, air content, initial smoothness, and percent consolidation around dowels (optional). The four mandatory AQCs are all being tested as stipulated in INDOT QA/QC specification for PCCP.
- PaveSpec provides two levels of specification, Level 1 and Level 2 Specification, to predict the long-term performance and to estimate the LCC for PCCP. The Level 2 Specification considers the correlation between AQCs. It is more reflective of the reality and therefore, Level 2 Specification is the level adopted in the newly developed decision framework. Simulation results show that LCCs estimated using the Level 2 Specification are lower than the LCCs estimated using the Level 1 Specification for the same PCCP pavement.
- In PaveSpec, two approaches are available to estimate the LCC of as-constructed PCCP-the interpolation and the re-simulation approach. The interpolation approach is the default one, which estimates the LCC of the as-constructed pavement by interpolating the pay factor table resulted from the simulations for the as-designed, based on individual AQCs. The re-simulation approach, a new approach created in this study, substitutes the target $A Q C$ values in the as-designed simulation with field-testing results of the AQCs and runs the simulation to estimate the LCC of the as-constructed pavement. The interpolation approach yields a single, deterministic estimate of the LCC for the as-constructed, but the re-simulation approach yields a set of predicted LCCs so that statistical analysis can be performed to calculate the confidence level for a given LCC and vice versa (e.g., 90th-percentile LCC and 95th-percentile LCC). Therefore, the re-simulation approach was adopted in the decision framework.
- For the flexural strength AQC, PaveSpec requires the 28-day strength, but could take the 7-day strength as an input if a curing curve is provided. INDOT tests 7-day strength only. Unfortunately, the curing curve depends on the mix formula, which varies from project to project. After an extensive literature review and consulting INDOT experts, a multiplication constant ( $C$ ) was set at 1.23 to calculate the 28-day strength from the 7 -day strength (i.e., 28-day strength $=$ 7-day strength $\times 1.23$ ).
- The examination of INDOT specifications on the criteria of failed materials revealed that a lot could contain both acceptable and failed sublots. Two different methods, the single lot method and the divide-estimate-sum method, were devised and their results were compared for various scenarios of the co-existence of both failed and acceptable sublots in a single lot. The single lot method treats the lot that contains both acceptable and failed sublots as a single lot in PaveSpec. The divide-estimate-sum method separates the original lot into two new lots, one contains acceptable
sublot(s) only and the other contains failed sublot(s) only. Simulations are then performed for the new lots and results are added to estimate the LCC for the original lot. Simulation results show that estimated LCCs are quite different between these two methods. For the flexural strength AQC, the single lot method always yielded higher LCCs than the divide-estimate-sum method did. For the air content AQC, the single lot method always yielded lower LCCs than the divide-estimate-sum method did. These observations can be explained by looking at the sensitivity of LCC to the mean and the standard deviation. For the flexural strength AQC, the LCC is more sensitive to the consistency (indicated by the standard deviation). For the air content, the LCC is more sensitive to the average (indicated by the mean). Separating acceptable and failed sublots into two new lots leads to two smaller standard deviations than the standard deviation of the original lot and two new means, one is larger and the other is smaller than the mean of the original lot. Based on the comparisons, it is concluded that (1) for the lot level failure, i.e., the lot average falls in the failed range, the single lot approach is more appropriate, and (2) for the sublot level failure, i.e., the lot average is acceptable, but the lot contains failed sublot(s), it reflects the reality better by separating the original lot into two new lots, one contains acceptable sublot( $s$ ) only and the other contains failed sublot( $s$ ) only. This conclusion was incorporated in developing the decision framework.
- A large number of simulation scenarios of failed materials were designed for a three-sublot lot. Simulations were performed to estimate the LCC of PCCP using the Level 2 Specification, the re-simulation approach, and the divide-estimate-sum method. Results show that for flexural strength and thickness AQCs, a trend exists: higher mean values (indicating better quality) and lower standard deviations (indicating higher consistency) always lead to lower LCCs. While the same trend exists for the air content AQC, it is not appropriate to use PaveSpec because a higher air content does not indicate a better quality.
- Concerned with the air content AQC, additional simulation scenarios were designed to investigate the aggregate effect of multiple AQCs (focusing on air content) on the LCC. Results show that higher means of the air content AQC always yielded lower LCC estimates regardless of the variations in other AQCs, such as concrete strength and thickness. It was concluded that PaveSpec is not an appropriate tool for estimating the as-constructed LCC if materials fail because of the air content AQC.
- The LCC difference at various level of confidence can be statistically calculated in such a way, in which (1) the simulated LCCs of the as-designed and the simulated LCCs of the as-constructed are two independent samples following the normal distribution, (2) the LCC differences are a derived sample that follows the normal distribution-its mean is the average of the means of the two samples in (1) and its standard deviation is the square root of the sum of the squares of the two standard deviations of the two samples in (1). Consequently, the LCC difference at any confidence level can be calculated following the calculation methods for normal distributions.
- Aforementioned findings were incorporated into a newly developed decision framework (see Figure 3.13) for failed materials of PCCP. It was validated using design and testing data from INDOT construction project (IR-30846).


## Using QRSS to Develop the Decision Framework for Failed Materials of QC/QA HMA Pavement

- QRSS only estimates the service life by predicting the distresses of rutting, fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking; and comparing them to pre-set threshold values. It does not have a mechanism to incorporate maintenance strategies and costs to estimate the LCC.
- There is a misalignment between the AQCs specified in INDOT's QC/QA HMA specification and the AQCs required in QRSS. Table 4.1 illustrates that (1) only two AQCsbinder content and roadway core density-are common to both INDOT specification and QRSS, (2) two AQCs-lab-compacted air voids, and voids in mineral aggregate (VMA)-are included in INDOT specification, but cannot be used directly in QRSS, and (3) gradation AQCs are required by QRSS, but are not included in INDOT specification.
- Because of the misalignment, a pairing mechanism is needed in order to run QRSS simulations for INDOT QC/QA HMA pavement. Table 4.5 illustrates this pairing mechanism. A recommendation to INDOT would be to collect the AQCs that are required in QRSS in order to adopt QRSS in the decision framework.
- A challenge in applying QRSS to INDOT QC/QA HMA pavement is caused by the use of PWL as the criterion for failed materials in INDOT specification: many different scenarios could lead to the same PWL value.
- QRSS estimates the long-term pavement performance in terms of pavement distresses (i.e., rutting, fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking), predicts service life by comparing the distresses to their pre-set threshold values, and calculates the service life differences between as-designed and asconstructed pavements. However, QRSS simulations yielded abnormal results when predicting the service life difference between the as-designed and the as-constructed pavement based on fatigue cracking and thermal cracking. For the fatigue cracking, when the same set of values were used for both the as-designed and the as-constructed pavements, QRSS always predicted negative service life differences, i.e., the as-constructed pavement has a shorter service life than the as-built pavement. For the thermal cracking, QRSS always predicted there is no service life difference between the as-designed and the as-constructed even though their AQC values were different, but all in normal ranges. Furthermore, when either the as-constructed has extremely high AQC values or extremely low AQC values, QRSS predicted that the service life difference is over 50 years. Since QRSS yields abnormal results when considering thermal cracking and fatigue cracking, it is not appropriate to use both of them as the base for estimating the shortened service life attributable to failed materials.
- The current version of QRSS executes Monte Carlo simulations to predict service life differences based on pavement performance estimates. In the results, QRSS provides means of the service life differences; however, it does not provide standard deviations of the service life differences directly. Therefore, to predict the service life difference at a userspecified confidence/probability (e.g., 90th-percentile or 95th-percentile service life difference), a statistical approach was devised to calculate the standard deviation based on individual pairs of the service life of as-designed and asconstructed.
- A large number of simulation scenarios for the only two common AQCs in QRSS and INDOT specification-binder content and roadway core density-were crafted in lieu of a five-sublot lot. The simulation results showed that the service life is insensitive to the standard deviation, but it is closely correlated with the mean-a higher mean in either binder content or roadway core density leads to a longer service life. The trend, in turn, lead to erroneous results when applying the PWL concept. Because any value that is too high or too low is outside the limit, for a given PWL value, if the original set is leaning towards the higher end, the predicted service life is longer; if the original set is leaning towards the higher end, the predicted service life is shorter. As the result, QRSS estimated that for certain groups of failed materials, the service life of the as-constructed is longer than the service life of as-designed.
- Given the misalignment between INDOT AQCs and the AQCs required in QRSS, the limitations in QRSS, and the erroneous results from the QRSS simulations, QRSS is not being recommended as the PRS tool to be used for QC/QA HMA pavement at this moment.


## IMPLEMENTATION

The findings from this study were used to develop the decision framework for failed materials of PCCP. This framework enables the calculation of the difference between the LCC of as-designed
and the LCC of as-constructed pavement at a user-specified confidence level and the comparison of the LCC difference to the construction contract price to determine whether the "removal and replacement" or the "acceptance with a heavy penalty" option is more economically appropriate. The framework also helps to determine the appropriate monetary amount if the "acceptance with a heavy penalty" option is chosen. The framework was validated using the design and construction data of an INDOT highway construction project. This framework can be immediately implemented to assist INDOT in making informed decisions regarding failed PCCP materials while waiting for findings of the use of MEPDG on PCCP. Given the availability of the software tool and the matching AQCs, the implementation cost is minimal. However, training on the use of PaveSpec is critical to the success of implementation.

For QC/QA HMA pavement, while the concept on comparing the long-term performance between as-designed and as-constructed pavement is still valid, QRSS is not an appropriate PRS tool to estimate the long-term performance because of its limitations and the misalignment between QRSS process and INDOT practice. Further study is needed to find an appropriate PRS tool, which could be a modified version of QRSS or a different tool such as Mechanistic-Empirical Pavement Design Guide (MEPDG). An opportunity for immediate implementation is the set of AQCs: it is recommended that INDOT aligns its AQCs with the AQCs required in QRSS, which have been found to have significant effect on the long-term pavement performance.

## CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION ..... 1
1.1 Background ..... 1
1.2 Problem Statement ..... 1
1.3 Overall Objectives. ..... 1
1.4 Work Plan. ..... 1
2. LITERATURE REVIEW ..... 2
2.1 INDOT Definition of Failed Materials ..... 2
2.2 Long-Term Performance and LCC Estimation of PCCP ..... 4
2.3 Estimating Long-Term Performance for HMA Pavement ..... 5
3. AN LCC BASED DECISION FRAMEWORK FOR FAILED PCCP MATERIALS ..... 6
3.1 Distresses and Required AQCs in PaveSpec ..... 6
3.2 Input Variables ..... 6
3.3 Analytical Process of PaveSpec ..... 7
3.4 Estimating the LCC of As-Constructed PCCP: The Interpolation Approach versus the Re-Simulation Approach. ..... 11
3.5 Level 1 Specification versus Level 2 Specification ..... 11
3.6 Selecting the Approach and the Level of Specification ..... 11
3.7 LCC Trend and Sensitivity Analysis Via Simulations. ..... 13
3.8 Simulation Results of Various AQC Failure Scenarios ..... 14
3.9 LCC Estimation for Lots with Both Failed and Acceptable Sublots ..... 15
3.10 The Calculation of LCC Difference at User-Specified Confidence Levels ..... 15
3.11 The Decision Frameweork for Failed PCCP Materials ..... 17
4. USE OF QRSS FOR QC/QA HMA PAVEMENT OF FAILED MATERAILS ..... 20
4.1 Distresses and Service Life Prediction ..... 20
4.2 Input Variables ..... 20
4.3 Analytical Process of QRSS ..... 20
4.4 Service Life Difference with Probabilities ..... 21
4.5 Challenge 1: Aligning INDOT AQCS to QRSS AQCS ..... 23
4.6 Challenge 2: Abnormal Results for Failed Materials ..... 23
4.7 Challenge 3: Uncertainties Introduced by PWL ..... 24
4.8 Recommendations Regarding the Use of QRSS for QC/QA HMA ..... 26
5. CASE ILLUSTRATION OF THE DECISION FRAMEWORK FOR PCCP ..... 32
5.1 Case Overview ..... 32
5.2 The Application of the Decision Framework. ..... 32
6. SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS ..... 33
6.1 Summary and Recommendations. ..... 33
6.2 Key Findings ..... 33
6.3 Recommendations for Implementation ..... 35
6.4 Deliverables ..... 36
REFERENCES ..... 36
APPENDICES
Appendix A. Pavespec Input Data for Studying ..... 37
Appendix B. Composite Effects of Multiple AQCs Analysis Results ..... 42
Appendix C. QRSS Input Data for Studying ..... 113
Appendix D. Relationships between Service Life Differences and PWLs of Binder Content Analysis Results ..... 118
Appendix E. Relationships between Service Life Differences and PWLs of Roadway Core Density Analysis Results ..... 124
Appendix F. Pavespec Input Data for Validation ..... 131

## LIST OF TABLES

Table

Table 2.1 Criteria of acceptance and failed materials for PCCP
Table 2.2 Lot based criteria of acceptance and failed materials for HMA pavement 3
Table 2.3 Pay adjustment and failure criterion based on PWL for QC/QA HMA pavement $\geq 1$ lot 4
Table 2.4 Sublot based criteria of acceptance and failed materials for HMA pavement 4
Table 3.1 AQCs and related distress indicators 6
Table 3.2 Input categories in PaveSpec 6
Table 3.3 Related inputs for each step in Figure 3.1 7
Table 3.4 Current INDOT sampling and testing method 8
Table 3.5 Comparison of LCC results of the interpolation and the re-simulation approaches (Level 1 Specification) 12
Table 3.6 Comparison of LCC results of the interpolation and the re-simulation approaches (Level 2 Specification) 13
Table 3.7 LCC results comparisons of Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification 13
Table 3.8 Scenarios for selecting approach and level of specification 14
Table 3.9 Comparisons between the interpolation and re-simulation approaches 14
Table 3.10 Comparisons between the Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification 15
Table 4.1 QRSS inputs required for analysis 21
Table 4.2 Related inputs for each step 22
Table 4.3 Simulation outputs 24
Table 4.4 AQCs for INDOT QC/QA HMA and QRSS 25
Table 4.5 Pairing results of the AQCs for INDOT QC/QA HMA and QRSS 25
Table 4.6 Generated samples and estimated service life differences per binder content 27
Table 4.7 Generated samples and estimated service life differences per roadway core density 27
Table 5.1 Design AQC values (from INDOT Project IR-30846) 32
Table 5.2 Acceptance testing results (lot 7, INDOT project IR-30846) 33
Table 5.3 LCCs estimated in PaveSpec 33
Table 5.4 Estimated 90th-percentile and 95th-percentile LCC differences 33

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure Page
Figure 2.1 The lot and sublot concept of surface HMA pavement in INDOT ..... 3
Figure 2.2 The typical PRS analysis procedure of PCCP ..... 4
Figure 2.3 LCC comparison method between as-designed LCC and as-constructed LCC ..... 5
Figure 2.4 The PRS analysis procedure of QRSS for HMA pavement ..... 6
Figure 3.1 PaveSpec workflow ..... 7
Figure 3.2 Definition of pavement performance ..... 8
Figure 3.3 Current INDOT sampling method ..... 9
Figure 3.4 AQC as-designed target value definition ..... 9
Figure 3.5 Preconstruction outputs ..... 10
Figure 3.6 PaveSpec use specification execution results ..... 10
Figure 3.7 LCC results comparisons of the interpolation and the re-simulation methods ..... 12
Figure 3.8 LCC results comparisons of Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification ..... 13
Figure 3.9 Trend analysis results ..... 16
Figure 3.10 The dilemma caused by air content ..... 17
Figure 3.11 Composite effects of multiple AQCs analysis results ..... 18
Figure 3.12 Comparison of two different methods in estimating the LCC of a lot that contains both acceptable and failed sublots (flexural strength) ..... 19
Figure 3.13 Illustration of the decision framework for PCCP of failed materials ..... 20
Figure 4.1 QRSS workflow ..... 21
Figure 4.2 Monte Carlo simulation of the as-designed mix ..... 22
Figure 4.3 QRSS analysis outputs ..... 23
Figure 4.4 Simulation procedure for each scenario ..... 26
Figure 4.5 Trend analysis results ..... 28
Figure 4.6 An illustration of two different samples with the same PWL value ..... 28
Figure 4.7 Relationship between the service life difference and the PWL of binder content ..... 29
Figure 4.8 Relationship between service life differences and PWL per roadway core density ..... 30
Figure 4.9 The relationships between service life differences and the means and standard deviations ..... 31
Figure 5.1 INDOT project IR-30846 ..... 32

## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Background

State Transportation Agencies (STAs) follow quality control/quality assurance (QC/QA) specifications to inspect and test road pavements in construction. Any pavement that does not pass the testing is viewed as failed materials of pavement. Although failed materials of pavement rarely occur in practice, it is critical to have a sound decision framework to assist in making informed decisions regarding failed materials because such decisions have profound impacts on the long-term performance of the pavement and the operation and maintenance costs of the responsible highway agencies.

At the Indiana Department of Transportation (INDOT), the Failed Materials Committee makes decisions regarding failed materials: should the failed materials be "removed and replaced" or be "accepted with a heavy penalty." The "remove and replace" option, most of the time, is not a popular option since the pavement section has to be closed for a long period of time. However, selecting a "heavy penalty" option leaves the INDOT Failed Material Committee with a question on the reliability in the performance of the failed material pavement section. Uncertainty in long-term pavement performance created a dilemma for the Committee. There is a need to have a procedure on how to assess long-term pavement performance based on reliability of the substandard pavement materials. Such a procedure should be based on the predicted performance difference, which in turn, causes the life-cycle cost (LCC) difference between as-designed and as-constructed pavement, to make real data driven decisions by the Committee.

Computing tools from Performance-Related Specification (PRS) are capable of predicting the long-term performance of the pavement and the LCCs of as-designed and of as-constructed pavement. PRS are quality acceptance (QA) specifications emerged in recent years. They specify the desired levels of key acceptance quality characteristics (AQCs) that have been bound to be correlated with fundamental engineering properties that can predict the long-term performance of the pavement. Based on this correlation, PRS tools are available to estimate the LCC for both as-designed and as-constructed pavement, using AQCs as inputs. A few state highway agencies (SHAs) have already adopted this PRS approach in their specifications to determine the pay factor (a percentage of the contract price) of as-constructed pavement based on the comparison between the LCC of the as-designed and the LCC of the as-constructed pavement (Evans, Darter, \& Egan, 2005; Evans, Smith, Gharaibeh, \& Darter, 2008; Rao, Smith, \& Darter, 2007).

To address the challenge regarding failed materials INDOT is facing, INDOT initiated research (this research project) to develop a decision framework to assist in dealing with failed materials from the life-cycle performance perspective, based on the difference between the LCC of the as-designed and the LCC of the as-constructed pavement. The newly developed framework incorporates LCC estimation modules from existing PRS tools-

PaveSpec for Portland cement concrete pavement (PCCP) and QRSS for Hot mixed asphalt (HMA) pavement. It also incorporates risk analysis to allow INDOT to make decisions according to its risk mitigation strategies. A large number of simulations were conducted to develop the framework. The resulting framework was tested and validated using data from an INDOT's highway construction project.

### 1.2 Problem Statement

Two options are considered by INDOT to deal with pavement segments that contain failed materials: "removal and replacement" and "acceptance with a heavy penalty." The "removal and replacement" option, most of the time, is not a popular one because the concerned pavement section has to be closed for a long period of time. However, choosing the "acceptance with a heavy penalty" option leaves INDOT with a question on the reliability in terms of the long-term performance of the pavement and the financial impact, e.g., excessive maintenance cost and elevated user cost due to its inferior performance and shortened service life. There is a need to establish a procedure to guide INDOT on decisionmaking regarding failed materials based on the reliability of the sub-standard pavement materials. Such a procedure should be based on the predicted performance difference and LCC difference between as-designed and as-constructed pavement.

### 1.3 Overall Objectives

The objective of this study is to (1) determine the monetary impact from the long-term pavement performance of sub-standard/failed materials; and (2) create a mechanism for INDOT to make data-driven, informed decision-making regarding failed pavement materials. The work scope includes both PCCP and QC/QA HMA pavement (dense grade mixes only).

Two main deliverables are: (1) an analysis procedure that leverages INDOT QA process and key acceptance quality characteristics (AQCs), and PRS tools (i.e., PaveSpec for PCCP pavement and Quality Related Specification Software (QRSS) for HMA pavement) to determine both short- and long-term performance, and monetary difference between "as-designed" and "as-constructed" pavement sections of failed materials; and (2) a guideline on using the aforementioned analysis procedure and interpreting results in a reliability-based manner a tool for data-driven, informed decision-making regarding failed materials in both pavement types.

### 1.4 Work Plan

The research project consists of the following four tasks for monetarily assessing the long-term risks of inferior pavement performance because of failed materials.

- Task 1: Literature review: PRS, DOT QC/QA, and risk analysis
- Task 2: PRS based pavement performance analysis of failed materials
- Task 3: Risk analysis of long-term pavement performance of failed materials
- Task 4: Validation of proposed decision framework


## 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

### 2.1 INDOT Definition of Failed Materials

Failed materials lead to inferior performance that in turn, lead to excessive maintenance, repair, and rehabilitation costs, and shortened service life. INDOT defines failed materials of PCCP and QC/QA HMA pavement in its standard specification based on AQCs.

### 2.1.1 Failed Materials of Portland Cement Concrete Pavement (PCCP)

For PCCP, INDOT uses four AQCs-flexural strength, air content, thickness, and smoothness-to define the criteria for failed materials (INDOT, 2013). Table 2.1 summarizes these criteria. For the air content AQC, the failure criteria are defined on both the average and the range of the measures. The failure criteria for the flexural strength and the air content are defined at both levels of lot and sublot. The failure criteria for the air content range are at the lot level. The failure criteria for the thickness are defined only at the sublot level. While there is a failure criterion defined for the smoothness AQC, if the smoothness is greater than or equal to 3.8 inch $/ 0.1$ mile, it must be corrected; the pavement is not allowed to fail because of its smoothness.

### 2.1.2 Failed Materials of $Q C / Q A$ Hot Mix Asphalt (HMA) Pavement

The criteria of failure for QC/QA HMA pavement are different for pavement that is greater than or equal to 1 lot and pavement that is less than 1 lot. In the INDOT specification on the quality assurance procedures for QC/QA HMA, a lot is defined as of 5,000 tons of the base or intermediate layer of HMA pavement
and as of 3,000 tons of the surface layer of HMA pavement. A lot is then divided into 5 sublots that are of equal tons; a sublot for the base and intermediate layer of HMA pavement is 1,000 tons and a sublot for the surface layer of HMA pavement is 600 tons.

In the practice, most pavement sections are not the exact multiplications of either 5,000 or 3,000 tons; therefore, the remaining part, though it is smaller than 5.000 or 3,000 tons depending on which layer is considered, becomes a ("partial") standalone lot. While it is straightforward to divide a "standard" lot into five equal-weight sublots, dividing a "partial" lot into sublots is different: a "partial" standalone lot is divided into as many sublots at the same size of the sublots in a "standard" lot; for any portion that remains, if it is no more than 100 tons, it is added to the proceeding sublot, otherwise, it is considered as a new sublot (INDOT, 2013). Figure 2.1 illustrates the definition of lot and sublot based on the surface layer of HMA pavement in INDOT with three examples. Lot 1 is a "standard" lot. It has a total of 3,000 tons of surface layer of an HMA pavement and is divided into five equivalent sublots, each at 600 tons. The failure criteria for a standard lot are described in INDOT specifications 401.19(a) and explained in section 2.1.2.1. Lot 2 is a "partial" lot. It is composed of two sublots, one at 600 tons (the standard size) and the other at 200 tons. Lot 3 is another "partial" lot. It is composed of two sublots, one at 600 tons and the other at 690 tons. The second sublot is larger than 600 tons and the extra 90 tons come from the remaining portion that is too small ( $<100$ tons) to become a sublot. The failure criteria for partial lots are described in INDOT specifications 401.19(b), and explained in section 2.1.2.2.

### 2.1.2.1 Failure Criteria for QC/QA Pavement $\geq 1$ Lot.

 For QC/QA HMA pavement that is greater than or equal to 1 lot, INDOT applies the concept of statistical quality control for the acceptance and pay adjustment of QC/QA HMA pavement at the lot level. Specifically, the Percent Within Limits (PWL) approach is used for QC/QA HMA pavement (INDOT, 2013; Scott, Konrath, \& Ferragut, 2014). This PWL approach assumes that theTABLE 2.1
Criteria of acceptance and failed materials for PCCP.

| AQC Measures | Acceptable Range |  | Failure Criteria |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Full Pay | Discount Pay | Lot Average | Sublot |
| Flexural Strength | $\geq 570$ psi | [ 515, 570] psi | $\leq 514 \mathrm{psi}$ | $<500 \mathrm{psi}$ |
| Air Content | [5.7, 8.9]\% | [9.0, 9.8]\% and [5.3, 5.6]\% | $<5.3 \%$ and $>9.8 \%$ | $<5.0 \%$ and $>10.0 \%$ |
| Air Content Range | [0.0, 2.5]\% | [2.6, 3.5]\% | >3.5\% | N/A* |
| Thickness: (Average core depth, or ACD) - (Design depth, or DD) | $\pm 0.2$ inch | [-1.0, -0.2] inch | N/A | $<-1.00$ inch |
| Smoothness: 0.0-inch blanking band Profile Index (PI0.0) | $\begin{gathered} >0.00 \mathrm{in} . / 0.1 \mathrm{mi} . \text { and } \\ \quad<3.60 \mathrm{in} . / 0.1 \mathrm{mi} . \end{gathered}$ | [3.60, 3.80] in./0.1 mi. | $\geq 3.8$ in. $/ 0.1 \mathrm{mi}$. (must be corrected to less than $3.80 \mathrm{in} . / 0.1 \mathrm{mi}$.) | N/A |

[^0]

Figure 2.1 The lot and sublot concept of surface HMA pavement in INDOT.

TABLE 2.2
Lot based criteria of acceptance and failed materials for HMA pavement.

| AQC | Lower Specification Limit | Upper Specification Limit |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Material | Binder Content, $\%$ | $-0.40 \%$ from Job Mix Formula (JMF) | $+0.40 \%$ from JMF |
|  | Air Voids at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}, \%$ | $2.60 \%$ | $5.40 \%$ |
|  | Voids In Mineral |  |  |
| Aggregate at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}, \%$ |  |  |  |

testing results follow a normal statistical distribution and can calculate the percentage of the testing results that fall within any given range (Sholar, Page, Musselman, Upshaw, \& Moseley, 2003). Table 2.2 lists the acceptable ranges for the four AQCs: binder content, air voids at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}$, air voids in mineral aggregate at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}$, and roadway core density. Table 2.3 illustrates how the payment is adjusted according to the calculated PWL value. For any AQC, if the calculated PWL is less than $50(\%)$, then the lot is
considered to be failed. In addition to the PWL calculated at the lot level, INDOT defines that a lot is also considered failed materials if one of its sublots has an air void content that is less than $1.0 \%$ or greater than $7.0 \%$.
2.1.2.2 Failure Criteria for QC/QA Pavement $<1$ Lot. For QC/QA HMA pavement that is less than 1 lot, while the same set of AQCs is used, the pay adjustment

TABLE 2.3
Pay adjustment and failure criterion based on PWL for QC/QA HMA pavement $\geq 1$ lot.

| PWL (\%) | Pay Adjustment |
| :---: | :---: |
| $>90$ | Pay factor $=(105.00-0.50 \times(100.00-\mathrm{PWL})) / 100$ |
| $\geq 50$ and $\leq 90$ | Pay factor $=(100.00-0.000020072 \times(100.00-\mathrm{PWL}) 3.5877) / 100$ |
| $<50$ | Failed materials, subject to the Failed Materials Committee |

TABLE 2.4
Sublot based criteria of acceptance and failed materials for HMA pavement.

|  | AQC | Acceptable Range |  | Failure Criteria |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Full Pay | Discount Pay |  |
| Material | Binder Content, \% | $\leq 0.5 \%$ from JMF | [0.5, 1.0]\% from JMF | $>1.0 \%$ from JMF |
|  | Air Voids at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}$, \% | $\leq 0.5 \%$ from JMF | [0.5, 2.0]\% from JMF | $>2.0 \%$ from JMF |
|  | Voids In Mineral Aggregate at $\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{des}}$, \% | $\leq 0.5 \%$ from JMF | [0.5, 2.5]\% from JMF | $>2.5 \%$ from JMF |
| Construction | Roadway Core Density (\% Gmm), \% | [92.0, 97.0]\% from JMF | [88.9, 92.0]\% from JMF | $\leq 88.9 \%$ or $\geq 97.0 \%$ from JMF |



Figure 2.2 The typical PRS analysis procedure of PCCP.
and the failure criteria are both set at the sublot level. Table 2.4 summarizes the ranges for full pay, discount pay, and failure criteria at the sublot level for QC/QA HMA pavement (dense graded) that is less than 1 lot. All percentages refer to the deviation from JMF.

### 2.2 Long-Term Performance and LCC Estimation of PCCP

The long-term performance of PCCP pavement that involves failed materials is the key to making informed decision. PRS, a quality acceptance (QA) specification, describes the desired levels of key acceptance quality characteristics (AQCs) that are correlated with fundamental engineering properties that predict performance. It is capable of estimating the LCC of PCCP, as illus-
trated in Figure 2.2. In a PRS analysis. AQCs, traffic, and climate variables serve as inputs to the performanceprediction model to predict structural and functional performance of pavement. Resulting performance prediction, together with maintenance and repair/rehabilitation strategies, serves as input to the maintenance-cost model to predict the life-cycle cost. The predicted LCC excludes the initial construction cost.

To facilitate the computation, PRS tools have been developed based on the correlation between AQCs and the long-term performance to estimate the LCC of pavement through computer simulations (Office of Asset Management, 2001). ERES Consultants, through a federal highway administration (FHWA)-funded project, created PaveSpec-a PRS tool for PCCP-in 1993 (Graveen et al., 2009). The working procedure of PaveSpec follows


Figure 2.3 LCC comparison method between as-designed LCC and as-constructed LCC.
the general PRS analysis procedure and adopts the lifecycle cost simulation to quantitatively evaluate the performance of PCCP.

By relying on the capability of PRS in estimating the long-term performance and predicting the life-cycle cost of PCCP, the monetary impact from failed materials can be quantified as the life-cycle cost difference between the as-designed and as-constructed pavements. Figure 2.3 illustrates the process to determine the life-cycle cost difference. This information (i.e., the LCC difference) can assist SHAs in determining which option, i.e., "removal and replacement" or "acceptance with a heavy penalty," is more beneficial; and what is the appropriate/ fair monetary amount of the "penalty" to be assigned to the "acceptance with a heavy penalty" option.

A number of studies have been conducted to specify the acceptance of pavement through the use of PRS. Evans et al. (2005) developed and implemented a trial PRS for concrete pavement construction in Tennessee. They concluded that PRS is a viable approach to set up incentives for contractors to work harder and perform better. Rao et al. (2007) developed a PRS for concrete pavement construction in Wisconsin. The PRS defined the requirements for four AQCs, thickness, concrete strength, air content, and smoothness; and designed pay factors correspondingly. Evans et al. (2008) developed, implemented, and evaluated a PRS for a construction project in Florida based on three AQCs, thickness, strength, and smoothness. Graveen et al. (2009) developed a PRS for INDOT and validated it using a previously completed construction project. These studies have demonstrated in common that the use of PRS leads to a win-win situation: contractors received higher pay for delivering higher quality pavement and SHAs saved in the long-term by receiving higher quality pavement with lower maintenance costs, better pavement performance, and increased service life.

### 2.3 Estimating Long-Term Performance for HMA Pavement

PRS for HMA pavement has been developed to describe acceptable levels of AQCs that correlate with the longterm performance in aspects of permanent deformation (e.g., rutting), fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking (Scott et al., 2014). Similar to the PRS for PCCP, the PRS for HMA pavement is capable of estimating its long-term performance. Different from the PRS for PCCP, the PRS for HMA pavement does not quantify the long-term performance into LCC. Rather, by setting the threshold values for the three distresses (i.e., rutting, fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking), the long-term performance is quantified into service life. Figure 2.4 illustrates the PRS analysis process for HMA pavement. The associated computational tool/software is QRSS.

The comparison approach (see Figure 2.3) developed for PCCP can still be used to support the decisionmaking regarding failed materials of HMA pavement. The difference is that the base for the decision is no longer the LCC difference, but the service life difference instead.

A number of studies have been conducted to develop PRS for HMA pavement and to estimate the long-term performance of HMA pavement using PRS tools. Mensching, McCarthy, Mehta, \& Byrne (2013) developed a PRS-based framework to set post-construction targets for rutting performance in HMA pavement overlay projects in the state of Rhode Island. De Jarnette, McCarthy, Bennert, \& Guercio (2013) analyzed current PRS programs and recommended to assign pay factor adjustments for HMA pavement based on performance measures. McCarthy, Guercio, Bennert, \& De Jarnette (2014) compared performance prediction results of several PRS tools and found that the results are quite consistent.


Figure 2.4 The PRS analysis procedure of QRSS for HMA pavement.

TABLE 3.1
AQCs and related distress indicators.

| AQC | Related Distress Indicators | Type |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Concrete Strength | Transverse Joint Spalling, Transverse Slab Cracking | Required |
| Slab Thickness | Transverse Joint Faulting | Required |
| Air Content | Transverse Joint Spalling | Required |
| Initial Smoothness | Decreasing Smoothness | Required |
| Percent Consolidation Around Dowels | Transverse Joint Faulting | Optional |

## 3. AN LCC BASED DECISION FRAMEWORK FOR FAILED PCCP MATERIALS

In this study, PaveSpec was investigated as the PRS tool to predict the long-term performance of PCCP that involves failed materials, and a decision framework was developed based on the findings from a large number of simulations. The descriptions regarding PaveSpec in this Chapter are all for the current version of PaveSpec, version 3.0. At the time of this writing, a newer version, version 4.0, is under development (Scott et al., 2014).

### 3.1 Distresses and Required AQCS in PaveSpec

The current version of PaveSpec, version 3.0, relies on four types of distress indicators - transverse joint faulting, transverse joint spalling, transverse slab cracking, and decreasing smoothness - to estimate LCCs for PCCP. These distress are predicted based on five AQCs: concrete strength, slab thickness, air content, initial smoothness, and percent consolidation around dowels, as shown in Table 3.1. Among them, percent consolidation around dowels is optional while the other four AQCs are required.

TABLE 3.2
Input categories in PaveSpec.

| Category | Numbers of Inputs |
| :--- | :---: |
| Basic Specification and Dimensions and <br> Lane Data | 10 inputs |
| Traffic Data | 9 inputs |
| Pavement Design Data | 14 inputs |
| Climatic Data | 5 inputs |
| Maintenance and Rehabilitation Data | 28 inputs |
| Unit Cost Data | 17 inputs |
| Simulation Control | 35 inputs |
| Definition of Pavement Performance | 2 inputs |
| AQC Sampling and Testing | 27 inputs |
| AQC As-Designed Target Value Definition | 16 inputs |

### 3.2 Input Variables

PaveSpec requires 163 inputs that can be divided into ten categories, as shown in Table 3.2. Appendix A lists


Figure 3.1 PaveSpec workflow: (a) basic specification information; (b) dimensions and lane configuration; (c) design-related modules; (d) definition of pavement performance; (e) AQC sampling and testing; (f) AQC as-designed target value definition; (g) life-cycle cost-related modules; (h) simulation control; (i) results-pay factor matrices and LCCs (as-designed); (j) as-constructed AQCs; (k) overall pay factor and LCC (as-constructed).

TABLE 3.3
Related inputs for each step in Figure 3.1.

| Step | Related Inputs <br> in Appendix A |
| :--- | :---: |
| (a) Basic Specification Information | $\# 1-\# 2$ |
| (b) Dimensions and Lane Configuration | $\# 3-\# 10$ |
| (c) Design-Related Modules | $\# 11-\# 38$ |
| (d) Definition of Pavement Performance | $\# 39-\# 40$ |
| (e) AQC Sampling and Testing | $\# 41-\# 64$ |
| (f) AQC As-Designed Target Value | $\# 65-\# 80$ |
| Definition | $\# 81-\# 129$ |
| (g) Life-Cycle Cost-Related Modules | $\# 130-\# 134$ |
| (h) Simulation Control |  |

all 163 input variables, their ranges, and sample values (from INDOT project $\mathrm{R}-25715$, a section of I-65 in Clarksville, Indiana). Many of the sample values were used later in the simulations in this study.

### 3.3 Analytical Process of PaveSpec

Figure 3.1 illustrates how PaveSpec was executed to take inputs, conduct simulations, and report results. The whole process consists of eleven steps. Table 3.3
lists inputs (as listed in Appendix A) that are relevant in each step.

PaveSpec has two levels of specification, Level 1 and Level 2. The major difference is that a Level 2 Specification incorporates the interactions of/correlation between AQCs while a Level 1 Specification does not (Hoerner \& Darter, 1999). The user chooses either Level 1 or Level 2 Specification in step (a).

Figure 3.2 illustrates the selection of distress indicators in step (d) in this study. The distress indicator of transverse joint faulting is not checked because it requires the optional AQC-\% Consolidation, which is not considered in this study. Based on the selection of the distress indicators, four required AQCs (i.e., concrete strength, slab thickness, air content, initial smoothness, and percent consolidation around dowels) are included.

AQC sampling and testing information is input into PaveSpec at step (e). Table 3.4 illustrates the current sampling and testing methods used by INDOT in its QA/QC program for PCCP. Figure 3.3 graphically illustrates the sampling method, using a lot that contains three sublots as an example. Note that once the random sample is identified, the tests for air content and flexural strength are performed on the same sample. Air content tests have to be done from a sample obtained on the grade. Beam specimens can be cast from the on grade sample, but they can also be obtained from a truck sample obtained at the point prior to delivery to


Figure 3.2 Definition of pavement performance.

TABLE 3.4
Current INDOT sampling and testing method.

| AQC Value | Sampling Method | Sampling Frequency | Sampling <br> Locations | Testing Method |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Strength | Beams | Two beams per sublot ${ }^{*}$ | 1 | AASHTO T 97 |
| Air Content | Air Pressure Meter | One per sublot | 1 | AASHO T 152 or |
| Thickness | Cores | Two cores per sublot | 2 | $0.1 \%$ |
| Smoothness | Profile Index $(0.0-$ in blanking band $)$ | 1 pass per lane | N/A ${ }^{* *}$ | ITM 404 |

*Two beams in one location.
**Not applicable.
the grade, where the sample will be obtained for air content.

Figure 3.4 illustrates the inputs of target values for AQCs in step (f). PaveSpec allows ways to estimate the LCC for as-designed: "through simulation" and "using AQC means only." The default method, "through simulation," generates random numbers, which follow a normal distribution, to predict AQCs and run Monte Carlo simulations. The "using AQC means only" method estimates LCC in a deterministic manner. Considering that a pavement section is never homogeneous and AQCs are only obtained at sample locations, the "through simulation" method incorporates the randomness of AQCs and therefore, reflects the reality more accurately (Graveen et al., 2009). In this study, the default "through simulation" method was used to incorporate the inhomogeneity in AQCs.

The user sets simulation control in step (h). The simulation control inputs are divided into two major sections: generic settings and AQC-specific settings. In particular, AQC settings directly affect the range and level of detail in the generated pay factor matrices.

In step (i), PaveSpec reports summary simulation results. If Level 1 Specification is used, the results include (1) predicted distresses for every sublot, (2) pay factor matrices for individual AQCs based on their mean and standard deviation values, and (3) LCCs (present worth) for every sublot and lot. If Level 2 Specification is used, the results do not include pay factor matrices, but the other two items are included. Figure 3.5 illustrates four example outputs, the first three are from Level 1 Specification and the fourth is from Level 2 Specification.


## - Thickness core

co Beams for flexural strength
.... Smoothness profilograph

- Air content for concrete

Figure 3.3 Current INDOT sampling method.


Figure 3.4 AQC as-designed target value definition.

In step (j), field-testing results of AQCs are input into PaveSpec as as-constructed AQCs. If Level 1 Specification is chosen, interpolations are performed by referencing to those individual pay factor matrices, resulting in pay factors and as-constructed LCCs based on individual AQCs. The individual pay factors are then averaged (a weighted average) to estimate the overall pay factor. The as-constructed LCC can then be calculated by using the as-designed LCC, the overall pay factor, and the construction contract price. If Level 2 Specification is used,

PaveSpec incorporates all AQCs and their interactions to report the LCC for the as-constructed. Results are reported in step (k). Figure 3.6 illustrates two sample results from Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification.

### 3.3.1 Interpolation Method between 7-day and 28-day Concrete Strength

For the flexural strength AQC, PaveSpec requires 28-day strength, but accepts 7-day strength with a curing


Figure 3.5 Preconstruction outputs: (a) Level 1 distress chart; (b) Level 1 pay factor matrix; (c) Level 1 LCC results; (d) Level 2 distress chart; (e) Level 2 LCC results.

Project Pay Factor Summary.

| Lot | Strength Pay Factor | Thickness Pay Factor | Air Content Pay Factor | Smoothness Pay Factor | Composite Pay Factor |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Lot 1 | $78.71 \%$ | $80.70 \%$ | $103.24 \%$ | $102.01 \%$ | $91.17 \%$ |
| Average | $78.71 \%$ | $80.70 \%$ | $103.24 \%$ | $102.01 \%$ | $91.17 \%$ |

(a) Composite pay factor, Level 1 Specification

Level 2 Pay Factors by Lot.

| Lot | PW LCC | AD LCC | Specification Bid Price | Pay Factor |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | $\$ 5,106,684 / \mathrm{mi}$ | $\$ 5,224,750 / \mathrm{mi}$ | $\$ 422,400 / \mathrm{mi}$ | $127.95 \%$ |

(b) Composite pay factor, Level 2 Specification

Figure 3.6 PaveSpec use specification execution results: (a) Level 1 Specification; (b) Level 2 Specification.
curve to allow the estimation of the 28-day strength from the 7-day strength (Evans et al., 2005; Evans et al., 2008; Rao, Smith, \& Darter, 2007). In the current practice, INDOT tests 7-day strength and, based on this 7-day strength, determines the pay factor for pay adjustment.

To use PaveSpec for INDOT projects, a conversion mechanism is needed to convert the 7-day strength to the 28 -day strength. A previous JTRP study (Graveen et al., 2009) suggested the use of a conversion coefficient, C, to convert between the 7-day and 28-day strength.

Equation (3.1) illustrates how this coefficient $C$ can be determined and used.

$$
\begin{equation*}
C=\frac{f_{28-\text { Day }}}{f_{7-\text { Day }}} \tag{3.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

This coefficient method is straightforward and easy to use without sacrificing the accuracy; therefore, it was used in this study to convert 7-day strength into 28-day strength. INDOT considers 570 psi at 7 -day concrete strength as the threshold value for a full pay, expecting it to reach 700 psi at 28 -day. Thus, the strength
multiplication constant $C$ is calculated to be 1.23 , which was used in all simulations for PCCP.

Note that the coefficient might be determined in a much more accurate way by slightly modifying the current practice in sampling and testing. For instance, both the 7-day and 28-day flexural strength at the time of the trial batch can be measured to determine coefficient C for the specific mix design. Or, ores from broken beam halves or actual pavement areas in questions could be obtained very close to the 28 -day age and tested for split tensile strength (to be converted to a 28 -day flexural strength).

### 3.4 Estimating the LCC of As-Constructed PCCP: The Interpolation Approach versus the Re-Simulation Approach

The default approach in PaveSpec to estimate the LCC of the as-constructed is an interpolation approach. The execution of PaveSpec simulations yields an LCC pay factor matrix for each AQC based on its mean and standard deviation. The LCC of as-constructed PCCP can be estimated by using the field-testing values (the means and standard deviations of AQCs) to interpolate the matrix. Resulting LCC estimates based on individual AQCs are then averaged (could be weighted) to obtain an overall LCC estimate. This interpolation approach does not count for the composite effect of multiple AQCs deviating from their as-designed targets. It generates a single, deterministic estimate of the LCC for the as-constructed PCCP. Consequently, it cannot be used to estimate the LCC difference between the as-designed and as-constructed at user specified confidence levels.

In this study, we devised a re-simulation approach to enable the statistical analysis and the estimate of LCC difference at user specified confidence levels. The mean and standard deviation values of AQCs obtained from field samples are input into PaveSpec in the place of design targets to run Monte Carlo simulations again to estimate the LCC of the as-constructed pavement. The re-simulation approach incorporates the aggregate effect of multiple AQCs deviating from their design targets; therefore, it is expected to be more accurate than the interpolation approach. Instead of yielding one deterministic LCC estimate for the as-constructed, a set of estimates are available to calculate the LCC at user specified confidence levels and to estimate the LCC difference between the as-designed and the as-constructed with varying probabilities.

A large number of simulations were performed to assess the effect from these two different approaches. Figure 3.7, Table 3.5, and Table 3.6 compare the LCCs of the as-designed and as-constructed pavements under scenarios of either only one AQC deviating from its design targets or all four AQCs deviating from their design targets. All simulations were executed using both levels of specification, Level 1 and Level 2 Specification. The re-simulation approach leads to more consistent results than the interpolation approach. Furthermore,
for a PCCP whose slab thickness is thinner than the design target and whose initial smoothness is worse than the design target, the interpolation approach estimates the LCC of the as-constructed to be lower than the LCC of the as-designed. This is opposite to the reality: thinner slab and inferior smoothness lead to a higher LCC, not a lower one.

### 3.5 Level 1 Specification versus Level 2 Specification

The major difference between Level 1 and Level 2 Specifications is that the interactions of AQCs are only included in the Level 2 Specification (Hoerner \& Darter, 1999). For example, increasing concrete strength may offset a deficiency in slab thickness. However, only a Level 2 Specification can account for this effect.

A large number of simulations were conducted to assess the difference between the Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification in estimating the LCC of both as-designed and as-constructed. Figure 3.8 and Table 3.7 compare the simulation results of Level 1 and Level 2 Specifications when as-constructed AQC values are different from their as-designed target values, but still in acceptable ranges. Level 2 Specification results in slightly smaller as-designed LCCs than those of Level 1 Specification. In all scenarios, LCC differences between as-designed and as-constructed values are smaller when using Level 2 Specification. LCC differences in the first three scenarios, in which only one AQC deviates from its design target, are slightly different between Level 1 and Level 2 Specifications. The 4 AQCs scenario (i.e., all four AQCs deviate from their design targets) illustrates the largest discrepancy between Level 1 and Level 2 results, highlighting the significance of the impact considering the interactions among the AQCs.

### 3.6 Selecting the Approach and the Level of Specification

In Section 3.4 and 3.5, it was illustrated that the re-simulation approach leads to more consistent results than the interpolation approach and Level 2 Specification results more closely reflect the reality. To select the approach (i.e., the interpolation approach versus the re-simulation approach) and the level of specification (i.e., the Level 1 Specification and the Level 2 Specification) to be used by INDOT, a number of simulation scenarios were crafted to evaluate the composite effect on the LCC estimates from the two approaches and two levels of specification. Table 3.8 lists all 20 scenarios used in this analysis. Only one AQC deviates from its design target in the first sixteen scenarios. In the last four scenarios, all four AQCs deviate from their design targets.

Table 3.9 shows the cross-comparison results to assess the effect of level of specification. The magnitude of the LCC difference between the interpolation approach and the re-simulation approach is always significantly larger in Level 2 than in Level 1. In particular, LCC difference of four AQC deviations in Level 2 Specification constitutes around fourteen percent of construction price.

(a) Level 1 Specification


## (b) Level 2 Specification

Figure 3.7 LCC results comparisons of the interpolation and the re-simulation methods: (a) Level 1 Specification; (b) Level 2 Specification.

TABLE 3.5
Comparison of LCC results of the interpolation and the re-simulation approaches (Level 1 Specification).

|  | As-Designed <br> (LCC, \$) | As-Constructed <br> (Interpolation Approach) <br> (LCC, \$) | Interpolation <br> Difference (\$) | As-Constructed <br> (Re-simulation Approach) <br> (LCC, \$) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cimulation Type | $\$ 5,230,669$ | $\$ 5,248,283$ | $\$ 17,614$ | Re-simulation <br> Difference (\$) |
| Concrete Strength | $\$ 5,230,669$ | $\$ 5,242,243$ | $\$ 11,574$ | $\$ 5,253,622$ |

Table 3.10 shows the cross-comparison results to assess the effect of the approach. The magnitude of the LCC difference between the Level 1 and Level 2 Specifications is always significantly larger under the interpolation approach than under the re-simulation approach. Moreover, LCC difference of four AQC deviations in the interpolation approach constitutes around eleven percent of the construction price.

The comparison results highlight the significant difference between the use of different approaches and different levels of specifications. Following the discussions with the SAC, it was concluded that the Level 2 Specification and the re-simulation approach reflect the reality more closely and fits the application needs better. Therefore, the re-simulation approach and the Level 2 Specification were selected to develop the

TABLE 3.6
Comparison of LCC results of the interpolation and the re-simulation approaches (Level 2 Specification).

|  | As-Designed <br> (LCC, \$) | As-Constructed <br> (Interpolation Approach) <br> (LCC, \$) | Interpolation <br> Difference (\$) | As-Constructed <br> (Re-simulation Approach) <br> (LCC, \$) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Concrete Strength | $\$ 5,224,750$ | $\$ 5,269,319$ | $\$ 44,569$ | Re-simulation <br> Difference (\$) |
| Slab Thickness | $\$ 5,224,750$ | $\$ 5,213,477$ | $-\$ 11,273$ | $\$ 5,247,058$ |



Figure 3.8 LCC results comparisons of Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification.

TABLE 3.7
LCC results comparisons of Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification.

|  | Level 1 <br> As-Designed <br> (LCC, \$) | Level 1 <br> As-Constructed <br> (LCC, \$) | Level 1 <br> Difference (\$) | Level 2 <br> As-Designed <br> (LCC, \$) | Level 2 <br> As-Constructed <br> (LCC, \$) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Concrete Strength | $\$ 5,230,669$ | $\$ 5,253,622$ | $\$ 22,953$ | $\$ 5,224,750$ | Level 2 <br> Difference (\$) |
| Slab Thickness | $\$ 5,230,669$ | $\$ 5,246,083$ | $\$ 15,414$ | $\$ 5,224,750$ | $\$ 5,247,058$ |

decision framework for failed PCCP materials for INDOT.

### 3.7 LCC Trend and Sensitivity Analysis Via Simulations

Upon the selection of the re-simulation approach and the Level 2 Specification for estimating the LCCs of failed PCCP materials, a series of simulation scenarios were designed to examine the sensitivity and trend of LCCs in correspondence to changes in the means and standard deviations of the AQCs, covering both acceptable and failed ranges. All simulations were conducted for a three-sublot lot of PCCP with the sampling methods specified in INDOT specifications (INDOT, 2011). Figure 3.9 illustrates the trends of the LCCs of the
as-constructed PCCP to the variations in the standard deviation and mean of individual AQCs. The simulation results of flexural strength and thickness show an obvious trend: lower means (lower quality) and higher standard deviations (lower consistency) correspond to higher LCC estimates. The simulation results of smoothness show that higher means (lower quality) and larger standard deviations (lower consistency) associate with higher LCC estimates. This is because a higher smoothness value indicates a lower quality pavement. The simulation results of the air content present a dilemma. The trend is such that higher mean and lower standard deviation associate with lower LCC estimates. However, INDOT specifies the failure criteria for air content as a range rather than a threshold value. Figure 3.10 illustrates
the dilemma. For the failures because of high air content, the LCC of the as-constructed is even lower than the LCC of the as-designed. One possible explanation

TABLE 3.8
Scenarios for selecting approach and level of specification.

| No. | As-Constructed Deviations | Approach | Specification |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Concrete Strength | Interpolation | Level 1 |
| 2 | Concrete Strength | Re-Simulation | Level 1 |
| 3 | Concrete Strength | Interpolation | Level 2 |
| 4 | Concrete Strength | Re-Simulation | Level 2 |
| 5 | Slab Thickness | Interpolation | Level 1 |
| 6 | Slab Thickness | Re-Simulation | Level 1 |
| 7 | Slab Thickness | Interpolation | Level 2 |
| 8 | Slab Thickness | Re-Simulation | Level 2 |
| 9 | Air Content | Interpolation | Level 1 |
| 10 | Air Content | Re-Simulation | Level 1 |
| 11 | Air Content | Interpolation | Level 2 |
| 12 | Air Content | Re-Simulation | Level 2 |
| 13 | Initial Smoothness | Interpolation | Level 1 |
| 14 | Initial Smoothness | Re-Simulation | Level 1 |
| 15 | Initial Smoothness | Interpolation | Level 2 |
| 16 | Initial Smoothness | Re-Simulation | Level 2 |
| 17 | 4 AQCs | Interpolation | Level 1 |
| 18 | 4 AQCs | Re-Simulation | Level 1 |
| 19 | 4 AQCs | Interpolation | Level 2 |
| 20 | 4 AQCs | Re-Simulation | Level 2 |

for the odds is that a pavement of high air content, but with an acceptable flexural strength is actually a high quality product and thus, the LCC is lower. A comprehensive list of scenarios were crafted to further investigate the trend of LCC to various AQCs in Section 3.8.

### 3.8 Simulation Results of Various AQC Failure Scenarios

The preceding simulation results of air content AQC show that higher means and lower standard deviations associate with lower LCC estimates. On the other hand, constructed concrete materials that have more than $9.8 \%$ air content are considered failed materials according to INDOT specifications. Thus, it is possible to infer that PaveSpec might have some limitations in accurately estimating LCC when the air content mean is outside the acceptable range. A large number of simulation scenarios were designed to investigate the composite effects of multiple AQCs. Appendix B contains all the simulation scenarios (a total of 2,520 ) and the estimated LCCs. Data in Appendix B allow much more analyses than the ones used in this section.

Figure 3.11 illustrates a few LCC trends against the mean and standard deviation of air content with other AQCs in different ranges. It is quite obvious that that no matter what value ranges the other AQCs are in, higher air content mean values are always associated with lower LCCs. Furthermore, the estimated LCCs of the as-constructed pavement were compared to the corresponding LCCs of the as-designed pavement (i.e., LCC with 15 inch thickness AQC, and LCC with 12 inch thickness AQC) for all the simulation scenarios. Considering that a failed PCCP with lower as-constructed LCC as abnormal, a total of 1,355 ( 643 cases with 15 inch design target of thickness, and 712 cases with 12 inch design target of thickness) abnormal cases were

TABLE 3.9
Comparisons between the interpolation and re-simulation approaches.

| No. | As-Constructed Deviations | Level | LCC <br> (Interpolation Approach) | LCC <br> (Re-simulation <br> Approach) | LCC <br> Difference | Difference \% with As-Designed LCC (\%) | Difference \% with Construction Price ( $\mathbf{\$ 4 2 2 , 4 0 0 , \% )}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Concrete Strength | 1 | \$5,248,283 | \$5,253,622 | -\$5,339 | 0.10\% | 1.26\% |
|  |  | 2 | \$5,269,319 | \$5,247,058 | \$22,261 | 0.43\% | 5.27\% |
| 2 | Slab Thickness | 1 | \$5,242,243 | \$5,246,083 | -\$3,840 | 0.07\% | 0.91\% |
|  |  | 2 | \$5,213,477 | \$5,238,555 | -\$25,078 | 0.48\% | 5.94\% |
| 3 | Air Content | 1 | \$5,294,113 | \$5,291,841 | \$2,272 | 0.04\% | 0.54\% |
|  |  | 2 | \$5,294,539 | \$5,279,506 | \$15,033 | 0.29\% | 3.56\% |
| 4 | Initial Smoothness | 1 | \$5,233,457 | \$5,237,300 | -\$3,843 | 0.07\% | 0.91\% |
|  |  | 2 | \$5,165,945 | \$5,231,247 | -\$65,302 | 1.25\% | 15.46\% |
| 5 | 4 AQC | 1 | \$5,326,089 | \$5,331,140 | -\$5,051 | 0.10\% | 1.20\% |
|  |  | 2 | \$5,372,469 | \$5,316,124 | \$56,345 | 1.08\% | 13.34\% |

TABLE 3.10
Comparisons between the Level 1 Specification and Level 2 Specification.

| No. | As-Constructed Deviations | Approach | LCC (Level 1) | LCC (Level 2) | LCC <br> Difference | Difference \% with As-Designed LCC (\%) | Difference \% with Construction Price (\$422,400, \%) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Concrete Strength | Interpolation | \$5,248,283 | \$5,269,319 | -\$21,036 | 0.40\% | 4.98\% |
|  |  | Re-Simulation | \$5,253,622 | \$5,247,058 | \$6,564 | 0.13\% | 1.55\% |
| 2 | Slab Thickness | Interpolation | \$5,242,243 | \$5,213,477 | \$28,766 | 0.55\% | 6.81\% |
|  |  | Re-Simulation | \$5,246,083 | \$5,238,555 | \$7,528 | 0.14\% | 1.78\% |
| 3 | Air Content | Interpolation | \$5,294,113 | \$5,294,539 | -\$426 | 0.00\% | 0.10\% |
|  |  | Re-Simulation | \$5,291,841 | \$5,279,506 | \$12,335 | 0.24\% | 2.92\% |
| 4 | Initial Smoothness | Interpolation | \$5,233,457 | \$5,165,945 | \$67,512 | 1.29\% | 15.98\% |
|  |  | Re-Simulation | \$5,237,300 | \$5,231,247 | \$6,053 | 0.12\% | 1.43\% |
| 5 | 4 AQC | Interpolation | \$5,326,089 | \$5,372,469 | -\$46,380 | 0.89\% | 10.98\% |
|  |  | Re-Simulation | \$5,331,140 | \$5,316,124 | \$15,016 | 0.29\% | 3.55\% |

identified. $84 \%$, or 1,135 cases ( 470 cases with 15 inch thickness, and 665 cases with 12 inch thickness) have an air content that is higher than $9.8 \%$. These abnormal results were discussed with SAC and the conclusion is that if PCCP fails because of air content, PaveSpec is not suitable to accurately estimate the LCC of the as-constructed pavement.

### 3.9 LCC Estimation for Lots with Both Failed and Acceptable Sublots

INDOT defined the failure criteria for flexural strength and air content at both sublot and lot levels. This leads to a diversity of failure scenarios (e.g., a three-sublot lot could fail because of the lot average, but one or two sublots might be acceptable; or, the lot average of a three-sublot lot is acceptable, but one or two sublots fail). The challenge is how to estimate the as-constructed LCC of a lot that contains both acceptable and failed sublots. Two methods were investigated in this study. In the divide-estimate-sum method, such a lot is divided into two new lots: one contains only acceptable sublot(s), and the other contains only failed sublot(s). The LCC of the original lot is the total of the LCCs of the two newly created lots. In the single lot method, the lot is treated as a single lot with a mix of failed and acceptable sublots to estimate the LCC.

A large number of simulation scenarios were devised to evaluate the difference in the resulting lot LCC between the two methods. Figure 3.12 illustrates the difference between the results from the divide-estimate-sum method and the results from the single lot method, under various combinations of lot failure/acceptance and sublot failure/ acceptance, focusing on flexural strength only.

Figure 3.12 illustrates that (1) under most scenarios, the differences are quite significant, and (2) under all scenarios, the LCC estimated in the single lot method is always higher than the LCC estimated in the divide-
estimate-sum method. This can be explained by examining the standard deviation. A lower standard deviation indicates a higher consistency in pavement quality and a lower LCC. Separating acceptable sublot(s) and failed sublot(s) leads to smaller standard deviations and lower LCCs in the two new lots than the original lot.

It is recommended that for the failure scenarios of "acceptable lot average, mix of acceptable and failed sublots," all failed sublots compose a new lot and the as-designed LCC and the as-constructed LCC for this new lot are estimated and compared to make the decision for these failed sublots. For the failure scenarios of "lot average failure," the single lot method should be used; that is, the asdesigned LCC and the as-constructed LCC form the base for the decision regarding failed materials for the lot.

### 3.10 The Calculation of LCC Difference at UserSpecified Confidence Levels

The AQC values are for sample locations only. When PaveSpec estimates the LCC of the as-designed and as-constructed PCCP sections, the inherent uncertainty in the AQCs is incorporated by assuming that the AQCs follow normal distributions. Random numbers are generated in each round of simulation to pick probable AQC values, based on which the pavement performance is predicted and the LCC is estimated. PaveSpec, by default, reports the mean LCC of all these 500 LCCs. From a statistical perspective, the mean value indicates that there is a $50 \%$ probability of a higher LCC and a $50 \%$ probability of a lower LCC. This interpretation presents a dilemma for SHAs in making their decisions directly based on the mean LCC. Noting that these 500 LCCs follow a normal distribution and each distribution is independent, 90th-percentile and 95th-percentile LCC differences between as-designed and as-constructed LCC distributions can be calculated using Equations (3.2), (3.3), (3.4), and (3.5). From a


Figure 3.9 Trend analysis results: (a) flexural strength; (b) air content; (c) thickness; (d) smoothness.
statistical perspective, the 90th-percentile LCC difference indicates a $90 \%$ probability/confidence of the actual LCC difference being lower. This means that SHAs can specify an appropriate confidence level and compare these two LCCs to determine the financial impact of the failed materials at a confidence level that reflects the agency's risk-taking strategy.

$$
\begin{align*}
L C C_{\text {Difference_Mean }}= & L C C_{\text {Mean_As_-Constructed }} \\
& -L C C_{\text {Mean_As-Designed }} \tag{3.2}
\end{align*}
$$

$L C C_{\text {Difference_St.Dev. }}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
=\sqrt{L C C^{2} \text { St.Dev._As-Constructed }+L C C^{2} \text { St.Dev.-As-Designed }} \tag{3.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

$$
\begin{align*}
& L C C_{\text {Differencee } 90 \%}=L C C_{\text {DifferenceMean }} \\
& +1.28 \times L C C_{\text {Difference_St.Dev. }}  \tag{3.4}\\
& \\
& \text { LCC } \begin{array}{l}
\text { Differencee } 95 \% \\
\quad+1.65 \times L C C_{\text {DifferenceMean }} \\
\\
\text { DifferenceSt.Dev. }
\end{array} \tag{3.5}
\end{align*}
$$

where, $L C C_{\text {Difference_ } 90 \%}$ is a 90 th-percentile LCC difference, $L C C_{\text {Difference_95\% }}$ is a 95th-percentile LCC difference, $L C C_{\text {Difference_ Mean }}$ is the mean of LCC difference between as-designed and as-constructed LCC distributions, and $L C C_{\text {Difference_ }}$ St.Dev. is a standard deviation of LCC difference between as-designed and as-constructed LCC distributions.


Figure 3.10 The dilemma caused by air content.

### 3.11 The Decision Frameweork for Failed PCCP Materials

Based on the aforementioned simulation results and observations, a decision framework was created to assist the decision-making for INDOT for failed materials of PCCP, illustrated in Figure 3.13.

The decision framework consists of five steps. In Step 1, Level 2 Specification is used to simulate the as-designed PCCP performance and estimate LCC. In Step 2, following the re-simulation approach, the field AQC values of as-constructed PCCP are input into PaveSpec to simulate the as-constructed PCCP performance and estimate the as-constructed LCC. In this step, if the air content AQC fails, Decision 1: Removal and Replacement is reached and the process stops. If the air content is
acceptable, the process continues to Step 3, in which the PaveSpec executes simulations for the as-constructed pavement to predict its long-term performance and estimate its LCC. In Step 4, the 90th-percentile and 95th-percentile LCC differences between the as-designed and as-constructed PCCP are calculated. Other percentile LCCs could be calculated depending on a SHA's risk perception and management strategy. In Step 5, the 90th-percentile, 95th-percentile, or any other percentile LCC difference between the as-designed and as-constructed PCCP is compared to the initial construction cost to determine the financial impact of failed materials. If the LCC difference is larger, Decision 1: Removal and Replacement is reached. Otherwise, the pavement will be accepted with a heavy penalty that equals the LCC difference.

(a) High flexural strength \& high thickness

(d) Mid flexural strength \& high thickness

(g) Low flexural strength \& high thickness

(b) High flexural strength \& mid thickness

(e) Mid flexural strength \& mid thickness

(h) Low flexural strength \& mid thickness

(c) High flexural strength \& low thickness

(f) Mid flexural strength \& low thickness

(i) Low flexural strength \& low thickness

Figure 3.11 Composite effects of multiple AQCs analysis results.

(a) Lot average acceptable, 1 sublot failed: failed sublot average remains constant

(c) Lot average failed, 1 sublot failed: failed sublot average remains constant

(e) Lot average failed, 2 sublot failed: acceptable sublot average remains constant

(b) Lot average acceptable, 1 sublot failed: failed sublot average decreased

(d) Lot average failed, 1 sublot failed: failed sublot average decreased


## (f) Lot average failed, 2 sublot failed: acceptable sublot average increased

Figure 3.12 Comparison of two different methods in estimating the LCC of a lot that contains both acceptable and failed sublots (flexural strength).

Decision Framework for Failed Portland Cement Concrete Pavement in Indiana


Figure 3.13 Illustration of the decision framework for PCCP of failed materials.

## 4. USE OF QRSS FOR QC/QA HMA PAVEMENT OF FAILED MATERAILS

In this study, QRSS was investigated as the PRS tool to predict the long-term performance of HMA pavement that involves failed materials. The descriptions regarding QRSS in this Chapter are all for the standalone program of QRSS implemented under Microsoft Windows (version XP and 7 only).

### 4.1 Distresses and Service Life Prediction

QRSS uses three types of distresses-rutting, fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking-for predicting the longterm pavement performance. QRSS estimates the service life based on the predicted long-term performance, for each type of distress; there is an estimated service life based on each type of distress. Equation 4.1 illustrates the determination of service life based on rutting (Moulthrop \& Witczak, 2011). Factors that are used in QRSS to determine the service life include the deterministic distress predictions $\left(R U T_{c}\right)$, design life ( $Y_{c}$ ) and dynamic modulus ( $E^{*}$ and $E_{c}^{*}$ ). Moreover, the same method (i.e., Equation 4.1) is used in the calculation of the service lives for both the as-designed and as-constructed pavements.
$Y=\frac{\log \left(\left(\frac{R U T}{R U T_{c}} \times \frac{E^{*}}{E^{*}}\right)^{1 / 0.479244}\left((1+r)^{Y_{c}}-1\right)+1\right)}{\log (1+r)}$
where $Y$ is the predicted service life, $Y_{c}$ is the design life, $R U T$ is the rut depth, $R U T_{c}$ is the deterministically predicted rut depth criterion value, $E^{*}$ is the dynamic modulus, $E_{c}^{*}$ is the dynamic modulus criterion value, and $r$ is the growth rate (rate of traffic increase per year).

### 4.2 Input Variables

Input variables to QRSS include mixture volumetrics, design features, traffic characteristics, and sampling data for predicting performances. The QRSS inputs are broadly divided into two groups: inputs for the as-designed pavement and inputs for the as-constructed pavement. Table 4.1 presents the inputs required to run the QRSS program.

Appendix C lists a total of 135 input variables with values obtained from an INDOT highway construction project-a toll road project for the Indiana State Road 13 located in Goshen, Indiana. These data were used in this study to investigate QRSS in details.

### 4.3 Analytical Process of QRSS

As-designed data and as-constructed data are both input into QRSS to run the simulations to predict the long-term performance and estimate the service life. Figure 4.1 illustrates the steps involved in the use of

QRSS. Table 4.2 lists inputs (as listed in Appendix C) that are relevant in each step.

Taking the data inputs, in step (h), QRSS runs Monte Carlo simulations to evaluate the target JMF to determine whether the as-designed mix satisfies the pre-set distress limits and projected effective dynamic modulus $\left(\left|E^{*}\right|\right)$ criteria for the design life of the pavement. It is important that predicting dynamic modulus $\left(\left|E^{*}\right|\right)$ for the QRSS procedure. Figure 4.2 illustrates a sample result after completing step (h).

TABLE 4.1
QRSS inputs required for analysis.

| As-Designed Pavement Input | As-Constructed Pavement Input |
| :--- | :--- |
| - Design Speed | • Lot Definition |
| - Design Life | - Tonnage by Lot |
| - Design Year 1 Daily | - Gradation |
| Equivalent Single-Axle | - Volumetrics |
| Loads (ESALs) | - Layer Thickness |
| - Design Volumetrics | - Binder Characteristics |
| - Binder Characteristics |  |
| - Target Gradation |  |
| - Target In-Situ Volumetrics |  |
| - Layer Thickness |  |
| - Location |  |
| - Distress Limits |  |

QRSS requires lot information (e.g., amount of lot and lot tonnage), in-situ gradation and volumetric data of each HMA pavement layer for estimating as-constructed service life. QRSS runs Monte Carlo simulations again for each lot to evaluate the in-situ JMF after taking the data inputs in step (i). In step (j), QRSS reports the estimated service life difference between the as-designed and as-constructed pavements. Figure 4.3 illustrates a sample output summary and Table 4.3 lists analysis results in a tabular form.

### 4.4 Service Life Difference with Probabilities

The current version of QRSS reports the mean of the service life differences between the as-designed and asconstructed pavements through Monte Carlo simulations. However, it does not provide standard deviations of the service life differences directly. From a statistical perspective, the mean value indicates that there is a $50 \%$ probability of a higher service life difference and a $50 \%$ probability of a lower service life difference. To enable the calculation the service life difference at any user-specified confidence/probability (e.g., 90th-percentile or 95th-percentile service life difference), Equations (4.2), (4.3), (4.4), and (4.5) must be followed.
$S L D_{\text {Mean }}=S L_{\text {Mean_As-Constructed }}-S L_{\text {Mean_As }- \text { Designed }}$


Figure 4.1 QRSS workflow: (a) mode selection and general information; (b) traffic; (c) structure and distress selection and material and volumetric property; (d) climate; (e) distress limits; (f) mix design; (g) pay factors; (h) As-designed (JMF) solutions; (i) QC/QA AQCs; (j) simulation outputs.

TABLE 4.2
Related inputs for each step.

| Step |  |  | Related Inputs in Appendix C |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (a) Mode Selection and General Information |  |  | \#1-\#6 |
| (b) Traffic |  |  | \#7-\#11 |
| As-Designed Mix | (c) Structure and Distress Selection and Material and Volumetric Property |  | \#12-\#83 |
|  | (d) Climate |  | \#84-\#91 |
|  | (e) Distress Limits |  | \#92-\#94 |
|  | (f) Mix Design |  | \#95 |
|  | (g) Pay Factors |  | \#96-\#109 |
|  | (h) As-Designed (JMF) Solutions |  | \#110-\#131 |
| (i) As-Constructed Mix (QC/QA AQCs) | Surface Layer | General Information | \#132-\#133 |
|  |  | Gradation | \#134-\#147 |
|  |  | Volumetrics | \#148-\#153 |
|  | Binder Layer | General Information | \#154-\#155 |
|  |  | Gradation | \#156-\#169 |
|  |  | Volumetrics | \#170-\#175 |



Figure 4.2 Monte Carlo simulation of the as-designed mix.

$$
\begin{align*}
& S L D_{\text {St.Dev. }} \\
& \quad=\sqrt{S L^{2} \text { St.Dev._As-Constructed }+S L^{2} \text { St.Dev.-As-Designed }} \tag{4.3}
\end{align*}
$$

$S L D_{90 \%}=S L D_{\text {Mean }}+1.28 \times S L D_{S t . D e v}$.
$S L D_{95 \%}=S L D_{\text {Mean }}+1.65 \times S L D_{S t . D e v}$.
where, $S L D_{90 \%}$ is a 90 th-percentile service life difference, $S L D_{95 \%}$ is a 95 th-percentile service life difference, $S L D_{\text {Mean }}$ is the mean of service life difference between as-designed and as-constructed pavements, and $S L D_{S t . D e v}$.

|  | Predicted Life Difference [years) | PenaltyWBonus (z) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Surface Rutting (rk) | -0.01 | 100,00 |
| Binder Rutting (rl) | 0.00 | 100.00 |
| Base Rutting (rm) |  |  |
| Fatigue Cracking (f) | $-1.86$ | 100.00 |
| Thermal Cracking (t) | 0.00 | 100.00 |
| Rut weighting factor ratios by layer |  |  |
| Surface Rutting ( $\mathrm{Pr}_{-s}$ ) | $0.14 *$ |  |
| Binder Rutting (Pr_m) | 0.86 2 |  |
| Base Rutting (Pr_b) | $0,00 \leqslant$ |  |
| Distress Pay Adjustment |  |  |



$$
\begin{aligned}
& +\beta_{\mathrm{f}}\left(\frac{\sum \mathrm{n}_{\mathrm{m}}\left(\mathbf{P} / \mathrm{B}_{\mathrm{fm}}\right.}{\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{t}\left(A C_{-} \mathrm{b}\right)}}-1\right) \mathrm{C}_{A C_{-} \mathrm{b}}+\beta_{\mathrm{rr}}\left(\frac{\sum \mathrm{n}_{\mathrm{k}}(\mathbf{P} / \mathrm{B})_{\mathrm{uk}}}{\mathrm{~N}_{\mathrm{t}\left(A C_{-}\right)}}-1\right) \mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{AC}}^{-\mathrm{C}} \\
& \text { Cpb1 }=0.00 *\{0.14 *(1.00-1.00) * 0.00+0.86 *(1.00-1.00) * 0.00\}+0.00 *(1.00-1.00)=0.00 * 0.00 *(1.00-1.00) * 0.00 \\
& =0.00 \\
& \text { IRI Pay Adjustment } \\
& C_{P B 2}=\sum_{i=1}^{L} \sum_{j=1}^{L p / 0.1}(\mathbf{P} / \mathbf{B})_{I R I_{i},} \\
& \mathrm{Cpb} 2=0.00 \\
& \text { Total Pay Adjustment } \\
& \mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{PB}}=\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{PB} 1}+\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{PB} 2} \\
& \mathrm{Cpb}=\quad 0.00+0.00
\end{aligned}
$$

Figure 4.3 QRSS analysis outputs.
is the standard deviation of service life difference between as-designed and as-constructed pavements.

### 4.5 Challenge 1: Aligning INDOT AQCs to QRSS AQCs

As aforementioned in Chapter 2.1.2, INDOT evaluates as-constructed HMA pavements based on the PWL concept and four AQCs-binder content, lab compacted air voids and VMA, and density. In particular, lab compacted air voids and VMA are measured through a gyratory test and then the measured results are compared with the design values to evaluate qualities. INDOT practice is not based on MEPDG at this stage. QRSS are based on MEPDG and it requires many more variables to define as-designed/targeted JMF and compute predicted service life differences between the targeted JMF and actual as-constructed volumetric properties. QC/QA in QRSS focuses on JMF and JMF related variables. Table 4.4 lists the AQCs used by INDOT and QRSS QC/QA. For the ten AQCs required in QRSS, only two are being collected by INDOT.

The misalignment between INDOT AQCs and QRSS AQCs is a big challenge to applying QRSS at INDOT. Table 4.5 illustrates the efforts to pair/align
them-only one direct pair (i.e., asphalt content and binder content) and one indirect pair (roadway core density is converted into in-situ air voids by using Equation 4.6).

$$
\begin{align*}
& \text { In }- \text { Situ Air Voids }{ }_{\mathrm{QRSS}} \\
& \quad=100-\text { Road Way Core Density }{ }_{\text {INDOT AQC }} \tag{4.6}
\end{align*}
$$

### 4.6 Challenge 2: Abnormal Results for Failed Materials

QRSS predicts service life differences between the as-designed and as-constructed pavements based on the estimation of long-term performance in three aspects: rutting, fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking. According to a related research report (Moulthrop \& Witczak, 2011), service life differences caused by fatigue cracking distress are predicted by comparing as-designed and as-constructed variables that are relevant to the HMA mix. It is expected that if an as-constructed mix is the same as the as-designed mix based on those relevant variables, the as-constructed mix would achieve the same service life as the as-designed mix. However, the simulation results show aberrant trends when using

TABLE 4.3
Simulation outputs.

| No. | Output | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Lot | 1 |
| 2 | Date | 7/5/2015 |
| 3 | Tonnage | 600 |
| 4 | Air Voids (\%) | 8.000 |
| 5 | Binder Content (Vbeff \%) | 11.608 |
| 6 | Effective Temperature ( ${ }^{\circ} \mathrm{F}$ ) | 95.198 |
| 7 | Effective Frequency (Hz) | 40.668 |
| 8 | Target E* (ksi) | 478.713 |
| 9 | Predicted E* ${ }^{\text {(ksi) }}$ | 477.960 |
| 10 | E* Variance | 94.377 |
| 11 | E* Coefficient of Variation (\%) | 19.746 |
| 12 | Target Distress (in) | 0.031 |
| 13 | Predicted Distresse (in) | 0.031 |
| 14 | Distress Standard Deviation | 0.007 |
| 15 | Distress Coefficient of Variation (\%) | 21.775 |
| 16 | Target Service Life (yrs) | 8.709 |
| 17 | Predicted Service Life (yrs) | 8.705 |
| 18 | Service Life Standard Deviation | 0.405 |
| 19 | Service Life Coefficient of Varation (\%) | 4.647 |
| 20 | Predicted Life Difference (yrs) | -0.004 |
| 21 | Reliability | 0.497 |
| 22 | Penalty / Bonus | 100.00 |
| 23 | Weighted Pay Adjustment | 20.000 |

the fatigue cracking distress to determine the service life. For the same mix, QRSS estimates the service life of the as-constructed is always smaller than the service life of the as-designed. This abnormality leads to the observation that QRSS is not reliable in estimating service life difference between as-designed and as-constructed caused by fatigue cracking.

Furthermore, the prediction results of service life differences caused by thermal cracking are also abnormal. The maximum and minimum probable service life differences caused by thermal cracking are set to $\pm 50$ years in the current version of QRSS (Moulthrop \& Witczak, 2011). When the quality of an as-constructed mix is very high or very low, QRSS always reports the service life to be $\pm 50$. Therefore, QRSS is very limited in estimating the service life difference for failed materials based on thermal cracking because failed materials indicate a very low quality of the as-constructed mix.

Because of the abnormal results encountered in using the fatigue cracking and thermal cracking, rutting is the
only distress considered in this study when applying QRSS to HMA pavement of failed materials.

### 4.7 Challenge 3: Uncertainties Introduced by PWL

In this section, the service life differences were predicted based on the rutting distress. A large number of simulation scenarios were designed and after being executed, results were examined to determine how service life differences change in correspondence to the mean and standard deviation values of the only two AQCs common in INDOT practice and QRSS, binder content and roadway core density. The simulation scenarios covered both acceptable and failed materials.

Figure 4.4 illustrates the procedure followed in generating simulation scenarios. Starting with a target mean and standard deviation of a normal distribution, Monte Carlo simulation was used to generate a sample. For binder content, the sample size was 5; and for roadway core density, the sample size was 10 , considering a standard 5-sublot lot and INDOT requires one sample per sublot for binder content and two samples per sublot for roadway core density. This sample was then input into QRSS to estimate the service life difference. The PWL value was calculated using the mean and standard deviation values of the generated sample. Table 4.6 provides a few examples of the samples generated per binder content and estimated service life differences at both sublot and lot levels. Table 4.7 provides examples per roadway core density. Appendices D and E provide complete lists of all the simulation scenarios used in this section.

Figure 4.5 illustrates the trend of service life differences for various combinations of the means and standard deviations of individual AQCs-binder content and roadway core density. The service life difference was calculated as the estimated service life of the as-constructed - the service life of the as-designed. A positive service life difference means that QRSS estimates the as-constructed service life is longer than the as-designed service life and vice versa. It was observed that simulation results of binder content have an obvious trend: higher means are always associated with longer service lives. Simulation results of roadway core density show that lower means are associated with longer service lives. In both cases, the impact from the standard deviation is minimal.

For each simulation scenario, its PWL value was calculated according to Indiana Test Methods (ITM) 588, assuming the samples from the five sublots follow normal distributions (INDOT, 2008). INDOT specification defines both lower and upper limits for the binder content, but only the lower limit for the roadway core density. This indicates that for the binder content, the same PWL value could result from two very different samples, one leaning towards the higher end while the other leaning towards the lower end, as illustrated in Figure 4.6. Both sample 1 and sample 2 have the same PWL of 70 , but their mean values and standard deviation values are very different.

TABLE 4.4
AQCs for INDOT QC/QA HMA and QRSS.

| AQCs |  | QRSS | INDOT QC/QA HMA |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gradation | 3/4" | X |  |
|  | $3 / 8^{\prime \prime}$ | X |  |
|  | \#4 | X |  |
|  | \#200 | X |  |
| Volumetric | Asphalt Content | X | X |
|  | Maximum Theoretical Specific Gravity (Gmm) | X |  |
|  | In-Situ Bulk Density | X |  |
|  | In-Situ Air Voids | X | X (100 - Roadway Core Density) |
|  | Thickness | X |  |
|  | Aggregate Bulk Specific Gravity (Gsb) | X |  |
| Gyratory Test | Air Voids at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}$ |  | X |
|  | VMA at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}$ |  | X |

TABLE 4.5
Pairing results of the AQCs for INDOT QC/QA HMA and QRSS.

|  | AQCs | AQCs for INDOT QC/QA HMA |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gradation | 3/4" | N/A* |
|  | $3 / 8^{\prime \prime}$ | N/A |
|  | \#4 | N/A |
|  | \#200 | N/A |
| Volumetric | Asphalt Content | Binder Content |
|  | Maximum Theoretical Specific Gravity (Gmm) | N/A |
|  | In-Situ Bulk Density | N/A |
|  | In-Situ Air Voids | 100 - Roadway Core Density |
|  | Thickness | N/A |
|  | Bulk Specific Gravity (Gsb) | N/A |
| Gyratory Test | N/A | Air Voids at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}$ |
|  | N/A | VMA at $\mathrm{N}_{\text {des }}$ |

*Not applicable.

Figure 4.7 uses 2-D scatter plots to show the relationship between the service life difference and PWL of the binder content AQC. All samples were divided into two groups: Figure 4.7 (a)-those samples with sample mean values greater than the mean value of the design
target, and Figure 4.7 (b)-those samples with sample mean values less than the mean value of the design target. A few observations are obtained as follows. (1) Figure 4.7 (a) and Figure 4.7 (b) are mirror copies to each other; Service life differences are all positive in Figure 4.7 (a) and are all negative in Figure 4.7 (b). (2) The cutoff appears to be at the PWL of 30 and service life difference of 0.033 and -0.04 . (3) The predicted service life difference is very small; the range is from -0.06 to 0.05 years, or -3.1 to 2.6 weeks. (4) Even for very poor PWL (e.g., 10 or $10 \%$ ), the service life difference is very small. (5) For a large PWL (e.g., 98 or $98 \%$ ), the service life difference can be positive or negative; that is, the service life of the as-constructed could be estimated to be longer or shorter than the service life of the as-designed.

Figure 4.8 illustrates the relationship between the estimated service life difference and the PWL for the roadway core density AQC, grouped into the mean values (e.g., $94.5 \%, 94.0 \%$, etc.). Results show that for the low mean values (i.e., $90.0 \%$ and $90.5 \%$ ), although PWL values are less than $50 \%$-failed, the estimated service life differences are all positive (longer service life of the failed as-constructed). For high mean values (i.e., from $92.5 \%$ to $94.5 \%$ ), although PWL values are greater than $50 \%$ and many approach $100 \%$-acceptable with full pay, the estimated service life differences are all negative (shorter service life of the full pay as-constructed). Only two groups-mean values at $91.5 \%$ and $92.0 \%$-show positive service life differences with acceptable PWL values. However, the magnitude is small (less than 0.1 year) and the effect from PWL is minimal (points forming a horizontal line in both groups).


Figure 4.4 Simulation procedure for each scenario.

The root cause of the limitations (and associated abnormality as has been observed) in QRSS to deal with PWL is whether the standard deviation, or the consistency, in the samples is counted. PWL calculation incorporates standard deviation while QRSS does not concern standard deviation. As Figure 4.9 illustrates, QRSS estimates the service life difference to be the same for the mean value regardless of how big or small the standard deviation is.

### 4.8 Recommendations Regarding the Use of QRSS for QCIQA HMA

For QC/QA HMA pavement, the concept on comparing the long-term performances between as-designed and as-constructed pavements and then based on the
comparison to make decision regarding failed materials is still valid. However, given all the limitations, the misalignment between INDOT practice and QRSS methods, QRSS is not being recommended to be used as the PRS tool to predict the long-term performance and assess the impact of failed materials.

At the stage of this writing, QRSS itself is still in the validation phases and it could be modified in the near future. A future study is necessary to evaluate existing tools such as the modified QRSS and MEPDG, and align those tools with INDOT practice. Changes to the current INDOT practice might be necessary to adopt PRS tools and develop PRS-based decision framework to assist decision-making regarding QC/QA HMA pavement of failed materials.
Generated samples and estimated service life differences per binder content.

| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  | Mean | St. Dev. | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |
| 4.00 | 0.10 | 4 | 3.89 | 3.96 | 3.97 | 4.14 | 4.05 | 4.00 | 0.10 | 0 | -0.060 | -0.055 | -0.054 | -0.042 | -0.048 | -0.052 |
| 4.00 | 0.20 | 1 | 4.20 | 3.73 | 4.18 | 3.92 | 3.95 | 4.00 | 0.20 | 7 | -0.038 | -0.071 | -0.039 | -0.058 | -0.056 | -0.052 |
| 4.00 | 0.30 | 14 | 3.84 | 4.26 | 3.72 | 3.82 | 4.38 | 4.00 | 0.30 | 16 | -0.063 | -0.034 | -0.072 | -0.065 | -0.026 | -0.052 |
| 4.00 | 0.40 | 2 | 3.88 | 4.40 | 4.07 | 3.38 | 4.27 | 4.00 | 0.40 | 22 | -0.061 | -0.024 | -0.047 | -0.097 | -0.033 | -0.052 |

TABLE 4.7
Generated samples and estimated service life differences per roadway core density.

| Target |  | Sample Size | Sublot Samples |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | M | St. <br> Dev. | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sub 1-1 | Sub 1-2 | Sub 2-1 | Sub 2-2 | Sub 3-1 | Sub 3-2 | Sub 4-1 | Sub 4-2 | Sub 5-1 | Sub 5-2 |  |  |  | Sub 1 | Sub2 | Sub3 | Subl4 | Sub5 |  |
| 5.50 | 0.10 | 1 | 5.34 | 5.37 | 5.47 | 5.48 | 5.49 | 5.51 | 5.53 | 5.53 | 5.60 | 5.67 | 5.5 | 0.1 | 100 | -0.349 | -0.335 | -0.333 | -0.329 | -0.318 | -0.333 |
| 5.50 | 0.20 | 7 | 5.15 | 5.32 | 5.34 | 5.39 | 5.45 | 5.56 | 5.67 | 5.68 | 5.68 | 5.73 | 5.5 | 0.2 | 100 | -0.362 | -0.348 | -0.332 | -0.313 | -0.310 | -0.333 |
| 5.50 | 0.30 | 1 | 5.06 | 5.21 | 5.25 | 5.26 | 5.51 | 5.51 | 5.71 | 5.74 | 5.77 | 5.97 | 5.5 | 0.3 | 100 | -0.372 | -0.359 | -0.332 | -0.307 | -0.291 | -0.332 |
| 5.50 | 0.40 | 11 | 5.05 | 5.12 | 5.22 | 5.33 | 5.34 | 5.37 | 5.42 | 5.89 | 5.99 | 6.23 | 5.5 | 0.4 | 100 | -0.377 | -0.357 | -0.349 | -0.315 | -0.262 | -0.332 |
| 5.50 | 0.50 | 9 | 4.61 | 4.98 | 5.13 | 5.27 | 5.50 | 5.56 | 5.74 | 5.92 | 6.09 | 6.15 | 5.5 | 0.5 | 100 | -0.406 | -0.365 | -0.329 | -0.295 | -0.261 | -0.331 |



Figure 4.5 Trend analysis results: (a) binder content; (b) roadway core density.


Figure 4.6 An illustration of two different samples with the same PWL value.

(a) Higher mean values as compared to As-designed value

(b) Lower mean values as compared to As-designed value

Figure 4.7 Relationship between the service life difference and the PWL of binder content: (a) higher mean values as compared to as-designed value; (b) lower mean values as compared to as-designed value.


Figure 4.8 Relationship between service life differences and PWL per roadway core density.

(a) Binder content: perspective view

(c) Roadway core density: perspective view
(b) Binder content: orthogonal view

(d) Roadway core density: orthogonal view

Figure 4.9 The relationships between service life differences and the means and standard deviations: (a) binder content: perspective view; (b) binder content: orthogonal view; (c) roadway core density: perspective view; (d) roadway core density: orthogonal view.

## 5. CASE ILLUSTRATION OF THE DECISION FRAMEWORK FOR PCCP

### 5.1 Case Overview

The validation case is a concrete pavement project (INDOT Project IR-30846), a section of SR-25 in Delphi, Indiana, completed in 2011. Figure 5.1 provides an aerial view of the project area.

### 5.2 The Application of the Decision Framework

The decision framework (see Figure 3.13 in Section 3.11) was applied to this case to illustrate how the financial impact caused by the inferior performance of PCCP of failed materials can be statistically quantified to support decision-making regarding failed materials.

### 5.2.1 Input Variables and As-Designed AQC Targets

Appendix F lists all the values for the input variables required in PaceSpec. Table 5.1 lists the design targets for the four AQCs in both aspects of mean and standard deviation. As-designed mean values are determined based on INDOT specifications and project documents. As-designed standard deviations are adopted from a previous JTRP project (Graveen et al., 2009). The current
version of INDOT specifications does not specify standard deviations for AQCs. Both mean and standard deviation values can be customized to suit individual construction projects. Users can use their own project mean and standard deviation values of AQCs to implement the proposed decision framework. Note that from the statistical perspective, given any mean and standard deviation values, certain amount of the work under investigation might be significantly substandard and it could be missed by random sampling. For instance, regarding thickness with a mean value of 9.5 inch and a standard deviation value of 0.5 inch, about $17 \%$ of the sublot could have a thickness less than 9 ", which is significantly substandard

TABLE 5.1
Design AQC values (from INDOT project IR-30846).

| AQC Value | As-Designed <br> Mean | As-Designed Standard <br> Deviation |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 28-day Flexural <br> Strength (psi) | 700 psi | 50 psi |
| Thickness (in) | 9.5 in | 0.5 in |
| Air Content (\%) | $6.5 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ |
| Smoothness (in/mile) | $3.2 \mathrm{in} / 0.1 \mathrm{mile}$ | $0.8 \mathrm{in} / 0.1 \mathrm{mile}$ |



Figure 5.1 INDOT project IR-30846.

TABLE 5.2
Acceptance testing results (lot 7, INDOT project IR-30846).

| Lot/Sublot | Content (\%) | Air <br> Ctrength (psi) | 7-day <br> Flexural <br> (inches) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Lot 7 | Sublot 1 | 6.4 | 495 | 9.9 |
|  | Sublot 2 | 7.0 | 535 | 10.1 |
|  | Sublot 3 | 7.4 | 493 | 9.8 |
|  | Average | 6.9 | 508 | 9.9 |

TABLE 5.3
LCCs estimated in PaveSpec.

| Simulation Type | LCC Mean <br> (\$/mile) | LCC Standard <br> Deviation (\$/mile) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| As-Designed LCC | 85,341 | 24,913 |
| As-Constructed LCC | 109,533 | 33,488 |

and could possibly be missed by the random coring. The analysis life for this case illustration is 30 years.

### 5.2.2 As-Constructed AQCs (Failed Materials due to Flexural Strength)

Lot 7 is the lot of failed materials and it is used as the case to illustrate how the framework works. Lot 7 contains three sublots. Table 5.2 lists the acceptance testing results for all sublots and the calculated average for the lot. Lot 7 fails due to the flexural strength. The lot average of the 7 -day flexural strength is 508 psi , which is lower than the threshold value of 514 psi as specified in INDOT specification. Sublot 1 and 3 both have 7 -day flexural strength lower than 500 psi, the threshold value set at the sublot level.

### 5.2.3 Estimating LCCs

Following the decision framework (Figure 3.13), Level 2 Specification and the re-simulation approach were used to run simulations and estimate the LCCs of the as-designed and the as-constructed pavement. Since the failure scenario is a lot-average-failure, although it contains acceptable and failed sublots, the single lot method was used to estimate the LCC of the as-constructed pavement. For all these simulations, the 7-day flexural strengths were converted into 28-day flexural strengths using the multiplication constant $C$ (set to be 1.23), described in detail in Section 3.3.1. Table 5.3 provides the simulation results regarding LCCs in both aspects of mean and standard deviation. The mean LCC of the as-constructed is about $\$ 24,000$ (per mile) higher than the mean LCC of the as-designed

TABLE 5.4
Estimated 90th-percentile and 95th-percentile LCC differences.

| LCC |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Difference <br> Mean <br> (\$/mile) | LCC Difference | 90th-Percentile | 95th-Percentile <br> Deviation (\$/mile) |
| 24,192 | 41,739 | LCC Difference | LCC Difference |
| (\$/mile) | (\$/mile) |  |  |

pavement. The standard deviation of the as-constructed LCC is larger than that of the as-designed LCC; the as-constructed pavement is lower in consistency.

Following Equations (3.2) to (3.5), the 90th-percentile and 95th-percentile LCC differences between as-designed and as-constructed pavement were calculated as $\$ 77,618 /$ mile and $\$ 93,061 /$ mile, respectively. Table 5.4 shows the results.

### 5.2.4 Decision-Making

The 90th-percentile LCC difference ( $\$ 77,618 / \mathrm{mile}$ ) and the 95th-percentile LCC difference ( $\$ 93,061 /$ mile) were compared to the initial construction cost-the contract cost set at $\$ 281,600 /$ mile. Both LCC differences are much lower than the initial construction cost; therefore, the decision would be to "accept with a penalty" and the penalty could be set at either $\$ 77,618 /$ mile (the 90thpercentile) or $\$ 93,061 /$ mile (the 95 th-percentile).

## 6. SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

### 6.1 Summary and Recommendations

This study investigated the use of PRS tools, namely PaveSpec for PCCP and QRSS for QC/QA HMA pavement, to assist the decision-making regarding failed materials based on the predicted long-term performance from the life-cycle perspective. A decision framework that incorporates PaveSpec performanceprediction model and maintenance-cost model was developed for PCCP of failed materials. A large number of simulations were performed to develop and test the framework. The framework was validated using the design and construction data from an INDOT construction project. It is recommended that INDOT adopt this framework to assist its decision-making regarding PCCP of failed materials.

In evaluating QRSS for QC/QA HMA pavement of failed materials, a number of challenges and issues were identified, leading to the recommendation that QRSS, at its current version, is not an adequate tool to reliably predict the long-term performance of QC/QA HMA pavement that involves failed materials.

### 6.2 Key Findings

Key findings have been summarized in the Executive Summary section and are repeated as follows.

### 6.2.1 Using PaveSpec to Develop the Decision Framework for Failed Materials of PCCP

- PaveSpec takes five AQCs for PCCP: concrete strength, slab thickness, air content, initial smoothness, and percent consolidation around dowels (optional). The four mandatory AQCs are all being tested as stipulated in INDOT QA/QC specification for PCCP.
- PaveSpec provides two levels of specification, Level 1 and Level 2 Specification, to predict the long-term performance and to estimate the LCC for PCCP. The Level 2 Specification considers the correlation between AQCs. It is more reflective of the reality and therefore, Level 2 Specification is the level adopted in the newly developed decision framework. Simulation results show that LCCs estimated using the Level 2 Specification are lower than the LCCs estimated using the Level 1 Specification for the same PCCP pavement.
- In PaveSpec, two approaches are available to estimate the LCC of as-constructed PCCP-the interpolation and the re-simulation approach. The interpolation approach is the default one, which estimates the LCC of the asconstructed pavement by interpolating the pay factor table resulted from the simulations for the as-designed, based on individual AQCs. The re-simulation approach, a new approach created in this study, substitutes the target AQC values in the as-designed simulation with field-testing results of the AQCs and runs the simulation to estimate the LCC of the as-constructed pavement. The interpolation approach yields a single, deterministic estimate of the LCC for the as-constructed, but the re-simulation approach yields a set of predicted LCCs so that statistical analysis can be performed to calculate the confidence level for a given LCC and vice versa (e.g., 90th-percentile LCC and 95th-percentile LCC). Therefore, the re-simulation approach was adopted in the decision framework.
- For the flexural strength AQC, PaveSpec requires the 28-day strength, but could take the 7 -day strength as an input if a curing curve is provided. INDOT tests 7 -day strength only. Unfortunately, the curing curve depends on the mix formula, which varies from project to project. After an extensive literature review and consulting INDOT experts, a multiplication constant ( $C$ ) was set at 1.23 to calculate the 28 -day strength from the 7 -day strength (i.e., 28-day strength $=7$-day strength $\times 1.23$ ). It is recommended to determine C in a much more accurate way by slightly modifying the current practice in sampling and testing. For instance, both the 7 -day and 28 -day flexural strength at the time of the trial batch can be measured to determine coefficient C for the specific mix design. Or, ores from broken beam halves or actual pavement areas in questions could be obtained very close to the 28 -day age and tested for split tensile strength (to be converted to a 28 -day flexural strength).
- The examination of INDOT specifications on the criteria of failed materials revealed that a lot could contain both acceptable and failed sublots. Two different methods, the single lot method and the divide-estimate-sum method, were devised and their results were compared for various scenarios of the co-existence of both failed and acceptable sublots in a single lot. The single lot method treats the lot that contains both acceptable and failed sublots as a single lot in PaveSpec. The divide-estimate-sum method separates the original lot into two new lots, one contains
acceptable sublot ( $s$ ) only and the other contains failed sublot ( $s$ ) only. Simulations are then performed for the new lots and results are added to estimate the LCC for the original lot. Simulation results show that estimated LCCs are quite different between these two methods. For the flexural strength AQC, the single lot method always yielded higher LCCs than the divide-estimate-sum method did. For the air content AQC, the single lot method always yielded lower LCCs than the divide-estimate-sum method did. These observations can be explained by looking at the sensitivity of LCC to the mean and the standard deviation. For the flexural strength AQC, the LCC is more sensitive to the consistency (indicated by the standard deviation). For the air content, the LCC is more sensitive to the average (indicated by the mean). Separating acceptable and failed sublots into two new lots leads to two smaller standard deviations than the standard deviation of the original lot and two new means, one is larger and the other is smaller than the mean of the original lot. Based on the comparisons, it is concluded that (1) for the lot level failure, i.e., the lot average falls in the failed range, the single lot approach is more appropriate, and (2) for the sublot level failure, i.e., the lot average is acceptable, but the lot contains failed $\operatorname{sublot}(s)$, it reflects the reality better by separating the original lot into two new lots, one contains acceptable sublot(s) only and the other contains failed sublot(s) only. This conclusion was incorporated in developing the decision framework.
- A large number of simulation scenarios of failed materials were designed for a three-sublot lot. Simulations were performed to estimate the LCC of PCCP using the Level 2 Specification, the re-simulation approach, and the divide-estimate-sum method. Results show that for flexural strength and thickness AQCs, a trend exists: higher mean values (indicating better quality) and lower standard deviations (indicating higher consistency) always lead to lower LCCs. While the same trend exists for the air content AQC, it is not appropriate to use PaveSpec because a higher air content does not indicate a better quality.
- Concerned with the air content AQC, additional simulation scenarios were designed to investigate the aggregate effect of multiple AQCs (focusing on air content) on the LCC. Results show that higher means of the air content AQC always yielded lower LCC estimates regardless of the variations in other AQCs, such as concrete strength and thickness. It was concluded that PaveSpec is not an appropriate tool for estimating the as-constructed LCC if materials fail because of the air content AQC.
- The LCC difference at various level of confidence can be statistically calculated in such a way, in which (1) the simulated LCCs of the as-designed and the simulated LCCs of the as-constructed are two independent samples following the normal distribution, (2) the LCC differences are a derived sample that follows the normal distributionits mean is the average of the means of the two samples in (1) and its standard deviation is the square root of the sum of the squares of the two standard deviations of the two samples in (1). Consequently, the LCC difference at any confidence level can be calculated following the calculation methods for normal distributions.
- Aforementioned findings were incorporated into a newly developed decision framework (see Figure 3.13) for failed materials of PCCP. It was validated using design and testing data from INDOT construction project (IR-30846).
6.2.2 Using QRSS to Develop the Decision Framework for Failed Materials of QCIQA HMA Pavement
- QRSS only estimates the service life by predicting the distresses of rutting, fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking; and comparing them to pre-set threshold values. It does not have a mechanism to incorporate maintenance strategies and costs to estimate the LCC.
- There is a misalignment between the AQCs specified in INDOT's QC/QA HMA specification and the AQCs required in QRSS. Table 4.1 illustrates that (1) only two AQCs -binder content and roadway core density-are common to both INDOT specification and QRSS, (2) two AQCs-lab-compacted air voids, and voids in mineral aggregate (VMA)-are included in INDOT specification, but cannot be used directly in QRSS, and (3) gradations are required by QRSS, but are not included in INDOT specification.
- Because of the misalignment, a pairing mechanism is needed in order to run QRSS simulations for INDOT QC/QA HMA pavement. Table 4.5 illustrates this pairing mechanism. A recommendation to INDOT would be to collect the AQCs that are required in QRSS in order to adopt QRSS in the decision framework.
- A challenge in applying QRSS to INDOT QC/QA HMA pavement is caused by the use of PWL as the criterion for failed materials in INDOT specification: many different scenarios could lead to the same PWL value.
- QRSS estimates the long-term pavement performance in terms of pavement distresses (i.e., rutting, fatigue cracking, and thermal cracking), predicts service life by comparing the distresses to their pre-set threshold values, and calculates the service life differences between as-designed and as-constructed pavements. However, QRSS simulations yielded abnormal results when predicting the service life difference between the as-designed and the asconstructed pavement based on fatigue cracking and thermal cracking. For the fatigue cracking, when the same set of values were used for both the as-designed and the asconstructed pavements, QRSS always predicted negative service life differences, i.e., the as-constructed pavement has a shorter service life than the as-built pavement. For the thermal cracking, QRSS always predicted there is no service life difference between the as-designed and the as-constructed even though their AQC values were different, but all in normal ranges. Furthermore, when either the as-constructed has extremely high AQC values or extremely low AQC values, QRSS predicted that the service life difference is over 50 years. Since QRSS yields abnormal results when considering thermal cracking and fatigue cracking, it is not appropriate to use both of them as the base for estimating the shortened service life attributable to failed materials.
- The current version of QRSS executes Monte Carlo simulations to predict service life differences based on pavement performance estimates. In the results, QRSS provides means of the service life differences; however, it does not provide standard deviations of the service life differences directly. Therefore, to predict the service life difference at a user-specified confidence/probability (e.g., 90th-percentile or 95 th-percentile service life difference), a statistical approach was devised to calculate the standard deviation based on individual pairs of the service life of as-designed and as-constructed.
- A large number of simulation scenarios for the only two common AQCs in QRSS and INDOT specificationbinder content and roadway core density-were crafted in lieu of a five-sublot lot. The simulation results showed that the service life is insensitive to the standard deviation, but it is closely correlated with the mean-a higher mean in either binder content or roadway core density leads to a longer service life. The trend, in turn, lead to erroneous results when applying the PWL concept. Because any value that is too high or too low is outside the limit, for a given PWL value, if the original set is leaning towards the higher end, the predicted service life is longer; if the original set is leaning towards the higher end, the predicted service life is shorter. As the result, QRSS estimated that for certain groups of failed materials, the service life of the as-constructed is longer than the service life of as-designed.
- Given the misalignment between INDOT AQCs and the AQCs required in QRSS, the limitations in QRSS, and the erroneous results from the QRSS simulations, QRSS is not being recommended as the PRS tool to be used for QC/QA HMA pavement at this moment.


### 6.3 Recommendations for Implementation

This study developed the decision framework for failed materials of PCCP. The developed decision framework enables the calculation of the LCC differences between the as-designed and as-constructed pavements at a user-specified confidence level. In addition, more economically appropriate option between the "removal and replacement" or the "acceptance with a heavy penalty" option can be determined through the comparison of the LCC differences to the construction contract price. This framework can be immediately implemented to assist INDOT for data-driven, informed decision-making regarding failed PCCP materials. However, additional case validations of the decision framework for PCCP may be needed for the INDOT to support implementation and adoption of the PRS based methodologies. Moreover, training on the use of PaveSpec is critical to the success implementation.

For QC/QA HMA pavement, further study is needed to find an appropriate PRS tool. The current version of QRSS is not an appropriate PRS tool to estimate the long-term performances because of its limitations and the misalignment between QRSS process and current INDOT practices although the concept on comparing the long-term performance between as-designed and asconstructed pavements is still valid. A suggestion for immediate implementation would be to align an MEPDG based AQCs for HMA pavement. Although QRSS is still in validation phase and this study concluded that QRSS is not an appropriate tool, dissimilar analysis results might be expected if AQCs of INDOT align to QRSS AQCs. Particularly, currently INDOT collects two types of HMA samples, loose mixtures and core mixtures, to evaluate pavement qualities. Loose mixtures are used to measure binder content, and lab compacted air voids and VMA, while core mixtures
are used to measure density. On the other hand, if the AQCs aligned with the QRSS AQCs, INDOT would have to collect core mixture samples that can assist to determine pavement qualities and performances.

### 6.4 Deliverables

The main deliverable is the decision framework to assist INDOT in making informed decisions regarding PCCP of failed materials. The decision framework is based on PaveSpec. It was developed following thousands of simulations and validated using an INDOT construction project, in which a lot failed due to flexural strength. The framework enables the quantitative determination of financial impact caused by failed materials due to inferior performance and shortened service life. Furthermore, the framework enables the calculation of the financial impact at any user-specified confidence level to allow SHAs to make risk-aware decisions that reflect the agencies' risk perception and management strategies.

Accompanying the development of the decision framework for PCCP, a large number of simulation scenarios were devised. All simulation results are included in Appendices. Many more statistical analyses could be conducted to further analyze the impacts of various combinations of AQCs.

In this study, QRSS, a PRS tool for HMA pavement, were investigated in detail. The conclusion is that given the limitations in the current version of QRSS and the misalignment between AQCs required in QRSS and AQCs specified in INDOT's acceptance testing, QRSS is inadequate to accurately estimate the long-term performance and predict service life difference. Modifications to the current practice at INDOT is required in order to develop a decision framework based on QRSS to assist decision-making regarding QC/QA HMA pavement of failed materials.

## REFERENCES

De Jarnette, V., McCarthy, L. M., Bennert, T., \& Guercio, M. C. (2013). User of mechanistic-empirical pavement design principles to assign asphalt pavement pay factor adjustments. Journal of Construction Engineering and Management, 139(11), 04013024.
Evans, L. D., Darter, M. I., \& Egan, B. K. (2005). Development and implementation of a performance-related specification for I-65 Tennessee: Final report (Publication No. FHWA-IF-06-008). Washington, DC: Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT).
Evans, L., Smith, K. L., Gharaibeh, N. G., \& Darter, M. I. (2008). Development and implementation of a performance-
related specification for $S R$ 9a, Florida: Final report (Publication No. FHWA-HIF-09-016). Washington, DC: Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT).
Graveen, C., Falker, E., Beaver, M., Neithalath, N., Weiss, J., Olke, J., Nantung, T., \& Gallivan, L. (2009). Performance related specifications (PRS) for concrete pavements in Indiana, Volume 2: Technical report (Joint Transportation Research Program Publication No. FHWA/IN/JTRP-2004/ 13-2). West Lafayette, IN: Purdue University. http://dx.doi. org/10.5703/1288284314214
Hoerner, T. E., \& Darter, M. I. (1999). Guide to developing performance-related specifications for PCC pavements. Volume 1: Practical guide, Final report, and Appendix A. FHWA-RD-98-155. Washington, DC: Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT).
Indiana Department of Transportation INDOT. (2008). Indiana test methods (ITM) 588: Percent within limits (PWL). Indianapolis, IN: INDOT.
Indiana Department of Transportation INDOT. (2011). Highway certified technician program training manual: Concrete paving. Indianapolis, IN: INDOT.
Indiana Department of Transportation (INDOT). (2013). 2014 standard specifications. Indianapolis, IN: INDOT.
McCarthy, L. M., Guercio, M. C., Bennert, T., \& De Jarnette, V. (2014). Comparing flexible pavement performance using emerging analysis tools. Journal of Transportation Engineering, 140(5). http://dx.doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)TE.19435436.0000665

Mensching, D. J., McCarthy, L. M., Mehta, Y., \& Byrne, M. (2013). Modeling flexible pavement overlay performance for use with quality-related specifications. Construction and Building Materials, 48, 1072-1080.
Moulthrop, J., \& Witczak, M. (2011). A performance-related specification for hot-mix asphalt (NCHRP report 704). Washington, DC: Transportation Research Board of the National Academies.
Office of Asset Management. (2001). Performance-related specifications: Next step in pavement quality (Publication No. FHWA-IF-02-006). Washington, DC: Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT).
Rao, S. P., Smith, K. L., \& Darter, M. I. (2007). Development and implementation of a performance-related specification for a jointed plain concrete pavement-I-39/90/94 Madison, Wisconsin (Publication No. WI/SPR-01-06). Madison, WI: Wisconsin Department of Transportation (WisDOT).
Scott, S., Konrath, L., \& Ferragut, T. (2014). Framework for performance specifications: Guide for specification writers (Publication No. S2-R07-RR-3). Washington DC: The Second Strategic Highway Research Program, Transportation Research Board.
Sholar, G. A., Page, G. C., Musselman, J. A., Upshaw, P. B., \& Moseley, H. L. (2003). Florida Department of Transportation's percent within limits hot-mix asphalt specification (Publication No. FL/DOT/SMO/03-467). Tallahassee, FL: Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT).

## APPENDICES

APPENDIX A. PAVESPEC INPUT DATA FOR STUDYING

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  | Specification Level | Develop a Level 1 and Level 2 Specification at the same time. |
| 2 |  | Traffic Direction | NB and SB |
| 3 |  | Lane configuration | Six. Divided |
| 4 |  | Lane width | 12 ft |
| 5 |  | Lane Accept | Check |
| 6 |  | Shoulder type | Tied PCC |
| 7 | Widened | (Widened Lane Selected Only) | - |
|  | Stress load tra | efficiency (Tied PCC Selected Only) | 20\% |
| 8 | Inner | racking as \% of outer lane | 10\% |
| 9 |  | Road Location | Urban |
| 10 |  | Project length | 9893ft |
| 11 | Pavement Design Modules (Design Inputs) | Design Life | 30years |
| 12 |  | Pavement Type | Jointed Plain (JPCP), Doweled |
| 13 |  | Dowel Bar Diameter | 1.5in |
| 14 |  | Transverse Joint Spacing | 18.33 ft |
| 15 |  | PCC modulus of elasticity | 3,400,000psi |
| 16 |  | Transverse Joint Sealant type | Silicone |
| 17 |  | Modulus of Subgrade Reaction (static k-value) | 100psi/in |
| 18 |  | Water-Cement Ratio | 0.42 |
| 19 |  | Percent Subgrade Material Passing the \#200 Sieve | 88\% |
| 20 | Pavement Design Modules (Base Variables) | Base Permeability | Permiable |
| 21 |  | Base Thickness | 9in |
| 22 |  | Base Modulus of Elasticity | 30,000psi |
| 23 |  | PCC-Base Interface | Unbonded |
| 24 |  | Base Erodibility Factor | 5 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 25 | Design Traffic Modules | Defined traffic based on | Average Daily Traffic (ADT) |
| 26 |  | Specific traffic for year | 1 |
| 27 |  | ADT at that year | 61,200 |
| - |  | Cumulative ESALs at that year (millions) | Calculated by PaveSpec |
| 28 |  | Growth Rate | $2.535 \%$ |
| 29 |  | Growth Type | Compound |
| 30 |  | ESAL-to ADT Directional factor | 50\% |
| 31 |  | Percent of trucks | 15\% |
| 32 |  | Percent trucks in outer lane | 99\% |
| 33 |  | Average truck load equivalency factor | 1.15ESALs/truck |
| 34 | Climate Variable Modules | Average Annual Freezing Index | 0F-days |
| 35 |  | Average Annual Precipitation | 44.5 in |
| 36 |  | Average Annual Air Freeze-Thaw Cycles | 65 cycles |
| 37 |  | Average Annual Number of Days over 90F | 33.2days |
| 38 |  | Climatic Zone | Wet-Nonfreeze |
| 39 | Distress Indicators |  | Transverse Joint Spalling |
|  |  |  | Transverse Slab Cracking |
|  |  |  | Decreasing Smoothness |
| 40 | Acceptance Quality Characteristics (AQC's) |  | Concrete Strength |
|  |  |  | Slab Thickness |
|  |  |  | Air Content |
|  |  |  | Initial Smoothness |
| 41 | Strength | Sampling Method | Beams |
| 42 |  | Timing of Cores | - |
| 43 |  | Number of Samples per Sublot | 1 |
| 44 |  | Number of Replicates per Sample | 2 |
| 45 |  | Target Timing of Testing | 28days |
| 46 |  | Test Maturity | - |
| 47 |  | Core-to-cylinder strength relationship | - |
| 48 |  | Lab-created maturity equation | - |
| 49 |  | Compressive-to-flexural relationship | - |
| 50 | Thickness | Sampling Method | Independent Cores |
| 51 |  | Timing of Samples | 4days |
| 52 |  | Number of Samples per Sublot | 2 |
| 53 |  | Number of Replicates per Sample | 1 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 54 |  | Sampling Method | Air pressure Meter |
| 55 |  | Timing of Samples | - |
| 56 |  | Number of Samples per Sublot | 2 |
| 57 |  | Number of Replicates per Sample | 1 |
| 58 |  | Initial Smoothness Indicator | Profile Index (0.0-in blanking band) |
| 59 |  | Initial Smoothness Relationship | - |
| 60 |  | Number of Pass Locations per Sublot | 1 |
| 61 | Initial Smooth | Pass Locations (describe) |  |
| 62 |  | Number of Replications per Pass Location | 2 |
| 63 |  | Timing of Samples (describe) |  |
| 64 |  | Profilograph Reduction Method | v |
| 65 |  | mine target LCC by | Estimate LCC through Simulation |
| 66 |  | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 67 | Concrete Strength | Mean | 650 psi |
| 68 |  | Std Dev | 40psi |
| 69 |  | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 70 | Slab Thickness | Mean | 15 in |
| 71 |  | Std Dev | 0.5 in |
| 72 |  | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 73 | Air Content | Mean | 6.50\% |
| 74 |  | Std Dev | 0.50\% |
| 75 |  | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 76 | Initial Smoothness | Mean | 32in/mi |
| 77 |  | Std Dev | $8 \mathrm{in} / \mathrm{mi}$ |
| 78 |  | Sample Method | - |
| 79 | Percent Consol. <br> Around Dowels | Mean | - |
| 80 |  | Std Dev | - |
| 81 | Maintenance and Rehabilitation Plan Modules (Maintenance) | Maintenance Transverse Joints | Check |
| 82 |  | Seal | 40\% |
| 83 |  | Regular Maintenance Year | $5 y$ ars |
| 84 |  | Maintenance Longitudinal Joints | Check |
| 85 |  | Seal | 25\% |
| 86 |  | Regular Maintenance Year | $5 y$ ars |
| 87 |  | Maintenance Transverse Cracks | Check |
| 88 |  | Seal | 100\% |
| 89 |  | Regular Maintenance Year | 3 years |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| Maintenance and Rehabilitation |  |
| Plan Modules (Local Rehab) |  |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 116 | Unit Costs Modules (Rehabilitation) | Full-depth repairs of transverse joints | \$159 per sq. yd |
| 117 |  | Partial-depth repairs of transverse joints | \$364 per sq. yd |
| 118 |  | Full slab replacements | - |
| 119 |  | Partial slab replacements | \$135 per sq. yd |
| 120 |  | AC overlay | \$11 per sq. yd |
| 121 |  | PCC overlay | - |
| 122 |  | Diamond grinding | - |
| 123 | Unit Costs Modules (Other) | Annual inflation rate | 3\% |
| 124 |  | Annual interest rate | 6\% |
| 125 |  | Assumed width of a full-depth repair of a transverse joint | 6 ft |
| 126 |  | Assumed width of a partial-depth repair of a transverse joint | 6 ft |
| 127 |  | Assumed width of a partial slab replacement | 6 ft |
| 128 |  | User cost percentage to include | 2\% |
| 129 |  | Year of construction | 2002 |
| 130 | Generic Settings | Number of lots to simulate at each factorial point | 500 |
| 131 |  | Minimum number of sublots per lot to simulate | 3 |
| 132 |  | Maximum number of sublots per lot to simulate | 3 |
| 133 |  | Average bid price | \$20/sq.yd |
| 134 |  | Analysis life | 70years |

## APPENDIX B. COMPOSITE EFFECTS OF MULTIPLE AQCS ANALYSIS RESULTS

Two as-design cases serve as the base for the comparisons. In Case 1, the design target for the slab thickness is 15 inches and the as-designed LCC is $\$ 5,330,980$. Comparison 1 refers to the difference between the LCC of an as-constructed and Case 1 as-designed LCC. In Case 2, the design target for the slab thickness is 12 inches and the as-designed LCC is $\$ 5,492,366$. Comparison 2 refers to comparisons of as-constructed LCCs against Case 2 as-designed LCC.

|  | Air Content |  |  |  |  |  | Comparison $\mathbf{1}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,713,699 | -\$617,281 | -\$778,667 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,715,603 | -\$615,377 | -\$776,763 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,718,563 | -\$612,417 | -\$773,803 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,707,864 | -\$623,116 | -\$784,502 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,708,128 | -\$622,852 | -\$784,238 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,708,764 | -\$622,216 | -\$783,602 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,709,835 | -\$621,145 | -\$782,531 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,806,825 | -\$524,155 | -\$685,541 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,811,864 | -\$519,116 | -\$680,502 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,819,843 | -\$511,137 | -\$672,523 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$4,831,172 | -\$499,808 | -\$661,194 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,766,779 | -\$564,201 | -\$725,587 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,771,157 | -\$559,823 | -\$721,209 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,777,313 | -\$553,667 | -\$715,053 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,784,995 | -\$545,985 | -\$707,371 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,731,328 | -\$599,652 | -\$761,038 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,735,301 | -\$595,679 | -\$757,065 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,741,532 | -\$589,448 | -\$750,834 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,748,670 | -\$582,310 | -\$743,696 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,714,836 | -\$616,144 | -\$777,530 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,716,263 | -\$614,717 | -\$776,103 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,719,150 | -\$611,830 | -\$773,216 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,723,552 | -\$607,428 | -\$768,814 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,709,215 | -\$621,765 | -\$783,151 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,709,484 | -\$621,496 | -\$782,882 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,710,275 | -\$620,705 | -\$782,091 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,711,831 | -\$619,149 | -\$780,535 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,826,780 | -\$504,200 | -\$665,586 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,834,099 | -\$496,881 | -\$658,267 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | $450$ | 60 | \$4,849,512 | -\$481,468 | -\$642,854 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | $15 \mathrm{in}$ | 2 in | $450$ | 80 | \$4,871,318 | -\$459,662 | -\$621,048 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,775,026 | -\$555,954 | -\$717,340 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,779,516 | -\$551,464 | -\$712,850 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,787,471 | -\$543,509 | -\$704,895 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,798,397 | -\$532,583 | -\$693,969 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,737,404 | -\$593,576 | -\$754,962 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,740,454 | -\$590,526 | -\$751,912 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,746,353 | -\$584,627 | -\$746,013 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,754,694 | -\$576,286 | -\$737,672 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,717,286 | -\$613,694 | -\$775,080 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,718,835 | -\$612,145 | -\$773,531 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,721,783 | -\$609,197 | -\$770,583 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,726,068 | -\$604,912 | -\$766,298 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,709,782 | -\$621,198 | -\$782,584 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,710,269 | -\$620,711 | -\$782,097 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,711,387 | -\$619,593 | -\$780,979 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,713,177 | -\$617,803 | -\$779,189 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,827,068 | -\$503,912 | -\$665,298 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,833,616 | -\$497,364 | -\$658,750 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,845,166 | -\$485,814 | -\$647,200 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$4,867,141 | -\$463,839 | -\$625,225 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,785,413 | -\$545,567 | -\$706,953 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,789,586 | -\$541,394 | -\$702,780 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,796,671 | -\$534,309 | -\$695,695 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,805,863 | -\$525,117 | -\$686,503 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,745,817 | -\$585,163 | -\$746,549 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,750,279 | -\$580,701 | -\$742,087 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,757,058 | -\$573,922 | -\$735,308 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,764,366 | -\$566,614 | -\$728,000 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,720,374 | -\$610,606 | -\$771,992 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,722,877 | -\$608,103 | -\$769,489 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,727,408 | -\$603,572 | -\$764,958 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,733,055 | -\$597,925 | -\$759,311 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,711,370 | -\$619,610 | -\$780,996 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,711,980 | -\$619,000 | -\$780,386 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | $650$ | 60 | \$4,713,437 | -\$617,543 | -\$778,929 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | $650$ | 80 | \$4,716,090 | -\$614,890 | -\$776,276 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,918,282 | -\$412,698 | -\$574,084 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,933,643 | -\$397,337 | -\$558,723 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,964,171 | -\$366,809 | -\$528,195 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,009,677 | -\$321,303 | -\$482,689 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,817,921 | -\$513,059 | -\$674,445 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab)$\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,826,400 | -\$504,580 | -\$665,966 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,840,518 | -\$490,462 | -\$651,848 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,860,774 | -\$470,206 | -\$631,592 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,759,294 | -\$571,686 | -\$733,072 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,764,672 | -\$566,308 | -\$727,694 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,773,190 | -\$557,790 | -\$719,176 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,784,904 | -\$546,076 | -\$707,462 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,726,501 | -\$604,479 | -\$765,865 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,728,912 | -\$602,068 | -\$763,454 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,733,997 | -\$596,983 | -\$758,369 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,741,523 | -\$589,457 | -\$750,843 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,713,007 | -\$617,973 | -\$779,359 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,713,881 | -\$617,099 | -\$778,485 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,715,741 | -\$615,239 | -\$776,625 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,719,115 | -\$611,865 | -\$773,251 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,857,703 | -\$473,277 | -\$634,663 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,870,700 | -\$460,280 | -\$621,666 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,917,789 | -\$413,191 | -\$574,577 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,010,492 | -\$320,488 | -\$481,874 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,805,102 | -\$525,878 | -\$687,264 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,810,412 | -\$520,568 | -\$681,954 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,820,772 | -\$510,208 | -\$671,594 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,841,251 | -\$489,729 | -\$651,115 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,746,214 | -\$584,766 | -\$746,152 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,768,707 | -\$562,273 | -\$723,659 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,775,215 | -\$555,765 | -\$717,151 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,784,147 | -\$546,833 | -\$708,219 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,729,721 | -\$601,259 | -\$762,645 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,733,299 | -\$597,681 | -\$759,067 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,739,095 | -\$591,885 | -\$753,271 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,746,360 | -\$584,620 | -\$746,006 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,714,555 | -\$616,425 | -\$777,811 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,715,783 | -\$615,197 | -\$776,583 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,718,489 | -\$612,491 | -\$773,877 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,722,694 | -\$608,286 | -\$769,672 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,187,510 | -\$143,470 | -\$304,856 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,214,225 | -\$116,755 | -\$278,141 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,265,029 | -\$65,951 | -\$227,337 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,336,185 | \$5,205 | -\$156,181 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,951,476 | -\$379,504 | -\$540,890 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,965,036 | -\$365,944 | -\$527,330 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,993,187 | -\$337,793 | -\$499,179 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,034,533 | -\$296,447 | -\$457,833 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,826,620 | -\$504,360 | -\$665,746 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,836,343 | -\$494,637 | -\$656,023 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,852,147 | -\$478,833 | -\$640,219 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,874,268 | -\$456,712 | -\$618,098 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,756,384 | -\$574,596 | -\$735,982 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,762,237 | -\$568,743 | -\$730,129 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,772,036 | -\$558,944 | -\$720,330 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,785,413 | -\$545,567 | -\$706,953 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,724,458 | -\$606,522 | -\$767,908 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,726,642 | -\$604,338 | -\$765,724 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,731,237 | -\$599,743 | -\$761,129 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,738,071 | -\$592,909 | -\$754,295 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,068,741 | -\$262,239 | -\$423,625 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,177,841 | -\$153,139 | -\$314,525 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,333,809 | \$2,829 | -\$158,557 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,491,408 | \$160,428 | -\$958 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,842,513 | -\$488,467 | -\$649,853 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,864,928 | -\$466,052 | -\$627,438 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,927,432 | -\$403,548 | -\$564,934 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,029,189 | -\$301,791 | -\$463,177 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,787,154 | -\$543,826 | -\$705,212 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,792,565 | -\$538,415 | -\$699,801 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,804,248 | -\$526,732 | -\$688,118 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,833,068 | -\$497,912 | -\$659,298 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,744,443 | -\$586,537 | -\$747,923 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,749,190 | -\$581,790 | -\$743,176 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,756,489 | -\$574,491 | -\$735,877 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,766,110 | -\$564,870 | -\$726,256 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,720,105 | -\$610,875 | -\$772,261 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,722,360 | -\$608,620 | -\$770,006 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,726,857 | -\$604,123 | -\$765,509 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,732,550 | -\$598,430 | -\$759,816 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,744,026 | \$413,046 | \$251,660 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,765,153 | \$434,173 | \$272,787 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,808,023 | \$477,043 | \$315,657 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,865,520 | \$534,540 | \$373,154 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,319,727 | -\$11,253 | -\$172,639 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,343,105 | \$12,125 | -\$149,261 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,384,619 | \$53,639 | -\$107,747 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,442,075 | \$111,095 | -\$50,291 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,038,276 | -\$292,704 | -\$454,090 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,052,143 | -\$278,837 | -\$440,223 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,079,148 | -\$251,832 | -\$413,218 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,120,552 | -\$210,428 | -\$371,814 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,871,537 | -\$459,443 | -\$620,829 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,880,114 | -\$450,866 | -\$612,252 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,896,486 | -\$434,494 | -\$595,880 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,921,710 | -\$409,270 | -\$570,656 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,781,100 | -\$549,880 | -\$711,266 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,787,466 | -\$543,514 | -\$704,900 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,798,108 | -\$532,872 | -\$694,258 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,813,193 | -\$517,787 | -\$679,173 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,959,052 | \$628,072 | \$466,686 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,038,016 | \$707,036 | \$545,650 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,131,841 | \$800,861 | \$639,475 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,215,065 | \$884,085 | \$722,699 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,293,150 | -\$37,830 | -\$199,216 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,386,771 | \$55,791 | -\$105,595 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | $0.5 \text { in }$ | $500$ | 60 | \$5,515,370 | \$184,390 | \$23,004 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,645,212 | \$314,232 | \$152,846 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,881,430 | -\$449,550 | -\$610,936 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,932,672 | -\$398,308 | -\$559,694 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,026,020 | -\$304,960 | -\$466,346 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,142,200 | -\$188,780 | -\$350,166 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,774,622 | -\$556,358 | -\$717,744 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,784,334 | -\$546,646 | -\$708,032 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,809,920 | -\$521,060 | -\$682,446 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,858,994 | -\$471,986 | -\$633,372 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,732,277 | -\$598,703 | -\$760,089 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,736,528 | -\$594,452 | -\$755,838 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,744,853 | -\$586,127 | -\$747,513 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,758,687 | -\$572,293 | -\$733,679 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,354,682 | \$1,023,702 | \$862,316 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,365,001 | \$1,034,021 | \$872,635 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,386,593 | \$1,055,613 | \$894,227 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,415,906 | \$1,084,926 | \$923,540 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,941,679 | \$610,699 | \$449,313 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,954,864 | \$623,884 | \$462,498 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,983,563 | \$652,583 | \$491,197 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,020,494 | \$689,514 | \$528,128 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,541,569 | \$210,589 | \$49,203 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,556,540 | \$225,560 | \$64,174 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,589,006 | \$258,026 | \$96,640 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,629,400 | \$298,420 | \$137,034 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,208,558 | -\$122,422 | -\$283,808 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,222,783 | -\$108,197 | -\$269,583 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,250,358 | -\$80,622 | -\$242,008 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,287,829 | -\$43,151 | -\$204,537 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,987,243 | -\$343,737 | -\$505,123 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,996,303 | -\$334,677 | -\$496,063 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,014,854 | -\$316,126 | -\$477,512 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,040,900 | -\$290,080 | -\$451,466 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | $10 \text { in }$ | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,648,962 | \$1,317,982 | \$1,156,596 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,671,091 | \$1,340,111 | \$1,178,725 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,699,949 | \$1,368,969 | \$1,207,583 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,726,784 | \$1,395,804 | \$1,234,418 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | $10 \text { in }$ | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,220,593 | \$889,613 | \$728,227 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,269,324 | \$938,344 | \$776,958 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,330,562 | \$999,582 | \$838,196 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,385,903 | \$1,054,923 | \$893,537 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,662,583 | \$331,603 | \$170,217 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,729,164 | \$398,184 | \$236,798 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,822,820 | \$491,840 | \$330,454 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,913,690 | \$582,710 | \$421,324 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,122,073 | -\$208,907 | -\$370,293 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,186,058 | -\$144,922 | -\$306,308 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,284,700 | -\$46,280 | -\$207,666 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,395,184 | \$64,204 | -\$97,182 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,821,989 | -\$508,991 | -\$670,377 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,855,006 | -\$475,974 | -\$637,360 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,917,425 | -\$413,555 | -\$574,941 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,000,963 | -\$330,017 | -\$491,403 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,797,350 | \$1,466,370 | \$1,304,984 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,802,166 | \$1,471,186 | \$1,309,800 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,815,801 | \$1,484,821 | \$1,323,435 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,836,495 | \$1,505,515 | \$1,344,129 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,522,770 | \$1,191,790 | \$1,030,404 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,528,314 | \$1,197,334 | \$1,035,948 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,540,700 | \$1,209,720 | \$1,048,334 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,559,173 | \$1,228,193 | \$1,066,807 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,191,804 | \$860,824 | \$699,438 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 0.50\% | $10 \text { in }$ | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,198,528 | \$867,548 | \$706,162 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | $10 \text { in }$ | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,214,505 | \$883,525 | \$722,139 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,237,666 | \$906,686 | \$745,300 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,830,736 | \$499,756 | \$338,370 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,839,000 | \$508,020 | \$346,634 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,857,045 | \$526,065 | \$364,679 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,884,357 | \$553,377 | \$391,991 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,492,326 | \$161,346 | -\$40 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,502,938 | \$171,958 | \$10,572 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | $650$ | 60 | \$5,523,980 | \$193,000 | \$31,614 |
| 11.00\% | 0.50\% | $10 \mathrm{in}$ | $2 \text { in }$ | $650$ | 80 | \$5,553,927 | \$222,947 | \$61,561 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,867,847 | -\$463,133 | -\$624,519 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,870,548 | -\$460,432 | -\$621,818 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,876,002 | -\$454,978 | -\$616,364 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$4,882,637 | -\$448,343 | -\$609,729 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,819,677 | -\$511,303 | -\$672,689 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,821,927 | -\$509,053 | -\$670,439 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,825,905 | -\$505,075 | -\$666,461 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,831,351 | -\$499,629 | -\$661,015 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,781,009 | -\$549,971 | -\$711,357 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,783,393 | -\$547,587 | -\$708,973 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,786,875 | -\$544,105 | -\$705,491 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,791,217 | -\$539,763 | -\$701,149 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,751,987 | -\$578,993 | -\$740,379 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,753,676 | -\$577,304 | -\$738,690 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,756,344 | -\$574,636 | -\$736,022 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,759,646 | -\$571,334 | -\$732,720 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,731,352 | -\$599,628 | -\$761,014 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,732,514 | -\$598,466 | -\$759,852 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,734,518 | -\$596,462 | -\$757,848 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,737,286 | -\$593,694 | -\$755,080 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,870,428 | -\$460,552 | -\$621,938 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,874,029 | -\$456,951 | -\$618,337 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,881,493 | -\$449,487 | -\$610,873 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$4,891,480 | -\$439,500 | -\$600,886 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,821,640 | -\$509,340 | -\$670,726 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,824,103 | -\$506,877 | -\$668,263 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,828,628 | -\$502,352 | -\$663,738 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,834,832 | -\$496,148 | -\$657,534 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,783,620 | -\$547,360 | -\$708,746 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,785,881 | -\$545,099 | -\$706,485 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,788,752 | -\$542,228 | -\$703,614 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,793,465 | -\$537,515 | -\$698,901 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,753,745 | -\$577,235 | -\$738,621 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,755,062 | -\$575,918 | -\$737,304 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,757,634 | -\$573,346 | -\$734,732 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,761,247 | -\$569,733 | -\$731,119 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,732,723 | -\$598,257 | -\$759,643 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,733,861 | -\$597,119 | -\$758,505 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,735,806 | -\$595,174 | -\$756,560 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,738,329 | -\$592,651 | -\$754,037 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,892,822 | -\$438,158 | -\$599,544 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,896,486 | -\$434,494 | -\$595,880 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,901,930 | -\$429,050 | -\$590,436 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$4,910,370 | -\$420,610 | -\$581,996 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,840,405 | -\$490,575 | -\$651,961 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,842,893 | -\$488,087 | -\$649,473 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,847,847 | -\$483,133 | -\$644,519 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,853,374 | -\$477,606 | -\$638,992 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,797,876 | -\$533,104 | -\$694,490 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,800,014 | -\$530,966 | -\$692,352 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,803,689 | -\$527,291 | -\$688,677 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,808,499 | -\$522,481 | -\$683,867 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,764,684 | -\$566,296 | -\$727,682 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,766,531 | -\$564,449 | -\$725,835 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,769,637 | -\$561,343 | -\$722,729 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,773,433 | -\$557,547 | -\$718,933 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,740,296 | -\$590,684 | -\$752,070 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,741,751 | -\$589,229 | -\$750,615 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,743,970 | -\$587,010 | -\$748,396 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,747,098 | -\$583,882 | -\$745,268 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,906,499 | -\$424,481 | -\$585,867 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,911,951 | -\$419,029 | -\$580,415 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,924,310 | -\$406,670 | -\$568,056 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$4,943,291 | -\$387,689 | -\$549,075 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,844,107 | -\$486,873 | -\$648,259 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,847,484 | -\$483,496 | -\$644,882 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,854,094 | -\$476,886 | -\$638,272 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,863,699 | -\$467,281 | -\$628,667 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,800,452 | -\$530,528 | -\$691,914 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,802,855 | -\$528,125 | -\$689,511 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,807,114 | -\$523,866 | -\$685,252 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,813,101 | -\$517,879 | -\$679,265 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,766,742 | -\$564,238 | -\$725,624 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,768,526 | -\$562,454 | -\$723,840 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,771,038 | -\$559,942 | -\$721,328 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,774,881 | -\$556,099 | -\$717,485 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,741,722 | -\$589,258 | -\$750,644 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,743,084 | -\$587,896 | -\$749,282 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,745,371 | -\$585,609 | -\$746,995 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,748,356 | -\$582,624 | -\$744,010 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,920,586 | -\$410,394 | -\$571,780 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,924,835 | -\$406,145 | -\$567,531 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$4,932,674 | -\$398,306 | -\$559,692 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$4,950,586 | -\$380,394 | -\$541,780 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,863,032 | -\$467,948 | -\$629,334 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,866,326 | -\$464,654 | -\$626,040 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,871,059 | -\$459,921 | -\$621,307 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,878,897 | -\$452,083 | -\$613,469 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,816,745 | -\$514,235 | -\$675,621 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,819,066 | -\$511,914 | -\$673,300 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,823,090 | -\$507,890 | -\$669,276 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,828,219 | -\$502,761 | -\$664,147 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,779,230 | -\$551,750 | -\$713,136 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,781,161 | -\$549,819 | -\$711,205 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,784,254 | -\$546,726 | -\$708,112 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,788,601 | -\$542,379 | -\$703,765 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,750,914 | -\$580,066 | -\$741,452 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,752,681 | -\$578,299 | -\$739,685 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,755,442 | -\$575,538 | -\$736,924 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,758,488 | -\$572,492 | -\$733,878 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,994,591 | -\$336,389 | -\$497,775 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,007,864 | -\$323,116 | -\$484,502 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,034,727 | -\$296,253 | -\$457,639 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,076,331 | -\$254,649 | -\$416,035 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,888,333 | -\$442,647 | -\$604,033 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,894,902 | -\$436,078 | -\$597,464 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | $14 \text { in }$ | 2 in | $500$ | 60 | \$4,907,404 | -\$423,576 | -\$584,962 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | $14 \mathrm{in}$ | 2 in | $500$ | 80 | \$4,924,987 | -\$405,993 | -\$567,379 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,824,485 | -\$506,495 | -\$667,881 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,828,634 | -\$502,346 | -\$663,732 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,835,243 | -\$495,737 | -\$657,123 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,844,707 | -\$486,273 | -\$647,659 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,783,094 | -\$547,886 | -\$709,272 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,785,394 | -\$545,586 | -\$706,972 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,789,028 | -\$541,952 | -\$703,338 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,794,740 | -\$536,240 | -\$697,626 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,753,266 | -\$577,714 | -\$739,100 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,754,421 | -\$576,559 | -\$737,945 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,757,028 | -\$573,952 | -\$735,338 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,761,068 | -\$569,912 | -\$731,298 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$4,957,350 | -\$373,630 | -\$535,016 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$4,966,901 | -\$364,079 | -\$525,465 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,003,937 | -\$327,043 | -\$488,429 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,085,684 | -\$245,296 | -\$406,682 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,889,454 | -\$441,526 | -\$602,912 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,892,862 | -\$438,118 | -\$599,504 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,900,715 | -\$430,265 | -\$591,651 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$4,917,615 | -\$413,365 | -\$574,751 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,837,147 | -\$493,833 | -\$655,219 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,840,269 | -\$490,711 | -\$652,097 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,844,824 | -\$486,156 | -\$647,542 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,851,409 | -\$479,571 | -\$640,957 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,795,404 | -\$535,576 | -\$696,962 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,797,584 | -\$533,396 | -\$694,782 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,801,313 | -\$529,667 | -\$691,053 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,805,844 | -\$525,136 | -\$686,522 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,763,894 | -\$567,086 | -\$728,472 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,765,741 | -\$565,239 | -\$726,625 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,768,273 | -\$562,707 | -\$724,093 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,772,105 | -\$558,875 | -\$720,261 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,248,884 | -\$82,096 | -\$243,482 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | $13 \text { in }$ | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,271,913 | -\$59,067 | -\$220,453 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | $450$ | 60 | \$5,317,511 | -\$13,469 | -\$174,855 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | $13 \mathrm{in}$ | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,382,919 | \$51,939 | -\$109,447 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,015,270 | -\$315,710 | -\$477,096 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,027,296 | -\$303,684 | -\$465,070 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,053,591 | -\$277,389 | -\$438,775 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,092,565 | -\$238,415 | -\$399,801 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,888,427 | -\$442,553 | -\$603,939 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,896,784 | -\$434,196 | -\$595,582 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,909,954 | -\$421,026 | -\$582,412 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,930,934 | -\$400,046 | -\$561,432 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,816,011 | -\$514,969 | -\$676,355 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,820,254 | -\$510,726 | -\$672,112 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,828,266 | -\$502,714 | -\$664,100 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,839,035 | -\$491,945 | -\$653,331 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,772,147 | -\$558,833 | -\$720,219 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,774,546 | -\$556,434 | -\$717,820 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,779,023 | -\$551,957 | -\$713,343 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,784,916 | -\$546,064 | -\$707,450 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,131,030 | -\$199,950 | -\$361,336 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,226,444 | -\$104,536 | -\$265,922 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,371,571 | \$40,591 | -\$120,795 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,521,950 | \$190,970 | \$29,584 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$4,931,717 | -\$399,263 | -\$560,649 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$4,948,696 | -\$382,284 | -\$543,670 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$4,998,766 | -\$332,214 | -\$493,600 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,088,704 | -\$242,276 | -\$403,662 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,863,490 | -\$467,490 | -\$628,876 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,867,238 | -\$463,742 | -\$625,128 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$4,876,740 | -\$454,240 | -\$615,626 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$4,900,818 | -\$430,162 | -\$591,548 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,814,446 | -\$516,534 | -\$677,920 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,817,161 | -\$513,819 | -\$675,205 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,821,556 | -\$509,424 | -\$670,810 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,828,671 | -\$502,309 | -\$663,695 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,778,521 | -\$552,459 | -\$713,845 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,780,127 | -\$550,853 | -\$712,239 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,783,314 | -\$547,666 | -\$709,052 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,787,659 | -\$543,321 | -\$704,707 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,767,039 | \$436,059 | \$274,673 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,788,205 | \$457,225 | \$295,839 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,831,563 | \$500,583 | \$339,197 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,888,200 | \$557,220 | \$395,834 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,361,744 | \$30,764 | -\$130,622 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,382,067 | \$51,087 | -\$110,299 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,421,104 | \$90,124 | -\$71,262 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,475,387 | \$144,407 | -\$16,979 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,088,559 | -\$242,421 | -\$403,807 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,102,710 | -\$228,270 | -\$389,656 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,128,427 | -\$202,553 | -\$363,939 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,165,314 | -\$165,666 | -\$327,052 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,925,501 | -\$405,479 | -\$566,865 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,931,953 | -\$399,027 | -\$560,413 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,946,754 | -\$384,226 | -\$545,612 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,970,896 | -\$360,084 | -\$521,470 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,830,738 | -\$500,242 | -\$661,628 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,836,856 | -\$494,124 | -\$655,510 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,846,242 | -\$484,738 | -\$646,124 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,858,775 | -\$472,205 | -\$633,591 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,960,402 | \$629,422 | \$468,036 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,039,425 | \$708,445 | \$547,059 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,133,746 | \$802,766 | \$641,380 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,217,622 | \$886,642 | \$725,256 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,315,347 | -\$15,633 | -\$177,019 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,406,479 | \$75,499 | -\$85,887 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,531,852 | \$200,872 | \$39,486 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,659,642 | \$328,662 | \$167,276 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$4,948,055 | -\$382,925 | -\$544,311 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$4,988,343 | -\$342,637 | -\$504,023 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,071,153 | -\$259,827 | -\$421,213 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,179,259 | -\$151,721 | -\$313,107 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,845,122 | -\$485,858 | -\$647,244 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,852,010 | -\$478,970 | -\$640,356 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,872,528 | -\$458,452 | -\$619,838 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,914,590 | -\$416,390 | -\$577,776 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,797,187 | -\$533,793 | -\$695,179 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,800,015 | -\$530,965 | -\$692,351 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,805,627 | -\$525,353 | -\$686,739 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,816,188 | -\$514,792 | -\$676,178 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,359,000 | \$1,028,020 | \$866,634 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  | Air Content |  |  |  |  |  |  | Comparison $\mathbf{1}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,901,347 | -\$429,633 | -\$591,019 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,955,508 | -\$375,472 | -\$536,858 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,033,727 | -\$297,253 | -\$458,639 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,797,516 | \$1,466,536 | \$1,305,150 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,802,347 | \$1,471,367 | \$1,309,981 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,816,113 | \$1,485,133 | \$1,323,747 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,836,998 | \$1,506,018 | \$1,344,632 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,524,138 | \$1,193,158 | \$1,031,772 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,529,858 | \$1,198,878 | \$1,037,492 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,542,181 | \$1,211,201 | \$1,049,815 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,560,495 | \$1,229,515 | \$1,068,129 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,196,307 | \$865,327 | \$703,941 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,203,306 | \$872,326 | \$710,940 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,219,506 | \$888,526 | \$727,140 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,243,565 | \$912,585 | \$751,199 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,841,788 | \$510,808 | \$349,422 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,849,513 | \$518,533 | \$357,147 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,868,039 | \$537,059 | \$375,673 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,895,429 | \$564,449 | \$403,063 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,509,799 | \$178,819 | \$17,433 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,520,244 | \$189,264 | \$27,878 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,541,252 | \$210,272 | \$48,886 |
| 11.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,570,785 | \$239,805 | \$78,419 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,165,597 | -\$165,383 | -\$326,769 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,168,558 | -\$162,422 | -\$323,808 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,173,245 | -\$157,735 | -\$319,121 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,179,436 | -\$151,544 | -\$312,930 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,088,287 | -\$242,693 | -\$404,079 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,089,909 | -\$241,071 | -\$402,457 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | $500$ | 60 | \$5,093,943 | -\$237,037 | -\$398,423 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | $500$ | 80 | \$5,097,820 | -\$233,160 | -\$394,546 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,019,574 | -\$311,406 | -\$472,792 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,021,677 | -\$309,303 | -\$470,689 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,024,856 | -\$306,124 | -\$467,510 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,029,524 | -\$301,456 | -\$462,842 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,960,801 | -\$370,179 | -\$531,565 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,962,641 | -\$368,339 | -\$529,725 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,965,156 | -\$365,824 | -\$527,210 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,968,558 | -\$362,422 | -\$523,808 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,911,049 | -\$419,931 | -\$581,317 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,912,184 | -\$418,796 | -\$580,182 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,914,511 | -\$416,469 | -\$577,855 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,917,390 | -\$413,590 | -\$574,976 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,165,884 | -\$165,096 | -\$326,482 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,169,791 | -\$161,189 | -\$322,575 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,175,566 | -\$155,414 | -\$316,800 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,184,047 | -\$146,933 | -\$308,319 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,087,823 | -\$243,157 | -\$404,543 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,090,115 | -\$240,865 | -\$402,251 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,094,788 | -\$236,192 | -\$397,578 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,099,740 | -\$231,240 | -\$392,626 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,021,034 | -\$309,946 | -\$471,332 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,023,180 | -\$307,800 | -\$469,186 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,025,805 | -\$305,175 | -\$466,561 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,029,985 | -\$300,995 | -\$462,381 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,962,081 | -\$368,899 | -\$530,285 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,963,287 | -\$367,693 | -\$529,079 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,965,727 | -\$365,253 | -\$526,639 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,969,871 | -\$361,109 | -\$522,495 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,911,732 | -\$419,248 | -\$580,634 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,913,053 | -\$417,927 | -\$579,313 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,915,547 | -\$415,433 | -\$576,819 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,918,130 | -\$412,850 | -\$574,236 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,203,819 | -\$127,161 | -\$288,547 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,206,513 | -\$124,467 | -\$285,853 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,211,660 | -\$119,320 | -\$280,706 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,217,943 | -\$113,037 | -\$274,423 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,122,061 | -\$208,919 | -\$370,305 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,124,906 | -\$206,074 | -\$367,460 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,128,662 | -\$202,318 | -\$363,704 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,133,951 | -\$197,029 | -\$358,415 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,050,789 | -\$280,191 | -\$441,577 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,052,077 | -\$278,903 | -\$440,289 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,056,204 | -\$274,776 | -\$436,162 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,059,908 | -\$271,072 | -\$432,458 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,987,076 | -\$343,904 | -\$505,290 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,989,253 | -\$341,727 | -\$503,113 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,991,904 | -\$339,076 | -\$500,462 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,995,711 | -\$335,269 | -\$496,655 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,934,215 | -\$396,765 | -\$558,151 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,935,751 | -\$395,229 | -\$556,615 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,937,945 | -\$393,035 | -\$554,421 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,941,244 | -\$389,736 | -\$551,122 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,210,485 | -\$120,495 | -\$281,881 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,215,765 | -\$115,215 | -\$276,601 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,224,100 | -\$106,880 | -\$268,266 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,237,938 | -\$93,042 | -\$254,428 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,124,424 | -\$206,556 | -\$367,942 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,126,833 | -\$204,147 | -\$365,533 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,132,361 | -\$198,619 | -\$360,005 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,140,112 | -\$190,868 | -\$352,254 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,051,459 | -\$279,521 | -\$440,907 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,053,406 | -\$277,574 | -\$438,960 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,057,286 | -\$273,694 | -\$435,080 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,062,166 | -\$268,814 | -\$430,200 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$4,988,266 | -\$342,714 | -\$504,100 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$4,990,311 | -\$340,669 | -\$502,055 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$4,992,198 | -\$338,782 | -\$500,168 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$4,996,064 | -\$334,916 | -\$496,302 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,934,947 | -\$396,033 | -\$557,419 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,936,080 | -\$394,900 | -\$556,286 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | $650$ | 60 | \$4,938,781 | -\$392,199 | -\$553,585 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | $650$ | 80 | \$4,942,111 | -\$388,869 | -\$550,255 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,243,546 | -\$87,434 | -\$248,820 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,247,276 | -\$83,704 | -\$245,090 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,253,570 | -\$77,410 | -\$238,796 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,267,016 | -\$63,964 | -\$225,350 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,158,260 | -\$172,720 | -\$334,106 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab)$\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,161,803 | -\$169,177 | -\$330,563 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,166,118 | -\$164,862 | -\$326,248 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,171,648 | -\$159,332 | -\$320,718 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,082,707 | -\$248,273 | -\$409,659 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,085,233 | -\$245,747 | -\$407,133 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,087,955 | -\$243,025 | -\$404,411 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,092,647 | -\$238,333 | -\$399,719 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,016,097 | -\$314,883 | -\$476,269 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,017,445 | -\$313,535 | -\$474,921 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,020,577 | -\$310,403 | -\$471,789 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,024,313 | -\$306,667 | -\$468,053 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,959,071 | -\$371,909 | -\$533,295 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,961,049 | -\$369,931 | -\$531,317 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,963,536 | -\$367,444 | -\$528,830 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,966,917 | -\$364,063 | -\$525,449 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,288,825 | -\$42,155 | -\$203,541 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,300,453 | -\$30,527 | -\$191,913 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,319,496 | -\$11,484 | -\$172,870 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,353,813 | \$22,833 | -\$138,553 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,173,267 | -\$157,713 | -\$319,099 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,178,805 | -\$152,175 | -\$313,561 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,187,133 | -\$143,847 | -\$305,233 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,201,508 | -\$129,472 | -\$290,858 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,086,982 | -\$243,998 | -\$405,384 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,089,845 | -\$241,135 | -\$402,521 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,095,992 | -\$234,988 | -\$396,374 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,103,656 | -\$227,324 | -\$388,710 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,017,650 | -\$313,330 | -\$474,716 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,019,725 | -\$311,255 | -\$472,641 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,023,243 | -\$307,737 | -\$469,123 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,028,075 | -\$302,905 | -\$464,291 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,959,841 | -\$371,139 | -\$532,525 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,961,802 | -\$369,178 | -\$530,564 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,964,212 | -\$366,768 | -\$528,154 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,968,288 | -\$362,692 | -\$524,078 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,290,878 | -\$40,102 | -\$201,488 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,298,625 | -\$32,355 | -\$193,741 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,323,909 | -\$7,071 | -\$168,457 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,380,653 | \$49,673 | -\$111,713 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,196,807 | -\$134,173 | -\$295,559 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,200,336 | -\$130,644 | -\$292,030 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,206,848 | -\$124,132 | -\$285,518 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,219,632 | -\$111,348 | -\$272,734 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,117,472 | -\$213,508 | -\$374,894 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,120,108 | -\$210,872 | -\$372,258 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,124,232 | -\$206,748 | -\$368,134 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,129,287 | -\$201,693 | -\$363,079 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,046,134 | -\$284,846 | -\$446,232 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,048,140 | -\$282,840 | -\$444,226 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,050,831 | -\$280,149 | -\$441,535 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,055,229 | -\$275,751 | -\$437,137 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,985,444 | -\$345,536 | -\$506,922 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$4,987,188 | -\$343,792 | -\$505,178 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$4,989,866 | -\$341,114 | -\$502,500 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$4,993,420 | -\$337,560 | -\$498,946 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,493,722 | \$162,742 | \$1,356 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,515,274 | \$184,294 | \$22,908 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,552,259 | \$221,279 | \$59,893 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,599,860 | \$268,880 | \$107,494 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,280,942 | -\$50,038 | -\$211,424 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,290,249 | -\$40,731 | -\$202,117 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,311,671 | -\$19,309 | -\$180,695 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,344,178 | \$13,198 | -\$148,188 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,149,191 | -\$181,789 | -\$343,175 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,155,520 | -\$175,460 | -\$336,846 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,165,882 | -\$165,098 | -\$326,484 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | $13 \mathrm{in}$ | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,181,083 | -\$149,897 | -\$311,283 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,058,938 | -\$272,042 | -\$433,428 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,062,346 | -\$268,634 | -\$430,020 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,067,930 | -\$263,050 | -\$424,436 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,076,895 | -\$254,085 | -\$415,471 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$4,989,607 | -\$341,373 | -\$502,759 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  | Air Content |  |  |  |  |  |  | Comparison $\mathbf{1}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab)\$5,492,366 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,160,910 | -\$170,070 | -\$331,456 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,172,280 | -\$158,700 | -\$320,086 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,192,429 | -\$138,551 | -\$299,937 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,048,053 | -\$282,927 | -\$444,313 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,052,619 | -\$278,361 | -\$439,747 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,061,359 | -\$269,621 | -\$431,007 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,071,243 | -\$259,737 | -\$421,123 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,045,805 | \$714,825 | \$553,439 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,117,035 | \$786,055 | \$624,669 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,202,325 | \$871,345 | \$709,959 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,278,342 | \$947,362 | \$785,976 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,519,268 | \$188,288 | \$26,902 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,586,433 | \$255,453 | \$94,067 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,687,808 | \$356,828 | \$195,442 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,792,883 | \$461,903 | \$300,517 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,234,389 | -\$96,591 | -\$257,977 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,260,845 | -\$70,135 | -\$231,521 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,315,711 | -\$15,269 | -\$176,655 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,395,520 | \$64,540 | -\$96,846 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,119,907 | -\$211,073 | -\$372,459 |
| $11.00 \%$ | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,125,208 | -\$205,772 | -\$367,158 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,139,738 | -\$191,242 | -\$352,628 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,169,205 | -\$161,775 | -\$323,161 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,046,382 | -\$284,598 | -\$445,984 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,048,662 | -\$282,318 | -\$443,704 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,052,846 | -\$278,134 | -\$439,520 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,060,321 | -\$270,659 | -\$432,045 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,411,437 | \$1,080,457 | \$919,071 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,424,277 | \$1,093,297 | \$931,911 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | $450$ | 60 | \$6,448,160 | \$1,117,180 | \$955,794 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | $450$ | 80 | \$6,476,959 | \$1,145,979 | \$984,593 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,052,034 | \$721,054 | \$559,668 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,065,051 | \$734,071 | \$572,685 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,091,587 | \$760,607 | \$599,221 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,126,755 | \$795,775 | \$634,389 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,707,728 | \$376,748 | \$215,362 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,720,881 | \$389,901 | \$228,515 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,747,198 | \$416,218 | \$254,832 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,781,182 | \$450,202 | \$288,816 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,423,086 | \$92,106 | -\$69,280 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,435,658 | \$104,678 | -\$56,708 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,456,089 | \$125,109 | -\$36,277 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,482,087 | \$151,107 | -\$10,279 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,217,153 | -\$113,827 | -\$275,213 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,224,768 | -\$106,212 | -\$267,598 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,240,572 | -\$90,408 | -\$251,794 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,263,247 | -\$67,733 | -\$229,119 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,667,210 | \$1,336,230 | \$1,174,844 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,688,031 | \$1,357,051 | \$1,195,665 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,715,164 | \$1,384,184 | \$1,222,798 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,740,729 | \$1,409,749 | \$1,248,363 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,263,784 | \$932,804 | \$771,418 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,310,193 | \$979,213 | \$817,827 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,367,506 | \$1,036,526 | \$875,140 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,419,513 | \$1,088,533 | \$927,147 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,763,397 | \$432,417 | \$271,031 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,823,024 | \$492,044 | \$330,658 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,907,632 | \$576,652 | \$415,266 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,991,475 | \$660,495 | \$499,109 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,337,264 | \$6,284 | -\$155,102 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,380,815 | \$49,835 | -\$111,551 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,457,302 | \$126,322 | -\$35,064 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,545,974 | \$214,994 | \$53,608 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,116,874 | -\$214,106 | -\$375,492 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,135,143 | -\$195,837 | -\$357,223 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | $650$ | 60 | \$5,171,467 | -\$159,513 | -\$320,899 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,228,304 | -\$102,676 | -\$264,062 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,814,530 | \$1,483,550 | \$1,322,164 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,820,007 | \$1,489,027 | \$1,327,641 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,834,134 | \$1,503,154 | \$1,341,768 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,855,183 | \$1,524,203 | \$1,362,817 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,555,254 | \$1,224,274 | \$1,062,888 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,561,980 | \$1,231,000 | \$1,069,614 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,574,317 | \$1,243,337 | \$1,081,951 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,592,962 | \$1,261,982 | \$1,100,596 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,250,609 | \$919,629 | \$758,243 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,258,704 | \$927,724 | \$766,338 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,276,452 | \$945,472 | \$784,086 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,302,449 | \$971,469 | \$810,083 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,927,946 | \$596,966 | \$435,580 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,935,295 | \$604,315 | \$442,929 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,952,350 | \$621,370 | \$459,984 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,978,507 | \$647,527 | \$486,141 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,624,567 | \$293,587 | \$132,201 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,634,479 | \$303,499 | \$142,113 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,652,819 | \$321,839 | \$160,453 |
| 11.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,678,076 | \$347,096 | \$185,710 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,451,720 | \$120,740 | -\$40,646 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,466,544 | \$135,564 | -\$25,822 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,488,018 | \$157,038 | -\$4,348 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,512,594 | \$181,614 | \$20,228 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,536,734 | \$205,754 | \$44,368 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,349,758 | \$18,778 | -\$142,608 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,368,876 | \$37,896 | -\$123,490 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,390,993 | \$60,013 | -\$101,373 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,234,632 | -\$96,348 | -\$257,734 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,245,654 | -\$85,326 | -\$246,712 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,262,053 | -\$68,927 | -\$230,313 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,281,585 | -\$49,395 | -\$210,781 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,141,111 | -\$189,869 | -\$351,255 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,151,101 | -\$179,879 | -\$341,265 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,166,005 | -\$164,975 | -\$326,361 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,183,340 | -\$147,640 | -\$309,026 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,057,154 | -\$273,826 | -\$435,212 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,066,414 | -\$264,566 | -\$425,952 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,080,030 | -\$250,950 | -\$412,336 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,094,794 | -\$236,186 | -\$397,572 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,468,960 | \$137,980 | -\$23,406 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,480,728 | \$149,748 | -\$11,638 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,500,172 | \$169,192 | \$7,806 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,524,535 | \$193,555 | \$32,169 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,352,818 | \$21,838 | -\$139,548 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,363,203 | \$32,223 | -\$129,163 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,379,834 | \$48,854 | -\$112,532 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,400,326 | \$69,346 | -\$92,040 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,248,857 | -\$82,123 | -\$243,509 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,258,412 | -\$72,568 | -\$233,954 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,273,099 | -\$57,881 | -\$219,267 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,291,531 | -\$39,449 | -\$200,835 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,154,362 | -\$176,618 | -\$338,004 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,162,306 | -\$168,674 | -\$330,060 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,175,637 | -\$155,343 | -\$316,729 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,191,324 | -\$139,656 | -\$301,042 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,069,528 | -\$261,452 | -\$422,838 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,076,845 | -\$254,135 | -\$415,521 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,088,711 | -\$242,269 | -\$403,655 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,103,072 | -\$227,908 | -\$389,294 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,507,335 | \$176,355 | \$14,969 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,523,200 | \$192,220 | \$30,834 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,545,535 | \$214,555 | \$53,169 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,570,727 | \$239,747 | \$78,361 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,388,206 | \$57,226 | -\$104,160 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,401,599 | \$70,619 | -\$90,767 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,421,420 | \$90,440 | -\$70,946 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,444,004 | \$113,024 | -\$48,362 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,281,055 | -\$49,925 | -\$211,311 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,292,841 | -\$38,139 | -\$199,525 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | $15 \mathrm{in}$ | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,310,845 | -\$20,135 | -\$181,521 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,330,646 | -\$334 | -\$161,720 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,183,602 | -\$147,378 | -\$308,764 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,194,026 | -\$136,954 | -\$298,340 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,209,146 | -\$121,834 | -\$283,220 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,226,844 | -\$104,136 | -\$265,522 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,096,596 | -\$234,384 | -\$395,770 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,106,167 | -\$224,813 | -\$386,199 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,120,334 | -\$210,646 | -\$372,032 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,136,257 | -\$194,723 | -\$356,109 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,528,273 | \$197,293 | \$35,907 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,540,596 | \$209,616 | \$48,230 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,561,252 | \$230,272 | \$68,886 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,588,532 | \$257,552 | \$96,166 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,405,171 | \$74,191 | -\$87,195 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,415,868 | \$84,888 | -\$76,498 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,433,639 | \$102,659 | -\$58,727 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,455,633 | \$124,653 | -\$36,733 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,296,549 | -\$34,431 | -\$195,817 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,306,006 | -\$24,974 | -\$186,360 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,321,201 | -\$9,779 | -\$171,165 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,339,899 | \$8,919 | -\$152,467 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,197,319 | -\$133,661 | -\$295,047 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,205,900 | -\$125,080 | -\$286,466 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,219,179 | -\$111,801 | -\$273,187 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,236,893 | -\$94,087 | -\$255,473 |
| $6.50 \%$ | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,109,609 | -\$221,371 | -\$382,757 |
| $6.50 \%$ | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,116,769 | -\$214,211 | -\$375,597 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,129,062 | -\$201,918 | -\$363,304 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,143,752 | -\$187,228 | -\$348,614 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,566,059 | \$235,079 | \$73,693 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,581,255 | \$250,275 | \$88,889 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,605,236 | \$274,256 | \$112,870 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,633,524 | \$302,544 | \$141,158 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,441,457 | \$110,477 | -\$50,909 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | $500$ | 40 | \$5,455,045 | \$124,065 | -\$37,321 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,476,563 | \$145,583 | -\$15,803 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,499,671 | \$168,691 | \$7,305 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,330,052 | -\$928 | -\$162,314 |
| $6.50 \%$ | 0.50\% | $14 \text { in }$ | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,342,682 | \$11,702 | -\$149,684 |
| $6.50 \%$ | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,361,007 | \$30,027 | -\$131,359 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,381,488 | \$50,508 | -\$110,878 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,227,950 | -\$103,030 | -\$264,416 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,238,983 | -\$91,997 | -\$253,383 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,255,819 | -\$75,161 | -\$236,547 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,274,223 | -\$56,757 | -\$218,143 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,137,836 | -\$193,144 | -\$354,530 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,147,209 | -\$183,771 | -\$345,157 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,161,960 | -\$169,020 | -\$330,406 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,178,566 | -\$152,414 | -\$313,800 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,602,176 | \$271,196 | \$109,810 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,618,311 | \$287,331 | \$125,945 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,644,696 | \$313,716 | \$152,330 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,677,300 | \$346,320 | \$184,934 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,463,897 | \$132,917 | -\$28,469 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,475,769 | \$144,789 | -\$16,597 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,495,702 | \$164,722 | \$3,336 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,520,978 | \$189,998 | \$28,612 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,347,305 | \$16,325 | -\$145,061 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,357,681 | \$26,701 | -\$134,685 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,373,704 | \$42,724 | -\$118,662 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,394,329 | \$63,349 | -\$98,037 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,242,665 | -\$88,315 | -\$249,701 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,251,453 | -\$79,527 | -\$240,913 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,265,869 | -\$65,111 | -\$226,497 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,283,477 | -\$47,503 | -\$208,889 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,151,388 | -\$179,592 | -\$340,978 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,159,026 | -\$171,954 | -\$333,340 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,171,766 | -\$159,214 | -\$320,600 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,187,969 | -\$143,011 | -\$304,397 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,629,494 | \$298,514 | \$137,128 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | $450$ | 40 | \$5,647,248 | \$316,268 | \$154,882 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,675,165 | \$344,185 | \$182,799 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,712,797 | \$381,817 | \$220,431 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,497,206 | \$166,226 | \$4,840 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,511,668 | \$180,688 | \$19,302 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,533,778 | \$202,798 | \$41,412 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,560,399 | \$229,419 | \$68,033 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,380,696 | \$49,716 | -\$111,670 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,392,927 | \$61,947 | -\$99,439 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,412,867 | \$81,887 | -\$79,499 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,434,735 | \$103,755 | -\$57,631 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,274,630 | -\$56,350 | -\$217,736 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,286,356 | -\$44,624 | -\$206,010 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,303,317 | -\$27,663 | -\$189,049 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,322,113 | -\$8,867 | -\$170,253 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,180,154 | -\$150,826 | -\$312,212 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,190,647 | -\$140,333 | -\$301,719 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,205,701 | -\$125,279 | -\$286,665 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,222,949 | -\$108,031 | -\$269,417 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,736,398 | \$405,418 | \$244,032 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,753,888 | \$422,908 | \$261,522 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,787,421 | \$456,441 | \$295,055 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,831,026 | \$500,046 | \$338,660 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,552,058 | \$221,078 | \$59,692 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,567,556 | \$236,576 | \$75,190 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,592,856 | \$261,876 | \$100,490 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,624,286 | \$293,306 | \$131,920 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,412,166 | \$81,186 | -\$80,200 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,423,560 | \$92,580 | -\$68,806 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,443,084 | \$112,104 | -\$49,282 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,468,218 | \$137,238 | -\$24,148 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,295,432 | -\$35,548 | -\$196,934 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,304,728 | -\$26,252 | -\$187,638 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,320,666 | -\$10,314 | -\$171,700 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,340,581 | \$9,601 | -\$151,785 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,196,118 | -\$134,862 | -\$296,248 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,204,341 | -\$126,639 | -\$288,025 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,217,825 | -\$113,155 | -\$274,541 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,235,278 | -\$95,702 | -\$257,088 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,717,346 | \$386,366 | \$224,980 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,743,902 | \$412,922 | \$251,536 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,801,613 | \$470,633 | \$309,247 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,883,079 | \$552,099 | \$390,713 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,560,823 | \$229,843 | \$68,457 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,578,227 | \$247,247 | \$85,861 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,605,493 | \$274,513 | \$113,127 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,644,249 | \$313,269 | \$151,883 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,434,983 | \$104,003 | -\$57,383 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,448,887 | \$117,907 | -\$43,479 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,469,539 | \$138,559 | -\$22,827 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,494,755 | \$163,775 | \$2,389 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,323,205 | -\$7,775 | -\$169,161 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,335,158 | \$4,178 | -\$157,208 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,353,035 | \$22,055 | -\$139,331 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,373,803 | \$42,823 | -\$118,563 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,224,567 | -\$106,413 | -\$267,799 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,235,503 | -\$95,477 | -\$256,863 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,251,938 | -\$79,042 | -\$240,428 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,269,966 | -\$61,014 | -\$222,400 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,011,830 | \$680,850 | \$519,464 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,031,645 | \$700,665 | \$539,279 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,068,161 | \$737,181 | \$575,795 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,115,742 | \$784,762 | \$623,376 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,734,606 | \$403,626 | \$242,240 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,751,579 | \$420,599 | \$259,213 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,782,654 | \$451,674 | \$290,288 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,821,974 | \$490,994 | \$329,608 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,533,553 | \$202,573 | \$41,187 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,546,789 | \$215,809 | \$54,423 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,569,933 | \$238,953 | \$77,567 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,602,692 | \$271,712 | \$110,326 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,379,010 | \$48,030 | -\$113,356 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,391,067 | \$60,087 | -\$101,299 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,410,804 | \$79,824 | -\$81,562 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,435,538 | \$104,558 | -\$56,828 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,258,202 | -\$72,778 | -\$234,164 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,267,265 | -\$63,715 | -\$225,101 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,284,033 | -\$46,947 | -\$208,333 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,304,008 | -\$26,972 | -\$188,358 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,037,720 | \$706,740 | \$545,354 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,113,896 | \$782,916 | \$621,530 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,203,976 | \$872,996 | \$711,610 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,286,453 | \$955,473 | \$794,087 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,676,328 | \$345,348 | \$183,962 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,716,754 | \$385,774 | \$224,388 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,790,436 | \$459,456 | \$298,070 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,882,585 | \$551,605 | \$390,219 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,505,421 | \$174,441 | \$13,055 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,523,184 | \$192,204 | \$30,818 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,554,187 | \$223,207 | \$61,821 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,604,227 | \$273,247 | \$111,861 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,378,670 | \$47,690 | -\$113,696 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,391,543 | \$60,563 | -\$100,823 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,412,054 | \$81,074 | -\$80,312 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,438,028 | \$107,048 | -\$54,338 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,272,922 | -\$58,058 | -\$219,444 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,284,354 | -\$46,626 | -\$208,012 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,301,191 | -\$29,789 | -\$191,175 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,321,250 | -\$9,730 | -\$171,116 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,429,920 | \$1,098,940 | \$937,554 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,440,923 | \$1,109,943 | \$948,557 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,462,660 | \$1,131,680 | \$970,294 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,493,210 | \$1,162,230 | \$1,000,844 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,103,857 | \$772,877 | \$611,491 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,120,349 | \$789,369 | \$627,983 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,147,761 | \$816,781 | \$655,395 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,183,320 | \$852,340 | \$690,954 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,806,870 | \$475,890 | \$314,504 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,819,981 | \$489,001 | \$327,615 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,847,779 | \$516,799 | \$355,413 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,882,598 | \$551,618 | \$390,232 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,566,865 | \$235,885 | \$74,499 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,579,807 | \$248,827 | \$87,441 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,601,656 | \$270,676 | \$109,290 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,632,220 | \$301,240 | \$139,854 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,388,280 | \$57,300 | -\$104,086 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,398,392 | \$67,412 | -\$93,974 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,416,904 | \$85,924 | -\$75,462 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,440,969 | \$109,989 | -\$51,397 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,663,061 | \$1,332,081 | \$1,170,695 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,684,557 | \$1,353,577 | \$1,192,191 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,712,825 | \$1,381,845 | \$1,220,459 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,739,763 | \$1,408,783 | \$1,247,397 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,242,832 | \$911,852 | \$750,466 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,291,204 | \$960,224 | \$798,838 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,352,104 | \$1,021,124 | \$859,738 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,408,163 | \$1,077,183 | \$915,797 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,766,301 | \$435,321 | \$273,935 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,826,629 | \$495,649 | \$334,263 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,913,276 | \$582,296 | \$420,910 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,000,417 | \$669,437 | \$508,051 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,480,386 | \$149,406 | -\$11,980 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,509,163 | \$178,183 | \$16,797 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,562,690 | \$231,710 | \$70,324 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,635,211 | \$304,231 | \$142,845 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,337,390 | \$6,410 | -\$154,976 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,351,659 | \$20,679 | -\$140,707 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,375,936 | \$44,956 | -\$116,430 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,413,002 | \$82,022 | -\$79,364 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,813,586 | \$1,482,606 | \$1,321,220 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,819,342 | \$1,488,362 | \$1,326,976 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,834,093 | \$1,503,113 | \$1,341,727 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,856,323 | \$1,525,343 | \$1,363,957 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,556,011 | \$1,225,031 | \$1,063,645 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | $10 \text { in }$ | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,563,254 | \$1,232,274 | \$1,070,888 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,577,031 | \$1,246,051 | \$1,084,665 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,595,797 | \$1,264,817 | \$1,103,431 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,271,322 | \$940,342 | \$778,956 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,278,079 | \$947,099 | \$785,713 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,294,157 | \$963,177 | \$801,791 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,317,434 | \$986,454 | \$825,068 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,969,010 | \$638,030 | \$476,644 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,979,647 | \$648,667 | \$487,281 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,000,409 | \$669,429 | \$508,043 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,028,328 | \$697,348 | \$535,962 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,693,954 | \$362,974 | \$201,588 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,705,346 | \$374,366 | \$212,980 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,726,972 | \$395,992 | \$234,606 |
| 6.50\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,755,578 | \$424,598 | \$263,212 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,653,984 | \$323,004 | \$161,618 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,662,271 | \$331,291 | \$169,905 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,674,295 | \$343,315 | \$181,929 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,690,382 | \$359,402 | \$198,016 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,522,562 | \$191,582 | \$30,196 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,529,718 | \$198,738 | \$37,352 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,540,301 | \$209,321 | \$47,935 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,553,756 | \$222,776 | \$61,390 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,405,247 | \$74,267 | -\$87,119 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,410,756 | \$79,776 | -\$81,610 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,420,748 | \$89,768 | -\$71,618 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,432,189 | \$101,209 | -\$60,177 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,297,462 | -\$33,518 | -\$194,904 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,302,150 | -\$28,830 | -\$190,216 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,310,223 | -\$20,757 | -\$182,143 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,321,522 | -\$9,458 | -\$170,844 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,201,556 | -\$129,424 | -\$290,810 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,206,315 | -\$124,665 | -\$286,051 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,214,333 | -\$116,647 | -\$278,033 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,223,092 | -\$107,888 | -\$269,274 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,657,778 | \$326,798 | \$165,412 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,666,052 | \$335,072 | \$173,686 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,678,178 | \$347,198 | \$185,812 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,694,266 | \$363,286 | \$201,900 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,527,055 | \$196,075 | \$34,689 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,532,415 | \$201,435 | \$40,049 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,542,955 | \$211,975 | \$50,589 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,557,814 | \$226,834 | \$65,448 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,408,262 | \$77,282 | -\$84,104 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,414,075 | \$83,095 | -\$78,291 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,423,168 | \$92,188 | -\$69,198 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,435,050 | \$104,070 | -\$57,316 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,300,155 | -\$30,825 | -\$192,211 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,305,768 | -\$25,212 | -\$186,598 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,314,181 | -\$16,799 | -\$178,185 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,324,343 | -\$6,637 | -\$168,023 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,204,958 | -\$126,022 | -\$287,408 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,208,995 | -\$121,985 | -\$283,371 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,216,248 | -\$114,732 | -\$276,118 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,225,697 | -\$105,283 | -\$266,669 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,719,138 | \$388,158 | \$226,772 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,726,795 | \$395,815 | \$234,429 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,739,527 | \$408,547 | \$247,161 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,755,292 | \$424,312 | \$262,926 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,581,874 | \$250,894 | \$89,508 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,588,432 | \$257,452 | \$96,066 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,599,703 | \$268,723 | \$107,337 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,614,189 | \$283,209 | \$121,823 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,458,486 | \$127,506 | -\$33,880 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,465,599 | \$134,619 | -\$26,767 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,474,992 | \$144,012 | -\$17,374 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,487,311 | \$156,331 | -\$5,055 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,346,932 | \$15,952 | -\$145,434 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,351,825 | \$20,845 | -\$140,541 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,361,146 | \$30,166 | -\$131,220 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,371,085 | \$40,105 | -\$121,281 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,246,407 | -\$84,573 | -\$245,959 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,252,056 | -\$78,924 | -\$240,310 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,258,996 | -\$71,984 | -\$233,370 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,269,787 | -\$61,193 | -\$222,579 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,725,285 | \$394,305 | \$232,919 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,732,335 | \$401,355 | \$239,969 |
| $6.50 \%$ | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,746,544 | \$415,564 | \$254,178 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,764,187 | \$433,207 | \$271,821 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,585,160 | \$254,180 | \$92,794 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,593,238 | \$262,258 | \$100,872 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,603,316 | \$272,336 | \$110,950 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,618,264 | \$287,284 | \$125,898 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,462,431 | \$131,451 | -\$29,935 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,467,286 | \$136,306 | -\$25,080 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,477,709 | \$146,729 | -\$14,657 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,490,884 | \$159,904 | -\$1,482 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,349,681 | \$18,701 | -\$142,685 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,354,882 | \$23,902 | -\$137,484 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,363,705 | \$32,725 | -\$128,661 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,374,349 | \$43,369 | -\$118,017 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,249,760 | -\$81,220 | -\$242,606 |
| $6.50 \%$ | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,254,706 | -\$76,274 | -\$237,660 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,261,830 | -\$69,150 | -\$230,536 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,271,947 | -\$59,033 | -\$220,419 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,786,232 | \$455,252 | \$293,866 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,794,072 | \$463,092 | \$301,706 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,808,864 | \$477,884 | \$316,498 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,825,414 | \$494,434 | \$333,048 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,643,848 | \$312,868 | \$151,482 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,650,359 | \$319,379 | \$157,993 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,662,225 | \$331,245 | \$169,859 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,676,438 | \$345,458 | \$184,072 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,514,456 | \$183,476 | \$22,090 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,520,978 | \$189,998 | \$28,612 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,530,905 | \$199,925 | \$38,539 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,543,923 | \$212,943 | \$51,557 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,397,324 | \$66,344 | -\$95,042 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,403,407 | \$72,427 | -\$88,959 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,413,240 | \$82,260 | -\$79,126 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,423,610 | \$92,630 | -\$68,756 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,294,282 | -\$36,698 | -\$198,084 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,298,821 | -\$32,159 | -\$193,545 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,306,336 | -\$24,644 | -\$186,030 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,316,660 | -\$14,320 | -\$175,706 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,802,582 | \$471,602 | \$310,216 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,812,226 | \$481,246 | \$319,860 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,830,225 | \$499,245 | \$337,859 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,852,285 | \$521,305 | \$359,919 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,650,434 | \$319,454 | \$158,068 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,657,750 | \$326,770 | \$165,384 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,671,923 | \$340,943 | \$179,557 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,687,657 | \$356,677 | \$195,291 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,519,372 | \$188,392 | \$27,006 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,526,493 | \$195,513 | \$34,127 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,535,992 | \$205,012 | \$43,626 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,550,343 | \$219,363 | \$57,977 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,401,402 | \$70,422 | -\$90,964 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,406,279 | \$75,299 | -\$86,087 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,414,954 | \$83,974 | -\$77,412 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,427,508 | \$96,528 | -\$64,858 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,297,240 | -\$33,740 | -\$195,126 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,301,544 | -\$29,436 | -\$190,822 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,310,906 | -\$20,074 | -\$181,460 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,320,281 | -\$10,699 | -\$172,085 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,857,003 | \$526,023 | \$364,637 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,867,239 | \$536,259 | \$374,873 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,882,677 | \$551,697 | \$390,311 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,909,038 | \$578,058 | \$416,672 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,706,899 | \$375,919 | \$214,533 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,714,250 | \$383,270 | \$221,884 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,727,577 | \$396,597 | \$235,211 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,742,835 | \$411,855 | \$250,469 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,574,046 | \$243,066 | \$81,680 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,579,803 | \$248,823 | \$87,437 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,590,535 | \$259,555 | \$98,169 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,604,146 | \$273,166 | \$111,780 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,450,694 | \$119,714 | -\$41,672 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,457,700 | \$126,720 | -\$34,666 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,466,076 | \$135,096 | -\$26,290 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,478,619 | \$147,639 | -\$13,747 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,343,191 | \$12,211 | -\$149,175 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,348,075 | \$17,095 | -\$144,291 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,357,062 | \$26,082 | -\$135,304 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,367,207 | \$36,227 | -\$125,159 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,924,192 | \$593,212 | \$431,826 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,936,166 | \$605,186 | \$443,800 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$5,959,717 | \$628,737 | \$467,351 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$5,995,460 | \$664,480 | \$503,094 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,737,139 | \$406,159 | \$244,773 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,747,053 | \$416,073 | \$254,687 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,764,078 | \$433,098 | \$271,712 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,787,113 | \$456,133 | \$294,747 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,587,884 | \$256,904 | \$95,518 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,595,279 | \$264,299 | \$102,913 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,608,538 | \$277,558 | \$116,172 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,624,563 | \$293,583 | \$132,197 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,457,465 | \$126,485 | -\$34,901 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,464,389 | \$133,409 | -\$27,977 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,474,468 | \$143,488 | -\$17,898 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,487,493 | \$156,513 | -\$4,873 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,347,054 | \$16,074 | -\$145,312 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,352,654 | \$21,674 | -\$139,712 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,361,545 | \$30,565 | -\$130,821 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,372,988 | \$42,008 | -\$119,378 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$5,949,198 | \$618,218 | \$456,832 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$5,964,701 | \$633,721 | \$472,335 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,003,864 | \$672,884 | \$511,498 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,060,796 | \$729,816 | \$568,430 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,777,261 | \$446,281 | \$284,895 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,787,472 | \$456,492 | \$295,106 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,803,024 | \$472,044 | \$310,658 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,833,089 | \$502,109 | \$340,723 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,635,598 | \$304,618 | \$143,232 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,641,967 | \$310,987 | \$149,601 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,654,703 | \$323,723 | \$162,337 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,669,383 | \$338,403 | \$177,017 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,507,539 | \$176,559 | \$15,173 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,720,997 | \$390,017 | \$228,631 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,741,108 | \$410,128 | \$248,742 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,779,412 | \$448,432 | \$287,046 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,569,044 | \$238,064 | \$76,678 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,576,351 | \$245,371 | \$83,985 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,588,024 | \$257,044 | \$95,658 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,604,690 | \$273,710 | \$112,324 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,449,002 | \$118,022 | -\$43,364 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,454,794 | \$123,814 | -\$37,572 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,463,896 | \$132,916 | -\$28,470 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,476,693 | \$145,713 | -\$15,673 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,499,632 | \$1,168,652 | \$1,007,266 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,510,537 | \$1,179,557 | \$1,018,171 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,531,406 | \$1,200,426 | \$1,039,040 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,559,409 | \$1,228,429 | \$1,067,043 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,209,857 | \$878,877 | \$717,491 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,221,856 | \$890,876 | \$729,490 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,243,646 | \$912,666 | \$751,280 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,272,888 | \$941,908 | \$780,522 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,938,593 | \$607,613 | \$446,227 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,949,271 | \$618,291 | \$456,905 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,970,574 | \$639,594 | \$478,208 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,996,636 | \$665,656 | \$504,270 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,707,546 | \$376,566 | \$215,180 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,717,532 | \$386,552 | \$225,166 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,734,494 | \$403,514 | \$242,128 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,759,769 | \$428,789 | \$267,403 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,529,708 | \$198,728 | \$37,342 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,537,129 | \$206,149 | \$44,763 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,550,403 | \$219,423 | \$58,037 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,568,154 | \$237,174 | \$75,788 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,688,457 | \$1,357,477 | \$1,196,091 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,708,489 | \$1,377,509 | \$1,216,123 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | $10 \mathrm{in}$ | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,735,510 | \$1,404,530 | \$1,243,144 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,762,122 | \$1,431,142 | \$1,269,756 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,310,107 | \$979,127 | \$817,741 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,352,679 | \$1,021,699 | \$860,313 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,406,817 | \$1,075,837 | \$914,451 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,457,897 | \$1,126,917 | \$965,531 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,916,879 | \$585,899 | \$424,513 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,958,903 | \$627,923 | \$466,537 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,025,132 | \$694,152 | \$532,766 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,096,163 | \$765,183 | \$603,797 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,667,647 | \$336,667 | \$175,281 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,687,252 | \$356,272 | \$194,886 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,723,117 | \$392,137 | \$230,751 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,776,379 | \$445,399 | \$284,013 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,518,499 | \$187,519 | \$26,133 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,525,109 | \$194,129 | \$32,743 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,541,544 | \$210,564 | \$49,178 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,568,524 | \$237,544 | \$76,158 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,837,833 | \$1,506,853 | \$1,345,467 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,844,859 | \$1,513,879 | \$1,352,493 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,859,699 | \$1,528,719 | \$1,367,333 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,882,409 | \$1,551,429 | \$1,390,043 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,595,116 | \$1,264,136 | \$1,102,750 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,603,903 | \$1,272,923 | \$1,111,537 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,618,921 | \$1,287,941 | \$1,126,555 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,637,844 | \$1,306,864 | \$1,145,478 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,332,053 | \$1,001,073 | \$839,687 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,339,173 | \$1,008,193 | \$846,807 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,353,510 | \$1,022,530 | \$861,144 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,375,738 | \$1,044,758 | \$883,372 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,055,689 | \$724,709 | \$563,323 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,062,987 | \$732,007 | \$570,621 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,079,297 | \$748,317 | \$586,931 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,104,226 | \$773,246 | \$611,860 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,802,806 | \$471,826 | \$310,440 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,810,800 | \$479,820 | \$318,434 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,827,752 | \$496,772 | \$335,386 |
| 6.50\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,849,091 | \$518,111 | \$356,725 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,014,113 | \$683,133 | \$521,747 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,018,052 | \$687,072 | \$525,686 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,023,635 | \$692,655 | \$531,269 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,031,714 | \$700,734 | \$539,348 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,874,725 | \$543,745 | \$382,359 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,878,711 | \$547,731 | \$386,345 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,883,942 | \$552,962 | \$391,576 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,892,251 | \$561,271 | \$399,885 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,742,574 | \$411,594 | \$250,208 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,746,701 | \$415,721 | \$254,335 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,752,173 | \$421,193 | \$259,807 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,759,022 | \$428,042 | \$266,656 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,616,273 | \$285,293 | \$123,907 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,620,335 | \$289,355 | \$127,969 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,625,391 | \$294,411 | \$133,025 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,497,535 | \$166,555 | \$5,169 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,497,535 | \$166,555 | \$5,169 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,501,443 | \$170,463 | \$9,077 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,507,238 | \$176,258 | \$14,872 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,513,578 | \$182,598 | \$21,212 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,014,076 | \$683,096 | \$521,710 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,018,030 | \$687,050 | \$525,664 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,023,029 | \$692,049 | \$530,663 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,031,227 | \$700,247 | \$538,861 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,874,191 | \$543,211 | \$381,825 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,879,056 | \$548,076 | \$386,690 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$5,883,360 | \$552,380 | \$390,994 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$5,892,210 | \$561,230 | \$399,844 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,742,436 | \$411,456 | \$250,070 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,745,953 | \$414,973 | \$253,587 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,752,762 | \$421,782 | \$260,396 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,759,572 | \$428,592 | \$267,206 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,614,610 | \$283,630 | \$122,244 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,618,127 | \$287,147 | \$125,761 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,624,435 | \$293,455 | \$132,069 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,631,789 | \$300,809 | \$139,423 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,497,775 | \$166,795 | \$5,409 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,677,382 | \$346,402 | \$185,016 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,683,792 | \$352,812 | \$191,426 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,689,963 | \$358,983 | \$197,597 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,554,364 | \$223,384 | \$61,998 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,556,437 | \$225,457 | \$64,071 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,562,967 | \$231,987 | \$70,601 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,569,417 | \$238,437 | \$77,051 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,141,477 | \$810,497 | \$649,111 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,146,064 | \$815,084 | \$653,698 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,152,503 | \$821,523 | \$660,137 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,159,223 | \$828,243 | \$666,857 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,002,416 | \$671,436 | \$510,050 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,005,520 | \$674,540 | \$513,154 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,011,365 | \$680,385 | \$518,999 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,018,541 | \$687,561 | \$526,175 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,866,188 | \$535,208 | \$373,822 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,870,539 | \$539,559 | \$378,173 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,875,346 | \$544,366 | \$382,980 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,883,181 | \$552,201 | \$390,815 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,734,251 | \$403,271 | \$241,885 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,738,013 | \$407,033 | \$245,647 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,743,765 | \$412,785 | \$251,399 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,751,373 | \$420,393 | \$259,007 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,611,988 | \$281,008 | \$119,622 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,616,082 | \$285,102 | \$123,716 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,621,074 | \$290,094 | \$128,708 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,627,714 | \$296,734 | \$135,348 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,153,299 | \$822,319 | \$660,933 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,157,615 | \$826,635 | \$665,249 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,165,398 | \$834,418 | \$673,032 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,175,770 | \$844,790 | \$683,404 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,004,598 | \$673,618 | \$512,232 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,008,625 | \$677,645 | \$516,259 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,015,697 | \$684,717 | \$523,331 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,023,516 | \$692,536 | \$531,150 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,866,102 | \$535,122 | \$373,736 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,870,759 | \$539,779 | \$378,393 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,876,820 | \$545,840 | \$384,454 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,884,516 | \$553,536 | \$392,150 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,733,922 | \$402,942 | \$241,556 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,738,507 | \$407,527 | \$246,141 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,743,640 | \$412,660 | \$251,274 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,751,364 | \$420,384 | \$258,998 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,610,610 | \$279,630 | \$118,244 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,613,850 | \$282,870 | \$121,484 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,621,311 | \$290,331 | \$128,945 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,627,091 | \$296,111 | \$134,725 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,207,815 | \$876,835 | \$715,449 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,211,466 | \$880,486 | \$719,100 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,220,188 | \$889,208 | \$727,822 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,236,061 | \$905,081 | \$743,695 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,065,425 | \$734,445 | \$573,059 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,068,065 | \$737,085 | \$575,699 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,075,292 | \$744,312 | \$582,926 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,082,925 | \$751,945 | \$590,559 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,929,083 | \$598,103 | \$436,717 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,932,759 | \$601,779 | \$440,393 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,938,978 | \$607,998 | \$446,612 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,946,005 | \$615,025 | \$453,639 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,794,899 | \$463,919 | \$302,533 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,799,605 | \$468,625 | \$307,239 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,804,530 | \$473,550 | \$312,164 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,812,339 | \$481,359 | \$319,973 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,671,346 | \$340,366 | \$178,980 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,675,023 | \$344,043 | \$182,657 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,680,783 | \$349,803 | \$188,417 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,686,864 | \$355,884 | \$194,498 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,253,773 | \$922,793 | \$761,407 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,260,667 | \$929,687 | \$768,301 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,272,246 | \$941,266 | \$779,880 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,292,804 | \$961,824 | \$800,438 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,086,725 | \$755,745 | \$594,359 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,090,324 | \$759,344 | \$597,958 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,098,204 | \$767,224 | \$605,838 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,111,188 | \$780,208 | \$618,822 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,934,718 | \$603,738 | \$442,352 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,939,465 | \$608,485 | \$447,099 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,947,474 | \$616,494 | \$455,108 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,956,320 | \$625,340 | \$463,954 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,798,244 | \$467,264 | \$305,878 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,801,984 | \$471,004 | \$309,618 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,808,165 | \$477,185 | \$315,799 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,815,088 | \$484,108 | \$322,722 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,670,749 | \$339,769 | \$178,383 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,674,832 | \$343,852 | \$182,466 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,680,686 | \$349,706 | \$188,320 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,688,012 | \$357,032 | \$195,646 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,285,265 | \$954,285 | \$792,899 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,299,116 | \$968,136 | \$806,750 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,322,509 | \$991,529 | \$830,143 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,355,641 | \$1,024,661 | \$863,275 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,133,150 | \$802,170 | \$640,784 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,138,555 | \$807,575 | \$646,189 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,147,348 | \$816,368 | \$654,982 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,165,986 | \$835,006 | \$673,620 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,993,273 | \$662,293 | \$500,907 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,996,530 | \$665,550 | \$504,164 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,002,969 | \$671,989 | \$510,603 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,011,200 | \$680,220 | \$518,834 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,857,184 | \$526,204 | \$364,818 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,860,922 | \$529,942 | \$368,556 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,866,886 | \$535,906 | \$374,520 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,873,533 | \$542,553 | \$381,167 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,730,104 | \$399,124 | \$237,738 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,733,738 | \$402,758 | \$241,372 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,739,805 | \$408,825 | \$247,439 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,747,025 | \$416,045 | \$254,659 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,426,746 | \$1,095,766 | \$934,380 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,434,400 | \$1,103,420 | \$942,034 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,450,919 | \$1,119,939 | \$958,553 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,470,990 | \$1,140,010 | \$978,624 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,216,648 | \$885,668 | \$724,282 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,222,452 | \$891,472 | \$730,086 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,236,130 | \$905,150 | \$743,764 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,257,017 | \$926,037 | \$764,651 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,035,467 | \$704,487 | \$543,101 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,039,179 | \$708,199 | \$546,813 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,048,472 | \$717,492 | \$556,106 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,063,622 | \$732,642 | \$571,256 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,878,101 | \$547,121 | \$385,735 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,881,217 | \$550,237 | \$388,851 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,890,127 | \$559,147 | \$397,761 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,899,399 | \$568,419 | \$407,033 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,739,306 | \$408,326 | \$246,940 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,744,586 | \$413,606 | \$252,220 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,750,040 | \$419,060 | \$257,674 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,759,034 | \$428,054 | \$266,668 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,477,293 | \$1,146,313 | \$984,927 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,503,535 | \$1,172,555 | \$1,011,169 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,541,563 | \$1,210,583 | \$1,049,197 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,583,176 | \$1,252,196 | \$1,090,810 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,234,340 | \$903,360 | \$741,974 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,250,830 | \$919,850 | \$758,464 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,280,956 | \$949,976 | \$788,590 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,320,110 | \$989,130 | \$827,744 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,066,974 | \$735,994 | \$574,608 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,072,366 | \$741,386 | \$580,000 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,087,233 | \$756,253 | \$594,867 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,110,823 | \$779,843 | \$618,457 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,923,488 | \$592,508 | \$431,122 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,926,474 | \$595,494 | \$434,108 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,934,061 | \$603,081 | \$441,695 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,945,307 | \$614,327 | \$452,941 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,791,698 | \$460,718 | \$299,332 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,795,841 | \$464,861 | \$303,475 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,800,927 | \$469,947 | \$308,561 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,809,422 | \$478,442 | \$317,056 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,669,499 | \$1,338,519 | \$1,177,133 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,676,347 | \$1,345,367 | \$1,183,981 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,690,169 | \$1,359,189 | \$1,197,803 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,709,346 | \$1,378,366 | \$1,216,980 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,443,010 | \$1,112,030 | \$950,644 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,447,888 | \$1,116,908 | \$955,522 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,462,406 | \$1,131,426 | \$970,040 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,478,182 | \$1,147,202 | \$985,816 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,220,309 | \$889,329 | \$727,943 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,226,261 | \$895,281 | \$733,895 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,239,853 | \$908,873 | \$747,487 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,257,315 | \$926,335 | \$764,949 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,014,584 | \$683,604 | \$522,218 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,020,010 | \$689,030 | \$527,644 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,031,186 | \$700,206 | \$538,820 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,049,521 | \$718,541 | \$557,155 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,843,838 | \$512,858 | \$351,472 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,849,503 | \$518,523 | \$357,137 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,857,714 | \$526,734 | \$365,348 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,870,372 | \$539,392 | \$378,006 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,797,561 | \$1,466,581 | \$1,305,195 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,810,321 | \$1,479,341 | \$1,317,955 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,828,913 | \$1,497,933 | \$1,336,547 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,853,628 | \$1,522,648 | \$1,361,262 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,526,004 | \$1,195,024 | \$1,033,638 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,550,054 | \$1,219,074 | \$1,057,688 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,584,136 | \$1,253,156 | \$1,091,770 |
| 6.50\% | $5.00 \%$ | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,616,703 | \$1,285,723 | \$1,124,337 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,238,653 | \$907,673 | \$746,287 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,262,239 | \$931,259 | \$769,873 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,298,576 | \$967,596 | \$806,210 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,341,892 | \$1,010,912 | \$849,526 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,019,908 | \$688,928 | \$527,542 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,032,201 | \$701,221 | \$539,835 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,053,852 | \$722,872 | \$561,486 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,088,060 | \$757,080 | \$595,694 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,863,909 | \$532,929 | \$371,543 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,870,218 | \$539,238 | \$377,852 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,881,822 | \$550,842 | \$389,456 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,899,278 | \$568,298 | \$406,912 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,924,092 | \$1,593,112 | \$1,431,726 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,931,468 | \$1,600,488 | \$1,439,102 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,947,189 | \$1,616,209 | \$1,454,823 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,970,122 | \$1,639,142 | \$1,477,756 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,721,700 | \$1,390,720 | \$1,229,334 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,729,466 | \$1,398,486 | \$1,237,100 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,739,908 | \$1,408,928 | \$1,247,542 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,754,565 | \$1,423,585 | \$1,262,199 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,507,815 | \$1,176,835 | \$1,015,449 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,513,061 | \$1,182,081 | \$1,020,695 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,522,505 | \$1,191,525 | \$1,030,139 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,538,007 | \$1,207,027 | \$1,045,641 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,280,008 | \$949,028 | \$787,642 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,284,970 | \$953,990 | \$792,604 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,294,352 | \$963,372 | \$801,986 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,309,622 | \$978,642 | \$817,256 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,060,052 | \$729,072 | \$567,686 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,065,527 | \$734,547 | \$573,161 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,078,536 | \$747,556 | \$586,170 |
| 6.50\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,094,197 | \$763,217 | \$601,831 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,147,087 | \$816,107 | \$654,721 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,169,158 | \$838,178 | \$676,792 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,202,159 | \$871,179 | \$709,793 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,239,878 | \$908,898 | \$747,512 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,971,149 | \$640,169 | \$478,783 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$5,991,055 | \$660,075 | \$498,689 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,021,003 | \$690,023 | \$528,637 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,053,266 | \$722,286 | \$560,900 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,814,028 | \$483,048 | \$321,662 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,832,073 | \$501,093 | \$339,707 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,857,424 | \$526,444 | \$365,058 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,886,553 | \$555,573 | \$394,187 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,671,050 | \$340,070 | \$178,684 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,686,114 | \$355,134 | \$193,748 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,708,773 | \$377,793 | \$216,407 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,735,016 | \$404,036 | \$242,650 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,544,027 | \$213,047 | \$51,661 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,557,555 | \$226,575 | \$65,189 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,577,907 | \$246,927 | \$85,541 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,600,997 | \$270,017 | \$108,631 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,173,278 | \$842,298 | \$680,912 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,191,664 | \$860,684 | \$699,298 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,220,655 | \$889,675 | \$728,289 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,256,606 | \$925,626 | \$764,240 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$5,996,226 | \$665,246 | \$503,860 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,011,293 | \$680,313 | \$518,927 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,037,127 | \$706,147 | \$544,761 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,068,791 | \$737,811 | \$576,425 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,836,533 | \$505,553 | \$344,167 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,850,243 | \$519,263 | \$357,877 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,873,330 | \$542,350 | \$380,964 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,900,462 | \$569,482 | \$408,096 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,690,645 | \$359,665 | \$198,279 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,703,062 | \$372,082 | \$210,696 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,723,286 | \$392,306 | \$230,920 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,747,290 | \$416,310 | \$254,924 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,563,005 | \$232,025 | \$70,639 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,573,645 | \$242,665 | \$81,279 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,591,139 | \$260,159 | \$98,773 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,613,590 | \$282,610 | \$121,224 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,232,364 | \$901,384 | \$739,998 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,255,945 | \$924,965 | \$763,579 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,290,736 | \$959,756 | \$798,370 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,330,847 | \$999,867 | \$838,481 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,049,917 | \$718,937 | \$557,551 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,069,877 | \$738,897 | \$577,511 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,099,639 | \$768,659 | \$607,273 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,134,507 | \$803,527 | \$642,141 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,885,680 | \$554,700 | \$393,314 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,903,656 | \$572,676 | \$411,290 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,931,064 | \$600,084 | \$438,698 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,961,130 | \$630,150 | \$468,764 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,735,646 | \$404,666 | \$243,280 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,752,632 | \$421,652 | \$260,266 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,776,447 | \$445,467 | \$284,081 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,803,627 | \$472,647 | \$311,261 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,603,969 | \$272,989 | \$111,603 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,618,051 | \$287,071 | \$125,685 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,638,689 | \$307,709 | \$146,323 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,663,951 | \$332,971 | \$171,585 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,261,111 | \$930,131 | \$768,745 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,279,915 | \$948,935 | \$787,549 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,311,274 | \$980,294 | \$818,908 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,346,913 | \$1,015,933 | \$854,547 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,075,151 | \$744,171 | \$582,785 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,091,704 | \$760,724 | \$599,338 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,119,089 | \$788,109 | \$626,723 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,151,691 | \$820,711 | \$659,325 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$5,909,442 | \$578,462 | \$417,076 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$5,923,267 | \$592,287 | \$430,901 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$5,947,213 | \$616,233 | \$454,847 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$5,976,411 | \$645,431 | \$484,045 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,757,208 | \$426,228 | \$264,842 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,769,960 | \$438,980 | \$277,594 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,790,835 | \$459,855 | \$298,469 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,815,762 | \$484,782 | \$323,396 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,623,426 | \$292,446 | \$131,060 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,634,737 | \$303,757 | \$142,371 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,653,409 | \$322,429 | \$161,043 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,676,454 | \$345,474 | \$184,088 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,322,619 | \$991,639 | \$830,253 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  | Ar Content |  |  |  |  |  |  | Comparison 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,698,495 | \$367,515 | \$206,129 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,718,147 | \$387,167 | \$225,781 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,741,291 | \$410,311 | \$248,925 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,416,912 | \$1,085,932 | \$924,546 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,441,766 | \$1,110,786 | \$949,400 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,479,757 | \$1,148,777 | \$987,391 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,517,873 | \$1,186,893 | \$1,025,507 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,217,381 | \$886,401 | \$725,015 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,239,391 | \$908,411 | \$747,025 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,272,687 | \$941,707 | \$780,321 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,309,568 | \$978,588 | \$817,202 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,038,080 | \$707,100 | \$545,714 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,057,668 | \$726,688 | \$565,302 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,087,262 | \$756,282 | \$594,896 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,120,819 | \$789,839 | \$628,453 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,875,343 | \$544,363 | \$382,977 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,892,765 | \$561,785 | \$400,399 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,918,061 | \$587,081 | \$425,695 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,948,286 | \$617,306 | \$455,920 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,731,528 | \$400,548 | \$239,162 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,747,193 | \$416,213 | \$254,827 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,770,306 | \$439,326 | \$277,940 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,797,257 | \$466,277 | \$304,891 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,455,275 | \$1,124,295 | \$962,909 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,474,453 | \$1,143,473 | \$982,087 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,504,492 | \$1,173,512 | \$1,012,126 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,540,881 | \$1,209,901 | \$1,048,515 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,249,299 | \$918,319 | \$756,933 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,268,373 | \$937,393 | \$776,007 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,297,676 | \$966,696 | \$805,310 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,331,694 | \$1,000,714 | \$839,328 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,066,327 | \$735,347 | \$573,961 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,081,846 | \$750,866 | \$589,480 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,108,175 | \$777,195 | \$615,809 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,139,036 | \$808,056 | \$646,670 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,899,355 | \$568,375 | \$406,989 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,913,204 | \$582,224 | \$420,838 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,936,394 | \$605,414 | \$444,028 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,965,503 | \$634,523 | \$473,137 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,753,126 | \$422,146 | \$260,760 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,765,402 | \$434,422 | \$273,036 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,785,527 | \$454,547 | \$293,161 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,810,051 | \$479,071 | \$317,685 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,517,891 | \$1,186,911 | \$1,025,525 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,544,008 | \$1,213,028 | \$1,051,642 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,581,945 | \$1,250,965 | \$1,089,579 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,616,628 | \$1,285,648 | \$1,124,262 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,307,434 | \$976,454 | \$815,068 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,330,151 | \$999,171 | \$837,785 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,364,858 | \$1,033,878 | \$872,492 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,404,150 | \$1,073,170 | \$911,784 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,119,925 | \$788,945 | \$627,559 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,140,721 | \$809,741 | \$648,355 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,171,506 | \$840,526 | \$679,140 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,206,158 | \$875,178 | \$713,792 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,949,320 | \$618,340 | \$456,954 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,967,853 | \$636,873 | \$475,487 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,995,481 | \$664,501 | \$503,115 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,025,740 | \$694,760 | \$533,374 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,799,933 | \$468,953 | \$307,567 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,815,054 | \$484,074 | \$322,688 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,839,605 | \$508,625 | \$347,239 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,866,894 | \$535,914 | \$374,528 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,578,833 | \$1,247,853 | \$1,086,467 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,596,207 | \$1,265,227 | \$1,103,841 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,625,227 | \$1,294,247 | \$1,132,861 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,657,007 | \$1,326,027 | \$1,164,641 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,360,081 | \$1,029,101 | \$867,715 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,377,510 | \$1,046,530 | \$885,144 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,407,012 | \$1,076,032 | \$914,646 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,442,251 | \$1,111,271 | \$949,885 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,161,811 | \$830,831 | \$669,445 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,178,219 | \$847,239 | \$685,853 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,205,304 | \$874,324 | \$712,938 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,237,784 | \$906,804 | \$745,418 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,982,850 | \$651,870 | \$490,484 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,997,276 | \$666,296 | \$504,910 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,021,496 | \$690,516 | \$529,130 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,050,614 | \$719,634 | \$558,248 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,826,169 | \$495,189 | \$333,803 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,838,635 | \$507,655 | \$346,269 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,860,077 | \$529,097 | \$367,711 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,887,593 | \$556,613 | \$395,227 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,642,312 | \$1,311,332 | \$1,149,946 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,670,063 | \$1,339,083 | \$1,177,697 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,700,921 | \$1,369,941 | \$1,208,555 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,733,379 | \$1,402,399 | \$1,241,013 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,412,550 | \$1,081,570 | \$920,184 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,437,260 | \$1,106,280 | \$944,894 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,474,023 | \$1,143,043 | \$981,657 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,514,815 | \$1,183,835 | \$1,022,449 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,210,038 | \$879,058 | \$717,672 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,230,535 | \$899,555 | \$738,169 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,264,431 | \$933,451 | \$772,065 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,302,077 | \$971,097 | \$809,711 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,028,802 | \$697,822 | \$536,436 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,048,465 | \$717,485 | \$556,099 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,077,305 | \$746,325 | \$584,939 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,110,025 | \$779,045 | \$617,659 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,870,529 | \$539,549 | \$378,163 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,887,305 | \$556,325 | \$394,939 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,912,807 | \$581,827 | \$420,441 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,941,931 | \$610,951 | \$449,565 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,743,986 | \$1,413,006 | \$1,251,620 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,755,999 | \$1,425,019 | \$1,263,633 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,778,578 | \$1,447,598 | \$1,286,212 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,803,770 | \$1,472,790 | \$1,311,404 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,516,089 | \$1,185,109 | \$1,023,723 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  | Air Content |  |  |  |  |  |  | Comparison 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,964,997 | \$1,634,017 | \$1,472,631 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,984,207 | \$1,653,227 | \$1,491,841 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$7,011,786 | \$1,680,806 | \$1,519,420 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,741,429 | \$1,410,449 | \$1,249,063 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,750,293 | \$1,419,313 | \$1,257,927 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,768,271 | \$1,437,291 | \$1,275,905 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,790,710 | \$1,459,730 | \$1,298,344 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,519,643 | \$1,188,663 | \$1,027,277 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,530,339 | \$1,199,359 | \$1,037,973 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,548,870 | \$1,217,890 | \$1,056,504 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,574,338 | \$1,243,358 | \$1,081,972 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,295,116 | \$964,136 | \$802,750 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,306,175 | \$975,195 | \$813,809 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,326,864 | \$995,884 | \$834,498 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,354,151 | \$1,023,171 | \$861,785 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,086,320 | \$755,340 | \$593,954 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,098,571 | \$767,591 | \$606,205 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,120,378 | \$789,398 | \$628,012 |
| 4.00\% | 0.50\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,145,493 | \$814,513 | \$653,127 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,404,787 | \$1,073,807 | \$912,421 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,411,199 | \$1,080,219 | \$918,833 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,426,294 | \$1,095,314 | \$933,928 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,440,322 | \$1,109,342 | \$947,956 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,223,458 | \$892,478 | \$731,092 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,232,022 | \$901,042 | \$739,656 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,246,616 | \$915,636 | \$754,250 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,263,008 | \$932,028 | \$770,642 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,051,166 | \$720,186 | \$558,800 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,061,242 | \$730,262 | \$568,876 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,074,675 | \$743,695 | \$582,309 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,092,253 | \$761,273 | \$599,887 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,891,726 | \$560,746 | \$399,360 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,900,189 | \$569,209 | \$407,823 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,911,982 | \$581,002 | \$419,616 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,927,456 | \$596,476 | \$435,090 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,747,278 | \$416,298 | \$254,912 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,753,395 | \$422,415 | \$261,029 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,764,374 | \$433,394 | \$272,008 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,779,536 | \$448,556 | \$287,170 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,408,763 | \$1,077,783 | \$916,397 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,416,000 | \$1,085,020 | \$923,634 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,427,251 | \$1,096,271 | \$934,885 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,442,123 | \$1,111,143 | \$949,757 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,227,795 | \$896,815 | \$735,429 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,235,697 | \$904,717 | \$743,331 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,250,498 | \$919,518 | \$758,132 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,266,003 | \$935,023 | \$773,637 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,055,689 | \$724,709 | \$563,323 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,064,943 | \$733,963 | \$572,577 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,078,167 | \$747,187 | \$585,801 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,095,300 | \$764,320 | \$602,934 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,896,949 | \$565,969 | \$404,583 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$5,903,527 | \$572,547 | \$411,161 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$5,916,286 | \$585,306 | \$423,920 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$5,932,352 | \$601,372 | \$439,986 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,751,543 | \$420,563 | \$259,177 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,758,386 | \$427,406 | \$266,020 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,769,547 | \$438,567 | \$277,181 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 16 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,783,511 | \$452,531 | \$291,145 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,485,261 | \$1,154,281 | \$992,895 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,493,883 | \$1,162,903 | \$1,001,517 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,505,823 | \$1,174,843 | \$1,013,457 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,517,988 | \$1,187,008 | \$1,025,622 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,305,063 | \$974,083 | \$812,697 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,313,681 | \$982,701 | \$821,315 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,329,477 | \$998,497 | \$837,111 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,343,731 | \$1,012,751 | \$851,365 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,131,669 | \$800,689 | \$639,303 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,139,245 | \$808,265 | \$646,879 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,152,917 | \$821,937 | \$660,551 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,170,027 | \$839,047 | \$677,661 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 15 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$5,965,325 | \$634,345 | \$472,959 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,219,846 | \$888,866 | \$727,480 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,234,387 | \$903,407 | \$742,021 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,250,717 | \$919,737 | \$758,351 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,042,290 | \$711,310 | \$549,924 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,049,994 | \$719,014 | \$557,628 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,062,580 | \$731,600 | \$570,214 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,079,334 | \$748,354 | \$586,968 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,885,813 | \$554,833 | \$393,447 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,894,611 | \$563,631 | \$402,245 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,906,710 | \$575,730 | \$414,344 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,921,659 | \$590,679 | \$429,293 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,569,986 | \$1,239,006 | \$1,077,620 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,575,984 | \$1,245,004 | \$1,083,618 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,584,838 | \$1,253,858 | \$1,092,472 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,596,519 | \$1,265,539 | \$1,104,153 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,393,572 | \$1,062,592 | \$901,206 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,400,051 | \$1,069,071 | \$907,685 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,412,081 | \$1,081,101 | \$919,715 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,427,274 | \$1,096,294 | \$934,908 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,214,800 | \$883,820 | \$722,434 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,223,188 | \$892,208 | \$730,822 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,237,269 | \$906,289 | \$744,903 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,254,003 | \$923,023 | \$761,637 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,046,185 | \$715,205 | \$553,819 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,054,604 | \$723,624 | \$562,238 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,067,840 | \$736,860 | \$575,474 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,083,080 | \$752,100 | \$590,714 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,891,234 | \$560,254 | \$398,868 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,897,761 | \$566,781 | \$405,395 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,909,641 | \$578,661 | \$417,275 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,925,787 | \$594,807 | \$433,421 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,642,643 | \$1,311,663 | \$1,150,277 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,647,108 | \$1,316,128 | \$1,154,742 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,654,720 | \$1,323,740 | \$1,162,354 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,665,859 | \$1,334,879 | \$1,173,493 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,417,687 | \$1,086,707 | \$925,321 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,478,804 | \$1,147,824 | \$986,438 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,488,583 | \$1,157,603 | \$996,217 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,502,650 | \$1,171,670 | \$1,010,284 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,292,920 | \$961,940 | \$800,554 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,302,526 | \$971,546 | \$810,160 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,315,979 | \$984,999 | \$823,613 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,331,984 | \$1,001,004 | \$839,618 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,120,287 | \$789,307 | \$627,921 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,127,966 | \$796,986 | \$635,600 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,141,757 | \$810,777 | \$649,391 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,157,548 | \$826,568 | \$665,182 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,961,100 | \$630,120 | \$468,734 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,968,554 | \$637,574 | \$476,188 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,980,229 | \$649,249 | \$487,863 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$5,996,517 | \$665,537 | \$504,151 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,650,088 | \$1,319,108 | \$1,157,722 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,655,300 | \$1,324,320 | \$1,162,934 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,664,007 | \$1,333,027 | \$1,171,641 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,677,643 | \$1,346,663 | \$1,185,277 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,478,334 | \$1,147,354 | \$985,968 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,486,922 | \$1,155,942 | \$994,556 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,497,113 | \$1,166,133 | \$1,004,747 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,510,035 | \$1,179,055 | \$1,017,669 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,299,622 | \$968,642 | \$807,256 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,307,393 | \$976,413 | \$815,027 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,320,376 | \$989,396 | \$828,010 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,335,899 | \$1,004,919 | \$843,533 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,123,458 | \$792,478 | \$631,092 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,132,719 | \$801,739 | \$640,353 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,145,482 | \$814,502 | \$653,116 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,162,734 | \$831,754 | \$670,368 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$5,964,715 | \$633,735 | \$472,349 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$5,973,075 | \$642,095 | \$480,709 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$5,985,567 | \$654,587 | \$493,201 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,000,586 | \$669,606 | \$508,220 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,714,945 | \$1,383,965 | \$1,222,579 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,718,454 | \$1,387,474 | \$1,226,088 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,727,557 | \$1,396,577 | \$1,235,191 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,740,452 | \$1,409,472 | \$1,248,086 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,553,101 | \$1,222,121 | \$1,060,735 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,559,181 | \$1,228,201 | \$1,066,815 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,568,572 | \$1,237,592 | \$1,076,206 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,579,300 | \$1,248,320 | \$1,086,934 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,377,256 | \$1,046,276 | \$884,890 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,384,441 | \$1,053,461 | \$892,075 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,397,410 | \$1,066,430 | \$905,044 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,412,021 | \$1,081,041 | \$919,655 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,199,055 | \$868,075 | \$706,689 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,208,834 | \$877,854 | \$716,468 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,221,550 | \$890,570 | \$729,184 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,238,627 | \$907,647 | \$746,261 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,037,616 | \$706,636 | \$545,250 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,044,280 | \$713,300 | \$551,914 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,057,871 | \$726,891 | \$565,505 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,072,479 | \$741,499 | \$580,113 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,742,617 | \$1,411,637 | \$1,250,251 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,748,666 | \$1,417,686 | \$1,256,300 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,757,931 | \$1,426,951 | \$1,265,565 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,770,600 | \$1,439,620 | \$1,278,234 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,572,539 | \$1,241,559 | \$1,080,173 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,577,809 | \$1,246,829 | \$1,085,443 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,588,060 | \$1,257,080 | \$1,095,694 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,602,632 | \$1,271,652 | \$1,110,266 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,391,876 | \$1,060,896 | \$899,510 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,399,931 | \$1,068,951 | \$907,565 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,412,378 | \$1,081,398 | \$920,012 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,427,240 | \$1,096,260 | \$934,874 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,209,585 | \$878,605 | \$717,219 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,217,531 | \$886,551 | \$725,165 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,231,256 | \$900,276 | \$738,890 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,250,218 | \$919,238 | \$757,852 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,043,824 | \$712,844 | \$551,458 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,051,207 | \$720,227 | \$558,841 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,065,984 | \$735,004 | \$573,618 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,080,718 | \$749,738 | \$588,352 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,796,285 | \$1,465,305 | \$1,303,919 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,804,631 | \$1,473,651 | \$1,312,265 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,817,117 | \$1,486,137 | \$1,324,751 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,832,280 | \$1,501,300 | \$1,339,914 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,634,939 | \$1,303,959 | \$1,142,573 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,641,364 | \$1,310,384 | \$1,148,998 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,652,563 | \$1,321,583 | \$1,160,197 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,667,992 | \$1,337,012 | \$1,175,626 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,463,219 | \$1,132,239 | \$970,853 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,470,629 | \$1,139,649 | \$978,263 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,482,291 | \$1,151,311 | \$989,925 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,496,465 | \$1,165,485 | \$1,004,099 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,282,820 | \$951,840 | \$790,454 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,291,485 | \$960,505 | \$799,119 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,305,408 | \$974,428 | \$813,042 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,321,936 | \$990,956 | \$829,570 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,115,047 | \$784,067 | \$622,681 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,122,801 | \$791,821 | \$630,435 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,136,039 | \$805,059 | \$643,673 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,151,774 | \$820,794 | \$659,408 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,862,975 | \$1,531,995 | \$1,370,609 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,869,878 | \$1,538,898 | \$1,377,512 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,880,614 | \$1,549,634 | \$1,388,248 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,896,620 | \$1,565,640 | \$1,404,254 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,692,786 | \$1,361,806 | \$1,200,420 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,698,601 | \$1,367,621 | \$1,206,235 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,708,796 | \$1,377,816 | \$1,216,430 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,721,629 | \$1,390,649 | \$1,229,263 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,510,567 | \$1,179,587 | \$1,018,201 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,514,739 | \$1,183,759 | \$1,022,373 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,528,509 | \$1,197,529 | \$1,036,143 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,542,286 | \$1,211,306 | \$1,049,920 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,316,262 | \$985,282 | \$823,896 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,325,006 | \$994,026 | \$832,640 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,339,497 | \$1,008,517 | \$847,131 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,354,054 | \$1,023,074 | \$861,688 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,137,670 | \$806,690 | \$645,304 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,145,772 | \$814,792 | \$653,406 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,158,926 | \$827,946 | \$666,560 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,177,756 | \$846,776 | \$685,390 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,925,067 | \$1,594,087 | \$1,432,701 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,933,258 | \$1,602,278 | \$1,440,892 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,948,387 | \$1,617,407 | \$1,456,021 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,969,560 | \$1,638,580 | \$1,477,194 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,747,616 | \$1,416,636 | \$1,255,250 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,756,733 | \$1,425,753 | \$1,264,367 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,771,294 | \$1,440,314 | \$1,278,928 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,789,514 | \$1,458,534 | \$1,297,148 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,564,498 | \$1,233,518 | \$1,072,132 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,573,435 | \$1,242,455 | \$1,081,069 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,589,936 | \$1,258,956 | \$1,097,570 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,607,989 | \$1,277,009 | \$1,115,623 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,376,893 | \$1,045,913 | \$884,527 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,384,492 | \$1,053,512 | \$892,126 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,399,622 | \$1,068,642 | \$907,256 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,419,079 | \$1,088,099 | \$926,713 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,198,698 | \$867,718 | \$706,332 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,208,864 | \$877,884 | \$716,498 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,221,057 | \$890,077 | \$728,691 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,240,140 | \$909,160 | \$747,774 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$7,033,709 | \$1,702,729 | \$1,541,343 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$7,041,453 | \$1,710,473 | \$1,549,087 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$7,057,525 | \$1,726,545 | \$1,565,159 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$7,082,222 | \$1,751,242 | \$1,589,856 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,855,107 | \$1,524,127 | \$1,362,741 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,861,190 | \$1,530,210 | \$1,368,824 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,869,660 | \$1,538,680 | \$1,377,294 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,883,898 | \$1,552,918 | \$1,391,532 |
| 4.00\% | 2.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,677,954 | \$1,346,974 | \$1,185,588 |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

|  | Air Content |  |  |  |  |  |  | Comparison 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,579,526 | \$1,248,546 | \$1,087,160 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,584,908 | \$1,253,928 | \$1,092,542 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,589,629 | \$1,258,649 | \$1,097,263 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,440,458 | \$1,109,478 | \$948,092 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,445,064 | \$1,114,084 | \$952,698 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,450,899 | \$1,119,919 | \$958,533 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,456,112 | \$1,125,132 | \$963,746 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,303,852 | \$972,872 | \$811,486 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,306,842 | \$975,862 | \$814,476 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,312,845 | \$981,865 | \$820,479 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,318,191 | \$987,211 | \$825,825 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,160,448 | \$829,468 | \$668,082 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,162,756 | \$831,776 | \$670,390 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,167,440 | \$836,460 | \$675,074 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,175,005 | \$844,025 | \$682,639 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,012,965 | \$681,985 | \$520,599 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,016,318 | \$685,338 | \$523,952 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,023,312 | \$692,332 | \$530,946 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 15 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,030,309 | \$699,329 | \$537,943 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,639,531 | \$1,308,551 | \$1,147,165 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,641,785 | \$1,310,805 | \$1,149,419 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,644,974 | \$1,313,994 | \$1,152,608 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,651,731 | \$1,320,751 | \$1,159,365 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,505,227 | \$1,174,247 | \$1,012,861 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,508,602 | \$1,177,622 | \$1,016,236 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,512,762 | \$1,181,782 | \$1,020,396 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,518,630 | \$1,187,650 | \$1,026,264 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,367,832 | \$1,036,852 | \$875,466 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,372,430 | \$1,041,450 | \$880,064 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,378,146 | \$1,047,166 | \$885,780 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,385,204 | \$1,054,224 | \$892,838 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,229,474 | \$898,494 | \$737,108 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,234,100 | \$903,120 | \$741,734 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,239,084 | \$908,104 | \$746,718 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,245,449 | \$914,469 | \$753,083 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,090,171 | \$759,191 | \$597,805 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | $\begin{gathered} \begin{array}{c} \text { Comparison } 1 \\ \text { (15-in slab) } \end{array} \\ \hline \$ 5,330,980 \end{gathered}$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,092,742 | \$761,762 | \$600,376 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,098,815 | \$767,835 | \$606,449 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,103,896 | \$772,916 | \$611,530 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,637,636 | \$1,306,656 | \$1,145,270 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,641,475 | \$1,310,495 | \$1,149,109 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,645,362 | \$1,314,382 | \$1,152,996 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,651,309 | \$1,320,329 | \$1,158,943 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,504,173 | \$1,173,193 | \$1,011,807 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,507,090 | \$1,176,110 | \$1,014,724 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,513,534 | \$1,182,554 | \$1,021,168 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,518,889 | \$1,187,909 | \$1,026,523 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,368,102 | \$1,037,122 | \$875,736 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,372,645 | \$1,041,665 | \$880,279 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,378,351 | \$1,047,371 | \$885,985 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,384,572 | \$1,053,592 | \$892,206 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,227,500 | \$896,520 | \$735,134 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,230,965 | \$899,985 | \$738,599 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,236,875 | \$905,895 | \$744,509 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,243,203 | \$912,223 | \$750,837 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,083,809 | \$752,829 | \$591,443 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,088,390 | \$757,410 | \$596,024 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,092,824 | \$761,844 | \$600,458 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 14 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,099,568 | \$768,588 | \$607,202 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,697,457 | \$1,366,477 | \$1,205,091 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,700,707 | \$1,369,727 | \$1,208,341 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,705,069 | \$1,374,089 | \$1,212,703 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,711,283 | \$1,380,303 | \$1,218,917 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,568,680 | \$1,237,700 | \$1,076,314 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,571,610 | \$1,240,630 | \$1,079,244 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,575,174 | \$1,244,194 | \$1,082,808 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,580,721 | \$1,249,741 | \$1,088,355 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,432,231 | \$1,101,251 | \$939,865 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,435,333 | \$1,104,353 | \$942,967 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,441,392 | \$1,110,412 | \$949,026 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,447,506 | \$1,116,526 | \$955,140 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,294,177 | \$963,197 | \$801,811 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,298,453 | \$967,473 | \$806,087 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,304,508 | \$973,528 | \$812,142 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,311,281 | \$980,301 | \$818,915 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,158,452 | \$827,472 | \$666,086 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,162,653 | \$831,673 | \$670,287 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,166,865 | \$835,885 | \$674,499 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,173,018 | \$842,038 | \$680,652 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,707,203 | \$1,376,223 | \$1,214,837 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,708,685 | \$1,377,705 | \$1,216,319 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,714,522 | \$1,383,542 | \$1,222,156 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,724,068 | \$1,393,088 | \$1,231,702 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,570,305 | \$1,239,325 | \$1,077,939 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,573,338 | \$1,242,358 | \$1,080,972 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,578,144 | \$1,247,164 | \$1,085,778 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,584,809 | \$1,253,829 | \$1,092,443 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,433,970 | \$1,102,990 | \$941,604 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,439,679 | \$1,108,699 | \$947,313 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,444,190 | \$1,113,210 | \$951,824 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,449,704 | \$1,118,724 | \$957,338 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,294,381 | \$963,401 | \$802,015 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,298,603 | \$967,623 | \$806,237 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,303,928 | \$972,948 | \$811,562 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,310,115 | \$979,135 | \$817,749 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,156,008 | \$825,028 | \$663,642 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,158,496 | \$827,516 | \$666,130 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,162,827 | \$831,847 | \$670,461 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 13 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,169,464 | \$838,484 | \$677,098 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,759,025 | \$1,428,045 | \$1,266,659 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,763,189 | \$1,432,209 | \$1,270,823 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,771,355 | \$1,440,375 | \$1,278,989 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,781,964 | \$1,450,984 | \$1,289,598 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,629,977 | \$1,298,997 | \$1,137,611 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,632,114 | \$1,301,134 | \$1,139,748 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,636,276 | \$1,305,296 | \$1,143,910 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,644,363 | \$1,313,383 | \$1,151,997 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,495,553 | \$1,164,573 | \$1,003,187 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,499,651 | \$1,168,671 | \$1,007,285 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,503,975 | \$1,172,995 | \$1,011,609 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,511,299 | \$1,180,319 | \$1,018,933 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,359,494 | \$1,028,514 | \$867,128 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,363,572 | \$1,032,592 | \$871,206 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,369,462 | \$1,038,482 | \$877,096 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,374,310 | \$1,043,330 | \$881,944 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,225,365 | \$894,385 | \$732,999 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,228,932 | \$897,952 | \$736,566 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,233,939 | \$902,959 | \$741,573 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,240,547 | \$909,567 | \$748,181 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,798,284 | \$1,467,304 | \$1,305,918 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,803,193 | \$1,472,213 | \$1,310,827 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,808,373 | \$1,477,393 | \$1,316,007 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,818,846 | \$1,487,866 | \$1,326,480 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,650,699 | \$1,319,719 | \$1,158,333 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,653,502 | \$1,322,522 | \$1,161,136 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,659,837 | \$1,328,857 | \$1,167,471 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,670,190 | \$1,339,210 | \$1,177,824 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,508,563 | \$1,177,583 | \$1,016,197 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,511,177 | \$1,180,197 | \$1,018,811 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,517,573 | \$1,186,593 | \$1,025,207 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,525,328 | \$1,194,348 | \$1,032,962 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,365,043 | \$1,034,063 | \$872,677 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,371,664 | \$1,040,684 | \$879,298 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,376,643 | \$1,045,663 | \$884,277 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,382,518 | \$1,051,538 | \$890,152 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,225,472 | \$894,492 | \$733,106 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,228,693 | \$897,713 | \$736,327 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,236,023 | \$905,043 | \$743,657 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 12 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,242,584 | \$911,604 | \$750,218 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,848,023 | \$1,517,043 | \$1,355,657 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,853,585 | \$1,522,605 | \$1,361,219 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,865,725 | \$1,534,745 | \$1,373,359 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,882,301 | \$1,551,321 | \$1,389,935 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,696,987 | \$1,366,007 | \$1,204,621 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,702,001 | \$1,371,021 | \$1,209,635 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,713,849 | \$1,382,869 | \$1,221,483 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,726,326 | \$1,395,346 | \$1,233,960 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,562,887 | \$1,231,907 | \$1,070,521 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,566,259 | \$1,235,279 | \$1,073,893 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,571,711 | \$1,240,731 | \$1,079,345 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,580,867 | \$1,249,887 | \$1,088,501 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,423,996 | \$1,093,016 | \$931,630 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,427,347 | \$1,096,367 | \$934,981 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,433,581 | \$1,102,601 | \$941,215 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,440,570 | \$1,109,590 | \$948,204 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,290,584 | \$959,604 | \$798,218 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,294,819 | \$963,839 | \$802,453 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,300,504 | \$969,524 | \$808,138 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,306,494 | \$975,514 | \$814,128 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,926,163 | \$1,595,183 | \$1,433,797 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,930,235 | \$1,599,255 | \$1,437,869 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$6,939,851 | \$1,608,871 | \$1,447,485 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$6,952,705 | \$1,621,725 | \$1,460,339 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,766,871 | \$1,435,891 | \$1,274,505 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,770,085 | \$1,439,105 | \$1,277,719 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,778,005 | \$1,447,025 | \$1,285,639 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,788,114 | \$1,457,134 | \$1,295,748 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,610,787 | \$1,279,807 | \$1,118,421 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,613,158 | \$1,282,178 | \$1,120,792 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,621,539 | \$1,290,559 | \$1,129,173 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,631,156 | \$1,300,176 | \$1,138,790 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,457,511 | \$1,126,531 | \$965,145 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,461,730 | \$1,130,750 | \$969,364 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,467,812 | \$1,136,832 | \$975,446 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,475,643 | \$1,144,663 | \$983,277 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,309,112 | \$978,132 | \$816,746 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,313,821 | \$982,841 | \$821,455 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,319,041 | \$988,061 | \$826,675 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 11 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,325,429 | \$994,449 | \$833,063 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 20 | \$6,991,731 | \$1,660,751 | \$1,499,365 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2 <br> (12-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,492,366$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 40 | \$6,998,029 | \$1,667,049 | \$1,505,663 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 60 | \$7,009,763 | \$1,678,783 | \$1,517,397 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 450 | 80 | \$7,033,104 | \$1,702,124 | \$1,540,738 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,819,994 | \$1,489,014 | \$1,327,628 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,827,939 | \$1,496,959 | \$1,335,573 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,841,716 | \$1,510,736 | \$1,349,350 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,856,891 | \$1,525,911 | \$1,364,525 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,652,979 | \$1,321,999 | \$1,160,613 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,659,309 | \$1,328,329 | \$1,166,943 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,672,046 | \$1,341,066 | \$1,179,680 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,687,805 | \$1,356,825 | \$1,195,439 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,498,192 | \$1,167,212 | \$1,005,826 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,503,694 | \$1,172,714 | \$1,011,328 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,513,511 | \$1,182,531 | \$1,021,145 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,528,366 | \$1,197,386 | \$1,036,000 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,358,897 | \$1,027,917 | \$866,531 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,363,890 | \$1,032,910 | \$871,524 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,370,504 | \$1,039,524 | \$878,138 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 0.5 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,378,993 | \$1,048,013 | \$886,627 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 20 | \$7,102,598 | \$1,771,618 | \$1,610,232 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 40 | \$7,108,193 | \$1,777,213 | \$1,615,827 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 60 | \$7,123,059 | \$1,792,079 | \$1,630,693 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 450 | 80 | \$7,147,378 | \$1,816,398 | \$1,655,012 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 20 | \$6,923,365 | \$1,592,385 | \$1,430,999 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 40 | \$6,928,347 | \$1,597,367 | \$1,435,981 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 60 | \$6,936,394 | \$1,605,414 | \$1,444,028 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 500 | 80 | \$6,948,287 | \$1,617,307 | \$1,455,921 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 20 | \$6,760,646 | \$1,429,666 | \$1,268,280 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 40 | \$6,766,374 | \$1,435,394 | \$1,274,008 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 60 | \$6,772,387 | \$1,441,407 | \$1,280,021 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 550 | 80 | \$6,780,821 | \$1,449,841 | \$1,288,455 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 20 | \$6,596,959 | \$1,265,979 | \$1,104,593 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 40 | \$6,599,774 | \$1,268,794 | \$1,107,408 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 60 | \$6,609,166 | \$1,278,186 | \$1,116,800 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 600 | 80 | \$6,620,451 | \$1,289,471 | \$1,128,085 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 20 | \$6,433,992 | \$1,103,012 | \$941,626 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Air Content |  | Thickness |  | Strength |  | LCC | Comparison 1 <br> (15-in slab) <br> $\$ 5,330,980$ | Comparison 2(12-in slab) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. | Mean | St. Dev. |  |  |  |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 40 | \$6,439,461 | \$1,108,481 | \$947,095 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 60 | \$6,446,076 | \$1,115,096 | \$953,710 |
| 4.00\% | 5.00\% | 10 in | 2 in | 650 | 80 | \$6,455,682 | \$1,124,702 | \$963,316 |

## APPENDIX C. QRSS INPUT1 DATA FOR STUDYING

| No. | Input |  |  | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Agency Name |  |  | INDOT |
| 2 | Project ID |  |  | - |
| 3 | Project Name |  |  | - |
| 4 | Analysis Date |  |  | - |
| 5 | Operator's Name |  |  | - |
| 6 | Mode Mix Design |  |  |  |
|  | Pay Performance Factors |  |  | Check |
| 7 | Design Speed (mph) |  |  | 40 |
| 8 | Design Life (yrs) |  |  | 9 |
| 9 | Design ESALs | Year 1 Daily ESALs (Design Lane) |  | 350 |
| 10 |  | Annual Growth Rate 'r' (\%) |  | 1.0 |
| 11 |  | Total ESALs |  | 1,202,804 |
| 12 | Material Properties | AC Surface | Thickness (in) | 1.5 |
| 13 |  |  | Characterization Option | Job Mix Formula with Predicted Property Models |
| 14 |  |  | Input | See Input No. 32-57 |
| 15 |  | AC Binder | Thickness (in) | 5 |
| 16 |  |  | Characterization Option | Job Mix Formula with Predicted Property |
| 17 |  |  | Input | See Input No. 58-83 |
| 18 |  | AC Base | Thickness (in) | - |
| 19 |  |  | Characterization Option | - |
| 20 |  |  | Input | - |
| 21 |  | Base | Thickness (in) | 7 |
| 22 |  |  | Mr (psi) | 100000 |
| 23 |  | Subbase | Thickness (in) | ${ }^{-}$ |
| 24 |  |  | Mr (psi) | - |
| 25 |  | Subgrade | Mr (psi) | 5000 |
| 26 | Desired Distress | AC Surface | Rutting | Check |
| 27 |  |  | Thermal Fracture | - - |
| 28 |  |  | IRI | Check |
| 29 |  | AC Binder | Rutting | Check |
| 30 |  | AC Base | Rutting | - |
| 31 |  |  | Fatigue Cracking | - - |
| 32 | (AC 1) Design Volumetrics | Air Voids (\%) |  | 4.0 |
| 33 |  | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) |  | 4.7 |
| 34 | (AC 1) Binder Characteristics | Binder Type |  | PG76-22 |
| 35 |  | Direct Input | A (RTFO) | 9.715 |
|  |  |  | VTS (RTFO) | -3.208 |
|  |  |  | Gb | 1.030 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 36 |  | Air Voids - Va (\%) | 8.0 |
| 37 |  | Gsb | 2.672 |
| 38 |  | Maximum Theoretical Specific Gravity (Gmm) | 2.450 |
| 39 | (AC 1) Target In-Situ | Bulk Density - Gmb | 2.254 |
| 40 | Volumetrics | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) | 4.7 |
| 41 |  | Effective Binder Content by Volume - Vbeff (\%) | 11.608 |
| 42 |  | VMA (\%) | 19.6 |
| 43 |  | VFA (\%) | 59.2 |
| 44 | (AC 1) TargetAggregate Gradation | $11 / 2^{\prime \prime}$ | - |
| 45 |  | $1^{\prime \prime}$ | - |
| 46 |  | 3/4" | 92 |
| 47 |  | 1/2" | - |
| 48 |  | $3 / 8^{\prime \prime}$ | 53 |
| 49 |  | \#4 | 34 |
| 50 |  | \#8 | - |
| 51 |  | \#10 | - |
| 52 |  | \#16 | - |
| 53 |  | \#30 | - |
| 54 |  | \#40 | - |
| 55 |  | \#50 | - |
| 56 |  | \#100 | - |
| 57 |  | \#200 | 4.1 |
| 58 | (AC 2) Design Volumetrics | Air Voids (\%) | 4.0 |
| 59 |  | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) | 4.7 |
| 60 | (AC 2) Binder Characteristics | Binder Type | AC 20 |
| 61 |  | A (RTFO) | 10.771 |
|  |  | Direct Input VTS (RTFO) | -3.602 |
|  |  | Gb | 1.030 |
| 62 | (AC 2) Target In-Situ Volumetrics | Air Voids - Va (\%) | 6.0 |
| 63 |  | Gsb | 2.613 |
| 64 |  | Maximum Theoretical Specific Gravity (Gmm) | 2.450 |
| 65 |  | Bulk Density - Gmb | 2.303 |
| 66 |  | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) | 4.7 |
| 67 |  | Effective Binder Content by Volume - Vbeff (\%) | 10.006 |
| 68 |  | VMA (\%) | 16.0 |
| 69 |  | VFA (\%) | 62.5 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 70 |  | $11 / 2^{\prime \prime}$ | - |
| 71 |  | $1{ }^{\prime \prime}$ | - |
| 72 |  | 3/4" | 97 |
| 73 |  | $1 / 2^{\prime \prime}$ | - |
| 74 |  | $3 / 8^{\prime \prime}$ | 69 |
| 75 |  | \#4 | 43 |
| 76 | (AC 2) Aggregate | \#8 | - |
| 77 | Gradation | \#10 | - |
| 78 |  | \#16 | - |
| 79 |  | \#30 | - |
| 80 |  | \#40 | - |
| 81 |  | \#50 | - |
| 82 |  | \#100 | - |
| 83 |  | \#200 | 2 |
| 84 | Positioning | Longitude (degrees.mins) | -85.792 |
| 85 |  | Latitude (degress.mins) | 41.527 |
| 86 |  | Elevation (ft) | 825 |
| 87 |  | Mean Annual Air Temp. (F) | 49.26 |
| 88 |  | Mean Monthly Air Temp. St. Dev. (F) | 17.05 |
| 89 |  | Mean Annual Wind Speed (mph) | 7.89 |
| 90 |  | Mean Annual Sunshine (\%) | 56.52 |
| 91 |  | Annual Cum. Rainfall Depth (in) | 30.59 |
| 92 | Average Allowable Distress Value | AC Rutting (in) | 0.75 |
| 93 |  | Fatigue Cracking (\%) | - |
| 94 |  | Thermal Fracture (ft/mile) | - |
| 95 |  | SPT Recommend Frequency (HZ) | 25 |
| 96 |  | Max Bonus, Y1 (\%) / Rutting | 110 |
| 97 |  | Max Penalty, Y2 (\%) / Rutting | 70 |
| 98 |  | Max PLD, X1 (yr) / Rutting | 6 |
| 99 |  | Max PLD, X2 (yr) / Rutting | -5 |
| 100 |  | PLD for No Bonus, X3 (yr) / Rutting | 2 |
| 101 |  | PLD for No Bonus, X4 (yr) / Rutting | -2 |
| 102 |  | PLD for Remove / Replace, X5 (yr) / Rutting | -7 |
| 103 |  | Max Bonus, Y1 (\%) / IRI | 0 |
| 104 |  | Max Penalty, Y2 (\%) / IRI | 0 |
| 105 |  | Min IRI, X1 (in/mile) / IRI | 30 |
| 106 |  | Min IRI, X2 (in/mile) / IRI | 80 |
| 107 |  | IRI for No Bonus, X3 (in/mile) | 60 |
| 108 |  | IRI for No Penalty, X4 (in/mile) | 70 |
| 109 | - | IRI for Corrective Action, X5 (in/mile) | 95 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 110 |  | Total Thickness | 0.891 |
| 111 |  | Layer Thickness | 0.723 |
| 112 |  | Air Voids - Va (\%) | 0.690 |
| 113 |  | Retained 3/4 | 0.830 |
| 114 |  | Retained 3/8 | 3.100 |
| 115 | Historical Standard Deviation for AC1 Rutting | Retained \#4 | 3.330 |
| 116 |  | Passing \#200 | 0.530 |
| 117 |  | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) | 0.220 |
| 118 |  | Bulk Density - Gmb | 0.011 |
| 119 |  | Gmm | 0.011 |
| 120 |  | Gsb | 0.015 |
| 121 |  | Total Thickness | 0.891 |
| 122 |  | Layer Thickness | 0.723 |
| 123 |  | Air Voids - Va (\%) | 0.690 |
| 124 |  | Retained 3/4 | 0.830 |
| 125 |  | Retained 3/8 | 3.100 |
| 126 | Historical Standard Deviation for AC2 Rutting | Retained \#4 | 3.330 |
| 127 |  | Passing \#200 | 0.530 |
| 128 |  | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) | 0.220 |
| 129 |  | Bulk Density - Gmb | 0.011 |
| 130 |  | Gmm | 0.011 |
| 131 |  | Gsb | 0.015 |
| 132 | General Information | Constant Tonnage | 600 |
| 133 |  | Lots | 5 |
| 134 |  | 1-1/2" | - |
| 135 |  | $1{ }^{\prime \prime}$ | - |
| 136 |  | $3 / 4^{\prime \prime}$ | 92 |
| 137 |  | 1/2" | - |
| 138 |  | $3 / 8{ }^{\prime \prime}$ | 53 |
| 139 |  | \#4 | 34 |
| 140 | (AC 1) In-SituAggregate | \#8 | - |
| 141 | Gradation | \#10 | - |
| 142 |  | \#16 | - |
| 143 |  | \#30 | - |
| 144 |  | \#40 | - |
| 145 |  | \#50 | - |
| 146 |  | \#100 | - |
| 147 |  | \#200 | 4.1 |
| 148 | (AC 1) In-Situ Volumetrics | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) | 4.7 |
| 149 |  | Maximum Theoretical Specific Gravity (Gmm) | 2.450 |
| 150 |  | In-Situ Bulk Density (PCF) | 140.650 |
| 151 |  | In-Situ Air Voids (\%) | 8.0 |
| 152 |  | Thickness (inch) | 1.5 |
| 153 |  | Gsb | 2.672 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 154 | General Information | Constant Tonnage | 600 |
| 155 | for AC2 | Lots | 5 |
| 156 | (AC 2) In-SituAggregate Gradation | 1-1/2" | - |
| 157 |  | $1^{\prime \prime}$ | - |
| 158 |  | 3/4" | 97 |
| 159 |  | 1/2" | - |
| 160 |  | 3/8" | 69 |
| 161 |  | \#4 | 43 |
| 162 |  | \#8 | - |
| 163 |  | \#10 | - |
| 164 |  | \#16 | - |
| 165 |  | \#30 | - |
| 166 |  | \#40 | - |
| 167 |  | \#50 | - |
| 168 |  | \#100 | - |
| 169 |  | \#200 | 2 |
| 170 | (AC 2) In-Situ Volumetrics | Asphalt Content by Weight (\%) | 4.7 |
| 171 |  | Maximum Theoretical Specific Gravity (Gmm) | 2.450 |
| 172 |  | In-Situ Bulk Density (PCF) | 143.707 |
| 173 |  | In-Situ Air Voids (\%) | 6.0 |
| 174 |  | Thickness (inch) | 5.0 |
| 175 |  | Gsb | 2.613 |

APPENDIX D. RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN SERVICE LIFE DIFFERENCES AND PWLS OF BINDER CONTENT ANALYSIS RESULTS

| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  | Mean | Standard <br> Deviation | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |
| 4.00 | 0.10 | 4 | 3.89 | 3.96 | 3.97 | 4.14 | 4.05 | 4.00 | 0.10 | 0 | -0.060 | -0.055 | -0.054 | -0.042 | -0.048 | -0.052 |
| 4.00 | 0.20 | 1 | 4.20 | 3.73 | 4.18 | 3.92 | 3.95 | 4.00 | 0.20 | 7 | -0.038 | -0.071 | -0.039 | -0.058 | -0.056 | -0.052 |
| 4.00 | 0.30 | 14 | 3.84 | 4.26 | 3.72 | 3.82 | 4.38 | 4.00 | 0.30 | 16 | -0.063 | -0.034 | -0.072 | -0.065 | -0.026 | -0.052 |
| 4.00 | 0.40 | 2 | 3.88 | 4.40 | 4.07 | 3.38 | 4.27 | 4.00 | 0.40 | 22 | -0.061 | -0.024 | -0.047 | -0.097 | -0.033 | -0.052 |
| 4.00 | 0.50 | 11 | 4.12 | 4.54 | 3.78 | 3.25 | 4.31 | 4.00 | 0.50 | 26 | -0.044 | -0.015 | -0.068 | -0.107 | -0.030 | -0.053 |
| 4.00 | 0.60 | 10 | 3.92 | 4.14 | 3.80 | 4.88 | 3.24 | 4.00 | 0.60 | 28 | -0.058 | -0.042 | -0.066 | 0.008 | -0.107 | -0.053 |
| 4.00 | 0.70 | 24 | 3.33 | 4.59 | 4.51 | 4.42 | 3.14 | 4.00 | 0.70 | 28 | -0.101 | -0.011 | -0.017 | -0.023 | -0.115 | -0.053 |
| 4.00 | 0.80 | 13 | 4.70 | 4.35 | 2.82 | 4.58 | 3.53 | 4.00 | 0.80 | 27 | -0.004 | -0.028 | -0.139 | -0.012 | -0.086 | -0.054 |
| 4.00 | 0.90 | 17 | 3.97 | 4.67 | 2.53 | 4.77 | 4.05 | 4.00 | 0.90 | 26 | -0.054 | -0.006 | -0.162 | 0.001 | -0.048 | -0.054 |
| 4.00 | 1.00 | 29 | 4.20 | 3.89 | 3.71 | 2.72 | 5.49 | 4.00 | 1.00 | 25 | -0.038 | -0.060 | -0.073 | -0.147 | 0.048 | -0.054 |
| 4.10 | 0.10 | 3 | 4.15 | 4.06 | 4.02 | 4.01 | 4.25 | 4.10 | 0.10 | 2 | -0.041 | -0.048 | -0.051 | -0.051 | -0.034 | -0.045 |
| 4.10 | 0.20 | 7 | 4.21 | 4.17 | 4.31 | 3.83 | 3.96 | 4.10 | 0.20 | 16 | -0.037 | -0.040 | -0.030 | -0.064 | -0.055 | -0.045 |
| 4.10 | 0.30 | 4 | 4.47 | 3.79 | 4.36 | 3.95 | 3.94 | 4.10 | 0.30 | 25 | -0.019 | -0.067 | -0.027 | -0.056 | -0.056 | -0.045 |
| 4.10 | 0.40 | 2 | 4.61 | 4.19 | 3.61 | 4.30 | 3.78 | 4.10 | 0.40 | 30 | -0.010 | -0.039 | -0.080 | -0.031 | -0.068 | -0.046 |
| 4.10 | 0.50 | 21 | 4.41 | 3.40 | 4.73 | 3.94 | 4.03 | 4.10 | 0.50 | 32 | -0.023 | -0.095 | -0.002 | -0.056 | -0.050 | -0.045 |
| 4.10 | 0.60 | 6 | 3.29 | 3.98 | 3.82 | 4.71 | 4.68 | 4.10 | 0.60 | 32 | -0.104 | -0.053 | -0.065 | -0.003 | -0.005 | -0.046 |
| 4.10 | 0.70 | 19 | 4.89 | 3.88 | 4.46 | 4.23 | 3.04 | 4.10 | 0.70 | 31 | 0.009 | -0.061 | -0.020 | -0.036 | -0.122 | -0.046 |
| 4.10 | 0.80 | 15 | 3.31 | 4.30 | 3.99 | 3.54 | 5.35 | 4.10 | 0.80 | 30 | -0.102 | -0.031 | -0.053 | -0.085 | 0.039 | -0.046 |
| 4.10 | 0.90 | 11 | 4.58 | 4.35 | 4.09 | 2.58 | 4.92 | 4.10 | 0.90 | 28 | -0.012 | -0.028 | -0.046 | -0.158 | 0.011 | -0.047 |
| 4.10 | 1.00 | 8 | 3.67 | 4.10 | 5.11 | 4.96 | 2.67 | 4.10 | 1.00 | 26 | -0.076 | -0.045 | 0.023 | 0.013 | -0.151 | -0.047 |
| 4.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 4.25 | 4.13 | 4.07 | 4.31 | 4.24 | 4.20 | 0.10 | 16 | -0.034 | -0.043 | -0.047 | -0.030 | -0.035 | -0.038 |
| 4.20 | 0.20 | 1 | 4.40 | 4.31 | 4.20 | 3.87 | 4.23 | 4.20 | 0.20 | 31 | -0.024 | -0.030 | -0.038 | -0.061 | -0.036 | -0.038 |
| 4.20 | 0.30 | 13 | 3.79 | 4.23 | 4.01 | 4.44 | 4.51 | 4.20 | 0.30 | 37 | -0.067 | -0.036 | -0.051 | -0.021 | -0.017 | -0.038 |
| 4.20 | 0.40 | 5 | 4.45 | 3.61 | 4.54 | 4.43 | 3.96 | 4.20 | 0.40 | 39 | -0.021 | -0.080 | -0.015 | -0.022 | -0.055 | -0.039 |
| 4.20 | 0.50 | 14 | 4.12 | 3.54 | 4.35 | 4.08 | 4.91 | 4.20 | 0.50 | 38 | -0.044 | -0.085 | -0.028 | -0.046 | 0.010 | -0.039 |


| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  | Mean | Standard <br> Deviation | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |
| 4.20 | 0.60 | 22 | 4.55 | 3.20 | 4.46 | 4.08 | 4.70 | 4.20 | 0.60 | 37 | -0.014 | -0.110 | -0.020 | -0.046 | -0.004 | -0.039 |
| 4.20 | 0.70 | 26 | 4.34 | 5.13 | 3.28 | 4.46 | 3.79 | 4.20 | 0.70 | 34 | -0.028 | 0.025 | -0.104 | -0.020 | -0.067 | -0.039 |
| 4.20 | 0.80 | 15 | 5.51 | 4.02 | 3.32 | 4.16 | 3.99 | 4.20 | 0.80 | 32 | 0.049 | -0.051 | -0.101 | -0.041 | -0.053 | -0.039 |
| 4.20 | 0.90 | 31 | 3.83 | 3.38 | 5.15 | 5.18 | 3.46 | 4.20 | 0.90 | 30 | -0.064 | -0.097 | 0.026 | 0.028 | -0.091 | -0.040 |
| 4.20 | 1.00 | 14 | 4.35 | 2.72 | 4.15 | 5.53 | 4.25 | 4.20 | 1.00 | 28 | -0.028 | -0.147 | -0.041 | 0.050 | -0.034 | -0.040 |
| 4.30 | 0.10 | 9 | 4.25 | 4.16 | 4.41 | 4.37 | 4.30 | 4.30 | 0.10 | 50 | -0.034 | -0.041 | -0.023 | -0.026 | -0.031 | -0.031 |
| 4.30 | 0.20 | 6 | 4.21 | 4.16 | 4.11 | 4.59 | 4.41 | 4.30 | 0.20 | 50 | -0.037 | -0.041 | -0.044 | -0.011 | -0.023 | -0.031 |
| 4.30 | 0.30 | 10 | 4.30 | 4.17 | 4.66 | 3.88 | 4.51 | 4.30 | 0.30 | 50 | -0.031 | -0.040 | -0.006 | -0.061 | -0.017 | -0.031 |
| 4.30 | 0.40 | 8 | 3.95 | 3.98 | 4.42 | 4.22 | 4.94 | 4.30 | 0.40 | 48 | -0.056 | -0.053 | -0.023 | -0.037 | 0.012 | -0.031 |
| 4.30 | 0.50 | 3 | 4.42 | 5.07 | 4.23 | 3.99 | 3.77 | 4.30 | 0.50 | 45 | -0.023 | 0.021 | -0.036 | -0.053 | -0.068 | -0.032 |
| 4.30 | 0.60 | 2 | 4.57 | 5.17 | 3.66 | 4.19 | 3.89 | 4.30 | 0.60 | 41 | -0.013 | 0.027 | -0.076 | -0.039 | -0.060 | -0.032 |
| 4.30 | 0.70 | 8 | 4.45 | 4.76 | 3.41 | 3.78 | 5.12 | 4.30 | 0.70 | 37 | -0.021 | 0.000 | -0.095 | -0.068 | 0.024 | -0.032 |
| 4.30 | 0.80 | 11 | 3.71 | 3.55 | 5.57 | 4.41 | 4.24 | 4.30 | 0.80 | 34 | -0.073 | -0.084 | 0.053 | -0.023 | -0.035 | -0.032 |
| 4.30 | 0.90 | 13 | 4.92 | 4.63 | 3.21 | 3.48 | 5.24 | 4.30 | 0.90 | 31 | 0.011 | -0.009 | -0.110 | -0.089 | 0.032 | -0.033 |
| 4.30 | 1.00 | 34 | 3.52 | 3.69 | 4.17 | 6.02 | 4.12 | 4.30 | 1.00 | 29 | -0.087 | -0.074 | -0.040 | 0.081 | -0.044 | -0.033 |
| 4.40 | 0.10 | 2 | 4.29 | 4.36 | 4.44 | 4.54 | 4.36 | 4.40 | 0.10 | 84 | -0.032 | -0.027 | -0.021 | -0.015 | -0.027 | -0.024 |
| 4.40 | 0.20 | 5 | 4.43 | 4.68 | 4.50 | 4.17 | 4.24 | 4.40 | 0.20 | 69 | -0.022 | -0.005 | -0.017 | -0.040 | -0.035 | -0.024 |
| 4.40 | 0.30 | 17 | 4.89 | 4.17 | 4.21 | 4.46 | 4.25 | 4.40 | 0.30 | 62 | 0.009 | -0.040 | -0.037 | -0.020 | -0.034 | -0.024 |
| 4.40 | 0.40 | 1 | 4.61 | 4.12 | 3.85 | 4.83 | 4.57 | 4.40 | 0.40 | 56 | -0.010 | -0.044 | -0.063 | 0.005 | -0.013 | -0.025 |
| 4.40 | 0.50 | 7 | 4.27 | 4.79 | 3.58 | 4.61 | 4.73 | 4.40 | 0.50 | 50 | -0.033 | 0.002 | -0.082 | -0.010 | -0.002 | -0.025 |
| 4.40 | 0.60 | 12 | 4.02 | 3.61 | 5.15 | 4.63 | 4.59 | 4.40 | 0.60 | 44 | -0.051 | -0.080 | 0.026 | -0.009 | -0.011 | -0.025 |
| 4.40 | 0.70 | 17 | 5.15 | 4.12 | 4.91 | 4.43 | 3.38 | 4.40 | 0.70 | 40 | 0.026 | -0.044 | 0.010 | -0.022 | -0.097 | -0.025 |
| 4.40 | 0.80 | 24 | 4.59 | 4.29 | 5.52 | 4.29 | 3.29 | 4.40 | 0.80 | 36 | -0.011 | -0.032 | 0.050 | -0.032 | -0.104 | -0.026 |
| 4.40 | 0.90 | 16 | 3.89 | 4.32 | 5.13 | 3.23 | 5.44 | 4.40 | 0.90 | 33 | -0.060 | -0.030 | 0.025 | -0.108 | 0.045 | -0.026 |
| 4.40 | 1.00 | 11 | 3.62 | 3.24 | 5.07 | 5.67 | 4.40 | 4.40 | 1.00 | 30 | -0.079 | -0.107 | 0.021 | 0.059 | -0.024 | -0.026 |
| 4.50 | 0.10 | 11 | 4.37 | 4.62 | 4.43 | 4.58 | 4.49 | 4.50 | 0.10 | 98 | -0.026 | -0.009 | -0.022 | -0.021 | -0.018 | -0.019 |
| 4.50 | 0.20 | 4 | 4.55 | 4.58 | 4.73 | 4.21 | 4.42 | 4.50 | 0.20 | 84 | -0.014 | -0.012 | -0.002 | -0.037 | -0.023 | -0.018 |


| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  | Mean | Standard <br> Deviation | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |
| 4.50 | 0.30 | 6 | 4.74 | 4.20 | 4.24 | 4.43 | 4.87 | 4.50 | 0.30 | 72 | -0.001 | -0.038 | -0.035 | -0.022 | 0.008 | -0.018 |
| 4.50 | 0.40 | 3 | 5.03 | 4.26 | 4.04 | 4.40 | 4.77 | 4.50 | 0.40 | 62 | 0.018 | -0.034 | -0.049 | -0.024 | 0.001 | -0.018 |
| 4.50 | 0.50 | 5 | 4.49 | 4.08 | 4.23 | 4.33 | 5.35 | 4.50 | 0.50 | 54 | -0.018 | -0.046 | -0.036 | -0.029 | 0.039 | -0.018 |
| 4.50 | 0.60 | 2 | 4.69 | 4.73 | 3.58 | 5.19 | 4.31 | 4.50 | 0.60 | 47 | -0.004 | -0.002 | -0.082 | 0.028 | -0.030 | -0.018 |
| 4.50 | 0.70 | 22 | 4.68 | 4.83 | 5.27 | 4.29 | 3.41 | 4.50 | 0.70 | 42 | -0.005 | 0.005 | 0.034 | -0.032 | -0.095 | -0.019 |
| 4.50 | 0.80 | 14 | 4.70 | 3.37 | 5.42 | 4.07 | 4.95 | 4.50 | 0.80 | 37 | -0.004 | -0.098 | 0.043 | -0.047 | 0.013 | -0.019 |
| 4.50 | 0.90 | 15 | 5.33 | 4.46 | 4.03 | 3.28 | 5.41 | 4.50 | 0.90 | 34 | 0.037 | -0.020 | -0.050 | -0.104 | 0.043 | -0.019 |
| 4.50 | 1.00 | 7 | 5.23 | 3.64 | 5.12 | 5.29 | 3.20 | 4.50 | 1.00 | 31 | 0.031 | -0.078 | 0.024 | 0.035 | -0.110 | -0.020 |
| 4.60 | 0.10 | 5 | 4.50 | 4.62 | 4.58 | 4.52 | 4.76 | 4.60 | 0.10 | 100 | -0.017 | -0.009 | -0.012 | -0.016 | 0.000 | -0.011 |
| 4.60 | 0.20 | 4 | 4.81 | 4.72 | 4.30 | 4.50 | 4.67 | 4.60 | 0.20 | 93 | 0.004 | -0.002 | -0.031 | -0.017 | -0.006 | -0.010 |
| 4.60 | 0.30 | 6 | 4.88 | 4.09 | 4.60 | 4.73 | 4.72 | 4.60 | 0.30 | 79 | 0.008 | -0.046 | -0.011 | -0.002 | -0.002 | -0.011 |
| 4.60 | 0.40 | 3 | 4.47 | 4.04 | 5.12 | 4.59 | 4.77 | 4.60 | 0.40 | 67 | -0.019 | -0.049 | 0.024 | -0.011 | 0.001 | -0.011 |
| 4.60 | 0.50 | 4 | 5.02 | 4.60 | 4.31 | 3.94 | 5.15 | 4.60 | 0.50 | 57 | 0.017 | -0.011 | -0.030 | -0.056 | 0.026 | -0.011 |
| 4.60 | 0.60 | 2 | 4.20 | 5.49 | 4.93 | 4.07 | 4.32 | 4.60 | 0.60 | 49 | -0.038 | 0.048 | 0.011 | -0.047 | -0.030 | -0.011 |
| 4.60 | 0.70 | 5 | 4.92 | 3.78 | 4.36 | 5.61 | 4.31 | 4.60 | 0.70 | 43 | 0.011 | -0.068 | -0.027 | 0.055 | -0.030 | -0.012 |
| 4.60 | 0.80 | 9 | 4.93 | 4.59 | 3.27 | 5.36 | 4.87 | 4.60 | 0.80 | 38 | 0.011 | -0.011 | -0.105 | 0.039 | 0.008 | -0.012 |
| 4.60 | 0.90 | 19 | 3.50 | 5.13 | 5.72 | 4.71 | 3.92 | 4.60 | 0.90 | 34 | -0.088 | 0.025 | 0.062 | -0.003 | -0.058 | -0.012 |
| 4.60 | 1.00 | 14 | 4.72 | 3.37 | 4.14 | 4.69 | 6.09 | 4.60 | 1.00 | 31 | -0.002 | -0.098 | -0.042 | -0.004 | 0.085 | -0.012 |
| 4.70 | 0.10 | 16 | 4.82 | 4.64 | 4.58 | 4.77 | 4.70 | 4.70 | 0.10 | 100 | 0.004 | -0.008 | -0.012 | 0.001 | -0.004 | -0.004 |
| 4.70 | 0.20 | 13 | 4.49 | 4.79 | 4.47 | 4.89 | 4.85 | 4.70 | 0.20 | 95 | -0.018 | 0.002 | -0.019 | 0.009 | 0.006 | -0.004 |
| 4.70 | 0.30 | 6 | 4.28 | 4.80 | 4.69 | 5.11 | 4.64 | 4.70 | 0.30 | 82 | -0.032 | 0.003 | -0.004 | 0.023 | -0.008 | -0.004 |
| 4.70 | 0.40 | 5 | 5.37 | 4.72 | 4.55 | 4.45 | 4.39 | 4.70 | 0.40 | 68 | 0.040 | -0.002 | -0.014 | -0.021 | -0.025 | -0.004 |
| 4.70 | 0.50 | 20 | 4.70 | 4.43 | 5.48 | 4.13 | 4.76 | 4.70 | 0.50 | 58 | -0.004 | -0.022 | 0.047 | -0.043 | 0.000 | -0.004 |
| 4.70 | 0.60 | 3 | 4.92 | 4.68 | 5.48 | 3.81 | 4.61 | 4.70 | 0.60 | 50 | 0.011 | -0.005 | 0.047 | -0.066 | -0.010 | -0.005 |
| 4.70 | 0.70 | 4 | 4.12 | 5.54 | 4.15 | 4.29 | 5.38 | 4.70 | 0.70 | 43 | -0.044 | 0.051 | -0.041 | -0.032 | 0.041 | -0.005 |
| 4.70 | 0.80 | 17 | 5.31 | 5.04 | 3.63 | 5.43 | 4.07 | 4.70 | 0.80 | 38 | 0.036 | 0.019 | -0.079 | 0.044 | -0.047 | -0.005 |
| 4.70 | 0.90 | 2 | 5.24 | 5.07 | 5.14 | 4.94 | 3.09 | 4.70 | 0.90 | 34 | 0.032 | 0.021 | 0.025 | 0.012 | -0.119 | -0.006 |


| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  | Mean | Standard <br> Deviation | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |
| 4.70 | 1.00 | 24 | 3.28 | 6.09 | 4.82 | 4.72 | 4.60 | 4.70 | 1.00 | 31 | -0.104 | 0.085 | 0.004 | -0.002 | -0.011 | -0.006 |
| 4.80 | 0.10 | 4 | 4.64 | 4.82 | 4.76 | 4.85 | 4.91 | 4.80 | 0.10 | 100 | -0.008 | 0.004 | 0.000 | 0.006 | 0.010 | 0.002 |
| 4.80 | 0.20 | 2 | 4.59 | 4.63 | 4.93 | 5.05 | 4.79 | 4.80 | 0.20 | 93 | -0.011 | -0.009 | 0.011 | 0.019 | 0.002 | 0.002 |
| 4.80 | 0.30 | 3 | 4.87 | 4.78 | 4.64 | 4.46 | 5.25 | 4.80 | 0.30 | 79 | 0.008 | 0.002 | -0.008 | -0.020 | 0.032 | 0.003 |
| 4.80 | 0.40 | 2 | 4.79 | 5.45 | 4.65 | 4.73 | 4.36 | 4.80 | 0.40 | 67 | 0.002 | 0.045 | -0.007 | -0.002 | -0.027 | 0.002 |
| 4.80 | 0.50 | 2 | 4.97 | 4.98 | 4.33 | 4.26 | 5.46 | 4.80 | 0.50 | 57 | 0.014 | 0.015 | -0.029 | -0.034 | 0.046 | 0.002 |
| 4.80 | 0.60 | 1 | 4.62 | 4.98 | 4.06 | 4.67 | 5.69 | 4.80 | 0.60 | 49 | -0.009 | 0.015 | -0.048 | -0.006 | 0.060 | 0.002 |
| 4.80 | 0.70 | 20 | 4.53 | 4.59 | 3.89 | 5.43 | 5.57 | 4.80 | 0.70 | 43 | -0.015 | -0.011 | -0.060 | 0.044 | 0.053 | 0.002 |
| 4.80 | 0.80 | 16 | 4.38 | 5.76 | 3.70 | 4.88 | 5.28 | 4.80 | 0.80 | 38 | -0.026 | 0.065 | -0.073 | 0.008 | 0.034 | 0.002 |
| 4.80 | 0.90 | 7 | 5.82 | 5.61 | 3.77 | 4.14 | 4.66 | 4.80 | 0.90 | 34 | 0.068 | 0.055 | -0.068 | -0.042 | -0.006 | 0.001 |
| 4.80 | 1.00 | 25 | 6.04 | 5.07 | 4.23 | 3.43 | 5.21 | 4.80 | 1.00 | 31 | 0.082 | 0.021 | -0.036 | -0.093 | 0.030 | 0.001 |
| 4.90 | 0.10 | 4 | 4.90 | 4.93 | 4.75 | 4.93 | 5.01 | 4.90 | 0.10 | 98 | 0.010 | 0.011 | 0.000 | 0.011 | 0.017 | 0.010 |
| 4.90 | 0.20 | 10 | 5.21 | 4.92 | 4.68 | 4.91 | 4.77 | 4.90 | 0.20 | 84 | 0.030 | 0.011 | -0.005 | 0.010 | 0.001 | 0.009 |
| 4.90 | 0.30 | 11 | 4.51 | 4.73 | 5.13 | 5.24 | 4.88 | 4.90 | 0.30 | 72 | -0.017 | -0.002 | 0.025 | 0.032 | 0.008 | 0.009 |
| 4.90 | 0.40 | 5 | 4.72 | 5.27 | 5.38 | 4.49 | 4.65 | 4.90 | 0.40 | 62 | -0.002 | 0.034 | 0.041 | -0.018 | -0.007 | 0.010 |
| 4.90 | 0.50 | 6 | 4.82 | 5.47 | 4.55 | 5.34 | 4.32 | 4.90 | 0.50 | 54 | 0.004 | 0.046 | -0.014 | 0.038 | -0.030 | 0.009 |
| 4.90 | 0.60 | 2 | 5.20 | 4.41 | 4.56 | 4.50 | 5.82 | 4.90 | 0.60 | 47 | 0.029 | -0.023 | -0.013 | -0.017 | 0.068 | 0.009 |
| 4.90 | 0.70 | 27 | 5.41 | 5.02 | 4.63 | 3.84 | 5.61 | 4.90 | 0.70 | 42 | 0.043 | 0.017 | -0.009 | -0.063 | 0.055 | 0.009 |
| 4.90 | 0.80 | 5 | 5.82 | 5.72 | 4.17 | 4.53 | 4.27 | 4.90 | 0.80 | 37 | 0.068 | 0.062 | -0.040 | -0.015 | -0.033 | 0.008 |
| 4.90 | 0.90 | 14 | 4.52 | 5.64 | 4.24 | 6.06 | 4.04 | 4.90 | 0.90 | 34 | -0.016 | 0.057 | -0.035 | 0.083 | -0.049 | 0.008 |
| 4.90 | 1.00 | 13 | 6.18 | 4.47 | 5.75 | 4.02 | 4.09 | 4.90 | 1.00 | 31 | 0.090 | -0.019 | 0.064 | -0.051 | -0.046 | 0.008 |
| 5.00 | 0.10 | 1 | 4.97 | 5.12 | 4.85 | 4.98 | 5.06 | 5.00 | 0.10 | 84 | 0.014 | 0.024 | 0.006 | 0.015 | 0.020 | 0.016 |
| 5.00 | 0.20 | 1 | 4.94 | 5.15 | 5.24 | 4.91 | 4.75 | 5.00 | 0.20 | 69 | 0.012 | 0.026 | 0.032 | 0.010 | 0.000 | 0.016 |
| 5.00 | 0.30 | 2 | 4.73 | 5.23 | 4.64 | 5.32 | 5.08 | 5.00 | 0.30 | 62 | -0.002 | 0.031 | -0.008 | 0.037 | 0.021 | 0.016 |
| 5.00 | 0.40 | 24 | 5.18 | 5.42 | 5.24 | 4.59 | 4.56 | 5.00 | 0.40 | 56 | 0.028 | 0.043 | 0.032 | -0.011 | -0.013 | 0.016 |
| 5.00 | 0.50 | 10 | 5.36 | 5.14 | 4.62 | 4.35 | 5.53 | 5.00 | 0.50 | 50 | 0.039 | 0.025 | -0.009 | -0.028 | 0.050 | 0.015 |
| 5.00 | 0.60 | 12 | 4.16 | 4.76 | 4.89 | 5.63 | 5.53 | 5.00 | 0.60 | 44 | -0.041 | 0.000 | 0.009 | 0.056 | 0.050 | 0.015 |


| Target |  | Sample Number | Samples |  |  |  |  | Mean | Standard <br> Deviation | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |
| 5.00 | 0.70 | 22 | 5.32 | 4.01 | 5.43 | 4.55 | 5.68 | 5.00 | 0.70 | 40 | 0.037 | -0.051 | 0.044 | -0.014 | 0.060 | 0.015 |
| 5.00 | 0.80 | 14 | 5.27 | 5.56 | 3.60 | 5.15 | 5.44 | 5.00 | 0.80 | 36 | 0.034 | 0.052 | -0.081 | 0.026 | 0.045 | 0.015 |
| 5.00 | 0.90 | 6 | 4.51 | 5.36 | 4.64 | 4.12 | 6.39 | 5.00 | 0.90 | 33 | -0.017 | 0.039 | -0.008 | -0.041 | 0.103 | 0.015 |
| 5.00 | 1.00 | 16 | 5.39 | 5.92 | 5.80 | 4.16 | 3.72 | 5.00 | 1.00 | 30 | 0.041 | 0.074 | 0.067 | -0.041 | -0.072 | 0.014 |
| 5.10 | 0.10 | 5 | 5.14 | 5.01 | 4.98 | 5.15 | 5.20 | 5.10 | 0.10 | 50 | 0.025 | 0.017 | 0.015 | 0.026 | 0.029 | 0.022 |
| 5.10 | 0.20 | 8 | 5.38 | 4.96 | 5.17 | 4.87 | 5.11 | 5.10 | 0.20 | 50 | 0.041 | 0.013 | 0.027 | 0.008 | 0.023 | 0.022 |
| 5.10 | 0.30 | 4 | 4.85 | 5.38 | 4.79 | 5.02 | 5.44 | 5.10 | 0.30 | 50 | 0.006 | 0.041 | 0.002 | 0.017 | 0.045 | 0.022 |
| 5.10 | 0.40 | 2 | 4.87 | 5.70 | 4.84 | 4.77 | 5.31 | 5.10 | 0.40 | 48 | 0.008 | 0.061 | 0.006 | 0.001 | 0.036 | 0.022 |
| 5.10 | 0.50 | 9 | 4.95 | 4.92 | 5.60 | 4.43 | 5.58 | 5.10 | 0.50 | 45 | 0.013 | 0.011 | 0.055 | -0.022 | 0.053 | 0.022 |
| 5.10 | 0.60 | 8 | 5.71 | 4.39 | 5.40 | 5.48 | 4.51 | 5.10 | 0.60 | 41 | 0.061 | -0.025 | 0.042 | 0.047 | -0.017 | 0.022 |
| 5.10 | 0.70 | 3 | 5.68 | 4.23 | 5.41 | 4.45 | 5.71 | 5.10 | 0.70 | 37 | 0.060 | -0.036 | 0.043 | -0.021 | 0.061 | 0.021 |
| 5.10 | 0.80 | 14 | 3.85 | 4.87 | 5.75 | 5.84 | 5.18 | 5.10 | 0.80 | 34 | -0.063 | 0.008 | 0.064 | 0.070 | 0.028 | 0.021 |
| 5.10 | 0.90 | 27 | 5.41 | 5.66 | 5.56 | 3.51 | 5.37 | 5.10 | 0.90 | 31 | 0.043 | 0.058 | 0.052 | -0.087 | 0.040 | 0.021 |
| 5.10 | 1.00 | 24 | 5.72 | 4.28 | 6.56 | 4.37 | 4.59 | 5.10 | 1.00 | 29 | 0.062 | -0.032 | 0.113 | -0.026 | -0.011 | 0.021 |
| 5.20 | 0.10 | 2 | 5.24 | 5.09 | 5.09 | 5.23 | 5.33 | 5.20 | 0.10 | 16 | 0.032 | 0.022 | 0.022 | 0.031 | 0.037 | 0.029 |
| 5.20 | 0.20 | 3 | 5.46 | 5.26 | 5.21 | 4.91 | 5.16 | 5.20 | 0.20 | 31 | 0.046 | 0.033 | 0.030 | 0.010 | 0.027 | 0.029 |
| 5.20 | 0.30 | 7 | 5.10 | 4.86 | 5.11 | 5.27 | 5.66 | 5.20 | 0.30 | 37 | 0.023 | 0.007 | 0.023 | 0.034 | 0.058 | 0.029 |
| 5.20 | 0.40 | 4 | 5.53 | 5.53 | 4.65 | 5.38 | 4.90 | 5.20 | 0.40 | 39 | 0.050 | 0.050 | -0.007 | 0.041 | 0.010 | 0.029 |
| 5.20 | 0.50 | 16 | 4.91 | 5.14 | 5.38 | 5.93 | 4.62 | 5.20 | 0.50 | 38 | 0.010 | 0.025 | 0.041 | 0.075 | -0.009 | 0.028 |
| 5.20 | 0.60 | 5 | 5.05 | 5.08 | 6.16 | 5.19 | 4.51 | 5.20 | 0.60 | 37 | 0.019 | 0.021 | 0.089 | 0.028 | -0.017 | 0.028 |
| 5.20 | 0.70 | 6 | 4.67 | 5.46 | 6.21 | 4.43 | 5.25 | 5.20 | 0.70 | 34 | -0.006 | 0.046 | 0.092 | -0.022 | 0.032 | 0.028 |
| 5.20 | 0.80 | 11 | 4.60 | 5.09 | 5.50 | 4.42 | 6.41 | 5.20 | 0.80 | 32 | -0.011 | 0.022 | 0.048 | -0.023 | 0.104 | 0.028 |
| 5.20 | 0.90 | 23 | 4.95 | 5.15 | 6.73 | 4.41 | 4.74 | 5.20 | 0.90 | 30 | 0.013 | 0.026 | 0.123 | -0.023 | -0.001 | 0.028 |
| 5.20 | 1.00 | 14 | 6.03 | 5.66 | 5.98 | 3.75 | 4.59 | 5.20 | 1.00 | 28 | 0.081 | 0.058 | 0.078 | -0.070 | -0.011 | 0.027 |
| 5.30 | 0.10 | 1 | 5.32 | 5.19 | 5.45 | 5.26 | 5.27 | 5.30 | 0.10 | 2 | 0.037 | 0.028 | 0.045 | 0.033 | 0.034 | 0.035 |
| 5.30 | 0.20 | 4 | 5.33 | 5.03 | 5.47 | 5.50 | 5.17 | 5.30 | 0.20 | 16 | 0.037 | 0.018 | 0.046 | 0.048 | 0.027 | 0.035 |
| 5.30 | 0.30 | 1 | 5.01 | 5.39 | 4.95 | 5.60 | 5.55 | 5.30 | 0.30 | 25 | 0.017 | 0.041 | 0.013 | 0.055 | 0.051 | 0.035 |

TABLE
(Continued)

| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  | Mean | Standard <br> Deviation | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. Dev. |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot 3 | Sublot 4 | Sublot 5 |  |
| 5.30 | 0.40 | 7 | 5.07 | 4.78 | 5.38 | 5.39 | 5.86 | 5.30 | 0.40 | 30 | 0.021 | 0.002 | 0.041 | 0.041 | 0.071 | 0.035 |
| 5.30 | 0.50 | 12 | 6.01 | 5.18 | 4.62 | 5.45 | 5.26 | 5.30 | 0.50 | 32 | 0.080 | 0.028 | -0.009 | 0.045 | 0.033 | 0.035 |
| 5.30 | 0.60 | 19 | 4.55 | 5.92 | 5.62 | 4.77 | 5.65 | 5.30 | 0.60 | 32 | -0.014 | 0.074 | 0.056 | 0.001 | 0.058 | 0.035 |
| 5.30 | 0.70 | 9 | 4.90 | 6.21 | 5.14 | 4.45 | 5.78 | 5.30 | 0.70 | 31 | 0.010 | 0.092 | 0.025 | -0.021 | 0.066 | 0.034 |
| 5.30 | 0.80 | 22 | 4.28 | 6.25 | 5.48 | 4.72 | 5.79 | 5.30 | 0.80 | 30 | -0.032 | 0.095 | 0.047 | -0.002 | 0.066 | 0.035 |
| 5.30 | 0.90 | 14 | 6.52 | 5.79 | 4.65 | 5.28 | 4.27 | 5.30 | 0.90 | 28 | 0.111 | 0.066 | -0.007 | 0.034 | -0.033 | 0.034 |
| 5.30 | 1.00 | 26 | 5.99 | 4.32 | 4.66 | 4.86 | 6.69 | 5.30 | 1.00 | 26 | 0.079 | -0.030 | -0.006 | 0.007 | 0.121 | 0.034 |
| 5.40 | 0.10 | 3 | 5.52 | 5.24 | 5.36 | 5.42 | 5.44 | 5.40 | 0.10 | 0 | 0.050 | 0.032 | 0.039 | 0.043 | 0.045 | 0.042 |
| 5.40 | 0.20 | 5 | 5.72 | 5.44 | 5.20 | 5.36 | 5.28 | 5.40 | 0.20 | 7 | 0.062 | 0.045 | 0.029 | 0.039 | 0.034 | 0.042 |
| 5.40 | 0.30 | 1 | 5.01 | 5.61 | 5.72 | 5.18 | 5.46 | 5.40 | 0.30 | 16 | 0.017 | 0.055 | 0.062 | 0.028 | 0.046 | 0.042 |
| 5.40 | 0.40 | 9 | 5.62 | 5.37 | 4.81 | 5.31 | 5.88 | 5.40 | 0.40 | 22 | 0.056 | 0.040 | 0.004 | 0.036 | 0.072 | 0.042 |
| 5.40 | 0.50 | 15 | 4.93 | 5.06 | 5.62 | 6.17 | 5.24 | 5.40 | 0.50 | 26 | 0.011 | 0.020 | 0.056 | 0.090 | 0.032 | 0.042 |
| 5.40 | 0.60 | 12 | 5.41 | 4.97 | 5.13 | 5.06 | 6.44 | 5.40 | 0.60 | 28 | 0.043 | 0.014 | 0.025 | 0.020 | 0.106 | 0.042 |
| 5.40 | 0.70 | 21 | 6.39 | 4.70 | 4.79 | 5.75 | 5.39 | 5.40 | 0.70 | 28 | 0.103 | -0.004 | 0.002 | 0.064 | 0.041 | 0.041 |
| 5.40 | 0.80 | 24 | 6.06 | 5.91 | 5.70 | 4.07 | 5.27 | 5.40 | 0.80 | 27 | 0.083 | 0.074 | 0.061 | -0.047 | 0.034 | 0.041 |
| 5.40 | 0.90 | 14 | 5.92 | 6.24 | 4.09 | 5.91 | 4.85 | 5.40 | 0.90 | 26 | 0.074 | 0.094 | -0.046 | 0.074 | 0.006 | 0.040 |
| 5.40 | 1.00 | 13 | 4.61 | 5.01 | 4.63 | 6.99 | 5.77 | 5.40 | 1.00 | 25 | -0.010 | 0.017 | -0.009 | 0.138 | 0.065 | 0.040 |

APPENDIX E. RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN SERVICE LIFE DIFFERENCES AND PWLS OF ROADWAY CORE DENSITY ANALYSIS

| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | MeanStandard <br> Deviation |  | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. <br> Dev. |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 1-1 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 1-2 \end{gathered}$ | Sublot 2-1 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 2-2 \end{gathered}$ | Sublot 3-1 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 3-2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 4-1 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 4-2 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 5-1 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 5-2 \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 1 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Sublot <br> 2 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 3 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Sublot 4 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 5 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  |
| 5.50 | 0.10 | 1 | 5.34 | 5.37 | 5.47 | 5.48 | 5.49 | 5.51 | 5.53 | 5.53 | 5.60 | 5.67 | 5.50 | 0.10 |  | 100 | -0.349 | -0.335 | -0.333 | -0.329 | -0.318 | -0.333 |
| 5.50 | 0.20 | 7 | 5.15 | 5.32 | 5.34 | 5.39 | 5.45 | 5.56 | 5.67 | 5.68 | 5.68 | 5.73 | 5.50 | 0.20 | 100 | -0.362 | -0.348 | -0.332 | -0.313 | -0.310 | -0.333 |
| 5.50 | 0.30 | 1 | 5.06 | 5.21 | 5.25 | 5.26 | 5.51 | 5.51 | 5.71 | 5.74 | 5.77 | 5.97 | 5.50 | 0.30 | 100 | -0.372 | -0.359 | -0.332 | -0.307 | -0.291 | -0.332 |
| 5.50 | 0.40 | 11 | 5.05 | 5.12 | 5.22 | 5.33 | 5.34 | 5.37 | 5.42 | 5.89 | 5.99 | 6.23 | 5.50 | 0.40 | 100 | -0.377 | -0.357 | -0.349 | -0.315 | -0.262 | -0.332 |
| 5.50 | 0.50 | 9 | 4.61 | 4.98 | 5.13 | 5.27 | 5.50 | 5.56 | 5.74 | 5.92 | 6.09 | 6.15 | 5.50 | 0.50 | 100 | -0.406 | -0.365 | -0.329 | -0.295 | -0.261 | -0.331 |
| 5.50 | 0.60 | 6 | 4.63 | 5.02 | 5.04 | 5.05 | 5.16 | 5.52 | 5.96 | 6.16 | 6.19 | 6.24 | 5.50 | 0.60 | 100 | -0.403 | -0.381 | -0.350 | -0.268 | -0.249 | -0.330 |
| 5.50 | 0.70 | 21 | 4.40 | 4.64 | 4.84 | 5.43 | 5.44 | 5.55 | 5.82 | 6.25 | 6.26 | 6.40 | 5.50 | 0.70 | 100 | -0.433 | -0.371 | -0.333 | -0.271 | -0.235 | -0.329 |
| 5.50 | 0.80 | 5 | 3.83 | 4.86 | 4.95 | 5.38 | 5.39 | 5.67 | 5.93 | 6.20 | 6.33 | 6.45 | 5.50 | 0.80 | 100 | -0.445 | -0.369 | -0.329 | -0.267 | -0.227 | -0.327 |
| 5.50 | 0.90 | 16 | 4.04 | 4.40 | 4.97 | 5.13 | 5.14 | 5.81 | 6.15 | 6.16 | 6.40 | 6.75 | 5.50 | 0.90 | 100 | -0.460 | -0.381 | -0.334 | -0.256 | -0.204 | -0.327 |
| 5.50 | 1.00 | 3 | 3.83 | 4.45 | 4.89 | 5.10 | 5.36 | 5.37 | 5.97 | 6.60 | 6.72 | 6.74 | 5.50 | 1.00 | 100 | -0.466 | -0.387 | -0.347 | -0.240 | -0.183 | -0.325 |
| 5.50 | 1.10 | 18 | 3.89 | 4.13 | 4.35 | 5.20 | 5.33 | 5.95 | 6.09 | 6.62 | 6.62 | 6.85 | 5.50 | 1.10 | 100 | -0.478 | -0.406 | -0.316 | -0.231 | -0.183 | -0.323 |
| 5.50 | 1.20 | 29 | 4.04 | 4.16 | 4.27 | 4.94 | 5.49 | 5.68 | 6.12 | 6.19 | 6.19 | 7.90 | 5.50 | 1.20 | 100 | -0.470 | -0.424 | -0.323 | -0.256 | -0.133 | -0.321 |
| 5.50 | 1.30 | 3 | 3.54 | 4.01 | 4.53 | 4.94 | 4.97 | 5.83 | 6.41 | 6.46 | 7.02 | 7.33 | 5.50 | 1.30 | 100 | -0.496 | -0.412 | -0.342 | -0.222 | -0.124 | -0.319 |
| 5.50 | 1.40 | 28 | 3.19 | 4.53 | 4.66 | 4.74 | 5.04 | 5.24 | 6.21 | 6.24 | 7.26 | 7.86 | 5.50 | 1.40 | 99 | -0.483 | -0.416 | -0.372 | -0.248 | -0.069 | -0.318 |
| 5.50 | 1.50 | 6 | 3.41 | 3.45 | 4.67 | 5.03 | 5.29 | 5.45 | 5.92 | 6.69 | 6.85 | 8.19 | 5.50 | 1.50 | 99 | -0.523 | -0.401 | -0.347 | -0.237 | -0.070 | -0.316 |
| 5.50 | 1.60 | 16 | 2.27 | 4.82 | 4.87 | 4.93 | 4.95 | 5.66 | 5.85 | 5.96 | 7.69 | 7.95 | 5.50 | 1.60 | 99 | -0.482 | -0.396 | -0.353 | -0.286 | -0.030 | -0.309 |
| 5.50 | 1.70 | 4 | 2.79 | 3.22 | 4.96 | 4.97 | 5.25 | 5.25 | 6.20 | 7.11 | 7.11 | 8.16 | 5.50 | 1.70 | 98 | -0.551 | -0.389 | -0.360 | -0.192 | -0.056 | -0.310 |
| 5.50 | 1.80 | 12 | 3.35 | 3.56 | 4.75 | 4.76 | 4.76 | 5.19 | 5.60 | 5.99 | 7.92 | 9.10 | 5.50 | 1.80 | 97 | -0.521 | -0.410 | -0.388 | -0.299 | 0.078 | -0.308 |
| 5.50 | 1.90 | 7 | 2.63 | 3.00 | 4.43 | 4.79 | 5.09 | 5.71 | 6.01 | 7.73 | 7.75 | 7.89 | 5.50 | 1.90 | 97 | -0.562 | -0.424 | -0.343 | -0.156 | -0.031 | -0.303 |
| 5.50 | 2.00 | 10 | 2.92 | 3.48 | 3.93 | 4.45 | 4.61 | 5.01 | 6.70 | 7.03 | 8.36 | 8.46 | 5.50 | 2.00 | 96 | -0.545 | -0.462 | -0.405 | -0.166 | 0.059 | -0.304 |
| 6.00 | 0.10 | 3 | 5.84 | 5.89 | 5.97 | 5.97 | 5.98 | 6.02 | 6.02 | 6.07 | 6.09 | 6.19 | 6.00 | 0.10 | 100 | -0.291 | -0.279 | -0.275 | -0.270 | -0.258 | -0.275 |
| 6.00 | 0.20 | 1 | 5.68 | 5.75 | 5.78 | 5.96 | 6.01 | 6.03 | 6.09 | 6.20 | 6.23 | 6.23 | 6.00 | 0.20 | 100 | -0.308 | -0.291 | -0.273 | -0.258 | -0.247 | -0.275 |
| 6.00 | 0.30 | 2 | 5.31 | 5.83 | 5.88 | 5.93 | 5.93 | 6.11 | 6.13 | 6.21 | 6.31 | 6.35 | 6.00 | 0.30 | 100 | -0.324 | -0.286 | -0.273 | -0.255 | -0.235 | -0.275 |
| 6.00 | 0.40 | 4 | 5.49 | 5.61 | 5.64 | 5.79 | 5.89 | 5.91 | 6.09 | 6.30 | 6.61 | 6.63 | 6.00 | 0.40 | 100 | -0.327 | -0.309 | -0.287 | -0.252 | -0.198 | -0.275 |
| 6.00 | 0.50 | 9 | 5.07 | 5.60 | 5.62 | 5.89 | 5.92 | 6.15 | 6.19 | 6.20 | 6.66 | 6.71 | 6.00 | 0.50 | 100 | -0.350 | -0.304 | -0.271 | -0.251 | -0.189 | -0.273 |
| 6.00 | 0.60 | 7 | 5.00 | 5.44 | 5.53 | 5.97 | 5.99 | 5.99 | 6.21 | 6.22 | 6.42 | 7.19 | 6.00 | 0.60 | 100 | -0.363 | -0.304 | -0.276 | -0.249 | -0.173 | -0.273 |
| 6.00 | 0.70 | 1 | 5.21 | 5.29 | 5.31 | 5.52 | 5.86 | 6.11 | 6.34 | 6.47 | 6.55 | 7.37 | 6.00 | 0.70 | 100 | -0.360 | -0.342 | -0.277 | -0.225 | -0.152 | -0.271 |
| 6.00 | 0.80 | 13 | 5.05 | 5.15 | 5.32 | 5.62 | 5.67 | 5.92 | 6.16 | 6.79 | 6.84 | 7.45 | 6.00 | 0.80 | 100 | -0.376 | -0.336 | -0.299 | -0.216 | -0.127 | -0.271 |
| 6.00 | 0.90 | 14 | 4.62 | 4.98 | 5.06 | 5.72 | 5.96 | 6.10 | 6.53 | 6.86 | 6.95 | 7.19 | 6.00 | 0.90 | 100 | -0.406 | -0.344 | -0.272 | -0.188 | -0.138 | -0.270 |

TABLE
(Continued)
TABLE
(Continued)
TABLE
(Continued)
TABLE
(Continued)
TABLE
(Continued)

| Target |  | Sample <br> Number | Samples |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Standard <br> Deviation | PWL | Service Life Differences |  |  |  |  | Mean |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Mean | St. <br> Dev. |  | Sublot 1-1 | Sublot 1-2 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 2-1 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 2-2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 3-1 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 3-2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 4-1 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 4-2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 5-1 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 5-2 \end{gathered}$ | Mean |  |  | Sublot 1 | Sublot 2 | Sublot <br> 3 | Sublot 4 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Sublot } \\ 5 \end{gathered}$ |  |
| 10.00 | 0.50 | 7 | 9.33 | 9.48 | 9.49 | 9.71 | 9.84 | 10.15 | 10.32 | 10.43 | 10.46 | 10.82 | 10.00 | 0.50 | 2 | 0.224 | 0.257 | 0.328 | 0.398 | 0.448 | 0.331 |
| 10.00 | 0.60 | 3 | 8.80 | 9.16 | 9.83 | 9.99 | 10.10 | 10.19 | 10.33 | 10.45 | 10.57 | 10.60 | 10.00 | 0.60 | 5 | 0.151 | 0.313 | 0.355 | 0.401 | 0.438 | 0.332 |
| 10.00 | 0.70 | 2 | 8.66 | 9.32 | 9.77 | 9.80 | 9.82 | 10.04 | 10.27 | 10.51 | 10.69 | 11.11 | 10.00 | 0.70 | 8 | 0.154 | 0.290 | 0.316 | 0.401 | 0.498 | 0.332 |
| 10.00 | 0.80 | 5 | 8.39 | 9.05 | 9.77 | 9.78 | 9.97 | 10.15 | 10.59 | 10.62 | 10.73 | 10.90 | 10.00 | 0.80 | 11 | 0.109 | 0.289 | 0.340 | 0.442 | 0.482 | 0.332 |
| 10.00 | 0.90 | 8 | 8.89 | 9.19 | 9.31 | 9.40 | 9.55 | 9.86 | 10.38 | 10.79 | 11.20 | 11.45 | 10.00 | 0.90 | 13 | 0.161 | 0.215 | 0.276 | 0.437 | 0.582 | 0.334 |
| 10.00 | 1.00 | 13 | 8.25 | 8.78 | 9.41 | 9.63 | 10.22 | 10.28 | 10.36 | 10.46 | 11.16 | 11.48 | 10.00 | 1.00 | 16 | 0.076 | 0.243 | 0.375 | 0.405 | 0.581 | 0.336 |
| 10.00 | 1.10 | 11 | 8.44 | 8.89 | 8.90 | 9.30 | 10.23 | 10.34 | 10.36 | 10.80 | 10.83 | 11.95 | 10.00 | 1.10 | 18 | 0.100 | 0.172 | 0.381 | 0.437 | 0.598 | 0.338 |
| 10.00 | 1.20 | 18 | 8.24 | 8.90 | 9.14 | 9.55 | 9.76 | 10.23 | 10.28 | 10.60 | 10.76 | 12.58 | 10.00 | 1.20 | 20 | 0.085 | 0.213 | 0.328 | 0.410 | 0.661 | 0.339 |
| 10.00 | 1.30 | 21 | 8.09 | 8.84 | 8.90 | 9.92 | 10.01 | 10.27 | 10.32 | 10.32 | 10.45 | 12.90 | 10.00 | 1.30 | 22 | 0.069 | 0.226 | 0.354 | 0.388 | 0.670 | 0.341 |
| 10.00 | 1.40 | 14 | 8.12 | 8.53 | 8.77 | 8.91 | 9.43 | 10.85 | 10.88 | 10.98 | 11.33 | 12.15 | 10.00 | 1.40 | 24 | 0.046 | 0.128 | 0.359 | 0.504 | 0.668 | 0.341 |
| 10.00 | 1.50 | 12 | 7.82 | 8.08 | 9.27 | 9.74 | 9.86 | 9.97 | 10.18 | 10.41 | 12.26 | 12.41 | 10.00 | 1.50 | 25 | -0.012 | 0.241 | 0.314 | 0.383 | 0.794 | 0.344 |
| 10.00 | 1.60 | 11 | 7.79 | 8.65 | 8.75 | 8.89 | 9.65 | 10.03 | 10.80 | 11.06 | 11.18 | 13.21 | 10.00 | 1.60 | 27 | 0.031 | 0.125 | 0.300 | 0.504 | 0.774 | 0.347 |
| 10.00 | 1.70 | 21 | 7.62 | 8.59 | 8.64 | 9.64 | 9.69 | 9.84 | 10.63 | 10.77 | 10.80 | 13.82 | 10.00 | 1.70 | 28 | 0.014 | 0.180 | 0.287 | 0.460 | 0.815 | 0.351 |
| 10.00 | 1.80 | 24 | 6.73 | 7.90 | 9.35 | 9.57 | 10.04 | 10.18 | 10.30 | 11.27 | 11.61 | 13.00 | 10.00 | 1.80 | 29 | -0.101 | 0.233 | 0.349 | 0.477 | 0.791 | 0.350 |
| 10.00 | 1.90 | 33 | 6.58 | 8.05 | 8.40 | 9.05 | 10.20 | 10.62 | 11.29 | 11.45 | 12.14 | 12.21 | 10.00 | 1.90 | 30 | -0.098 | 0.110 | 0.404 | 0.592 | 0.759 | 0.353 |
| 10.00 | 2.00 | 20 | 5.34 | 8.10 | 9.61 | 10.00 | 10.19 | 10.81 | 10.97 | 10.98 | 11.84 | 12.15 | 10.00 | 2.00 | 31 | -0.158 | 0.294 | 0.422 | 0.513 | 0.721 | 0.358 |


| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  | Specification Level | Develop a Level 1 and Level 2 Specification at the same time. |
| 2 |  | Traffic Direction | NB and SB |
| 3 |  | Lane configuration | Four. Divided |
| 4 |  | Lane width | 12 ft |
| 5 |  | Lane Accept | Check |
| 6 |  | Shoulder type | Tied PCC |
| 7 | Widened | (Widened Lane Selected Only) | - |
|  | Stress load tran | er efficiency (Tied PCC Selected Only) | 20\% |
| 8 | Inner 1 | e cracking as \% of outer lane | 10\% |
| 9 |  | Road Location | Urban |
| 10 |  | Project length | 5620 ft |
| 11 | Pavement Design Modules (Design Inputs) | Design Life | 30years |
| 12 |  | Pavement Type | Jointed Plain (JPCP), Doweled |
| 13 |  | Dowel Bar Diameter | 1.25 in |
| 14 |  | Transverse Joint Spacing | 15 ft |
| 15 |  | PCC modulus of elasticity | 4,000,000psi |
| 16 |  | Transverse Joint Sealant type | Silicone |
| 17 |  | Modulus of Subgrade Reaction (static k-value) | 150psi/in |
| 18 |  | Water-Cement Ratio | 0.42 |
| 19 |  | Percent Subgrade Material Passing the \#200 Sieve | 88\% |
| 20 | Pavement Design Modules (Base Variables) | Base Permeability | Permiable |
| 21 |  | Base Thickness | 9 in |
| 22 |  | Base Modulus of Elasticity | 25,000psi |
| 23 |  | PCC-Base Interface | Unbonded |
| 24 |  | Base Erodibility Factor | 5 |
| 25 | Design Traffic Modules | Defined traffic based on | Average Daily Traffic (ADT) |
| 26 |  | Specific traffic for year | 1 |
| 27 |  | ADT at that year | 9,400 |
| - |  | Cumulative ESALs at that year (millions) | Calculated by PaveSpec |
| 28 |  | Growth Rate | 1.050\% |
| 29 |  | Growth Type | Compound |
| 30 |  | ESAL-to ADT Directional factor | 50\% |
| 31 |  | Percent of trucks | 12\% |
| 32 |  | Percent trucks in outer lane | 90\% |
| 33 |  | Average truck load equivalency factor | 2ESALs/truck |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 34 | Climate Variable Modules | Average Annual Freezing Index | 0F-days |
| 35 |  | Average Annual Precipitation | 42.8in |
| 36 |  | Average Annual Air Freeze-Thaw Cycles | 65 cycles |
| 37 |  | Average Annual Number of Days over 90F | 13days |
| 38 |  | Climatic Zone | Wet-Nonfreeze |
| 39 | Distress Indicators |  | Transverse Joint Spalling |
|  |  |  | Transverse Slab Cracking |
|  |  |  | Decreasing Smoothness |
| 40 | Acceptance Quality Characteristics (AQC's) |  | Concrete Strength |
|  |  |  | Slab Thickness |
|  |  |  | Air Content |
|  |  |  | Initial Smoothness |
| 41 | Strength | Sampling Method | Beams |
| 42 |  | Timing of Cores | - |
| 43 |  | Number of Samples per Sublot | 1 |
| 44 |  | Number of Replicates per Sample | 2 |
| 45 |  | Target Timing of Testing | 28days |
| 46 |  | Test Maturity | - |
| 47 |  | Core-to-cylinder strength relationship | - |
| 48 |  | Lab-created maturity equation | - |
| 49 |  | Compressive-to-flexural relationship | - |
| 50 | Thickness | Sampling Method | Independent Cores |
| 51 |  | Timing of Samples | 4days |
| 52 |  | Number of Samples per Sublot | 2 |
| 53 |  | Number of Replicates per Sample | 1 |
| 54 | Air Content | Sampling Method | Air pressure Meter |
| 55 |  | Timing of Samples | - |
| 56 |  | Number of Samples per Sublot | 2 |
| 57 |  | Number of Replicates per Sample | 1 |
| 58 | Initial Smoothness | Initial Smoothness Indicator | Profile Index (0.0-in blanking band) |
| 59 |  | Initial Smoothness Relationship | - |
| 60 |  | Number of Pass Locations per Sublot | 1 |
| 61 |  | Pass Locations (describe) |  |
| 62 |  | Number of Replications per Pass Location | 2 |
| 63 |  | Timing of Samples (describe) |  |
| 64 |  | Profilograph Reduction Method | v |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. | Input |  | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 65 | Determine target LCC by |  | Estimate LCC through Simulation |
| 66 | Concrete Strength | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 67 |  | Mean | 700psi |
| 68 |  | Std Dev | 40psi |
| 69 | Slab Thickness | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 70 |  | Mean | 9.5 in |
| 71 |  | Std Dev | 0.5 in |
| 72 | Air Content | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 73 |  | Mean | 6.50\% |
| 74 |  | Std Dev | 0.50\% |
| 75 | Initial Smoothness | Sample Method | Distribution |
| 76 |  | Mean | $32 \mathrm{in} / \mathrm{mi}$ |
| 77 |  | Std Dev | 8in/mi |
| 78 | Percent Consol. <br> Around Dowels | Sample Method | - |
| 79 |  | Mean | - |
| 80 |  | Std Dev | - |
| 81 | Maintenance and <br> Rehabilitation Plan Modules (Maintenance) | Maintenance Transverse Joints | Check |
| 82 |  | Seal | 40\% |
| 83 |  | Regular Maintenance Year | 5 years |
| 84 |  | Maintenance Longitudinal Joints | Check |
| 85 |  | Seal | 25\% |
| 86 |  | Regular Maintenance Year | 5 years |
| 87 |  | Maintenance Transverse Cracks | Check |
| 88 |  | Seal | 100\% |
| 89 |  | Regular Maintenance Year | $3 y$ ars |
| 90 | Maintenance and Rehabilitation Plan Modules (Local Rehab) | Step 1 (defined) | Always do full-depth repairs to $100 \%$ of spalled joints. |
|  |  | Step 2 (defined) | If cumulative percent cracked slabs exceed $10.00 \%$, then consider the sublot failed. |
|  |  | Step 3 (defined) | If cumulative percent spalled joints exceeds $10.00 \%$, then consider the sublot failed. |
|  |  | Step 4 (defined) | If average transverse joint faulting exceeds 0.2500 in, then consider the sublot failed. |
|  |  | Step 5 (defined) | If percent failed sublots exceed $25 \%$, then begin global rehab scenario 1. |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 91 | Maintenance and Rehabilitation Plan Modules (Global Rehab) | Repair Spalled Joints | Check |
| 92 |  | \% of spalled joints to be repaired | 100\% |
| 93 |  | Repair Type | Partial-depth repairs |
| 94 |  | Repair Cracked Slabs | Check |
| 95 |  | \% of cracked slabs to be repaired | 100\% |
| 96 |  | Repair Type | Partial slab replacements |
| 97 |  | 1st Global Rehabilitation to Apply | AC Overlay |
| 98 |  | Assumed life of 1st global rehabilitation | 7 years |
| 99 |  | Start IRI of 1st global rehabilitation | $90 \mathrm{in} / \mathrm{mi}$ |
| 100 |  | End IRI of 1st global rehabilitation | $200 \mathrm{in} / \mathrm{mi}$ |
| 101 |  | 2nd Global Rehabilitation to Apply | AC Overlay |
| 102 |  | Assumed life of 2nd global rehabilitation | 7 years |
| 103 |  | Start IRI of 2nd global rehabilitation | $95 \mathrm{in} / \mathrm{mi}$ |
| 104 |  | End IRI of 2nd global rehabilitation | 200in/mi |
| 105 |  | 3rd Global Rehabilitation to Apply | AC Overlay |
| 106 |  | Assumed life of 3rd global rehabilitation | 5years |
| 107 |  | Start IRI of 3rd global rehabilitation | $100 \mathrm{in} / \mathrm{mi}$ |
| 108 |  | End IRI of 3rd global rehabilitation | 200in/mi |
| 109 |  | 4th Global Rehabilitation to Apply | AC Overlay |
| 110 |  | Assumed life of 4th global rehabilitation | $3 y \mathrm{ars}$ |
| 111 |  | Start IRI of 4th global rehabilitation | 105in/mi |
| 112 |  | End IRI of 4th global rehabilitation | 200in/mi |
| 113 | Unit Costs Modules (Maintenance) | Transverse Joint Sealing | \$1.20 per ft |
| 114 |  | Longitudinal Joint Sealing | \$1.00 per ft |
| 115 |  | Transverse Crack Sealing | \$1.00 per ft |
| 116 | Unit Costs Modules (Rehabilitation) | Full-depth repairs of transverse joints | \$159 per sq. yd |
| 117 |  | Partial-depth repairs of transverse joints | \$364 per sq. yd |
| 118 |  | Full slab replacements | - |
| 119 |  | Partial slab replacements | \$135 per sq. yd |
| 120 |  | AC overlay | \$11 per sq. yd |
| 121 |  | PCC overlay | - |
| 122 |  | Diamond grinding | - |

TABLE
(Continued)

| No. |  | Input | Value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 123 | Unit Costs Modules (Other) | Annual inflation rate | 3\% |
| 124 |  | Annual interest rate | 6\% |
| 125 |  | Assumed width of a full-depth repair of a transverse joint | 6 ft |
| 126 |  | Assumed width of a partial-depth repair of a transverse joint | 6 ft |
| 127 |  | Assumed width of a partial slab replacement | 6 ft |
| 128 |  | User cost percentage to include | 0\% |
| 129 |  | Year of construction | 2012 |
| 130 | Generic Settings | Number of lots to simulate at each factorial point | 500 |
| 131 |  | Minimum number of sublots per lot to simulate | 3 |
| 132 |  | Maximum number of sublots per lot to simulate | 3 |
| 133 |  | Average bid price | \$20/sq.yd |
| 134 |  | Analysis life | 30 years |

## About the Joint Transportation Research Program (JTRP)

On March 11, 1937, the Indiana Legislature passed an act which authorized the Indiana State Highway Commission to cooperate with and assist Purdue University in developing the best methods of improving and maintaining the highways of the state and the respective counties thereof. That collaborative effort was called the Joint Highway Research Project (JHRP). In 1997 the collaborative venture was renamed as the Joint Transportation Research Program (JTRP) to reflect the state and national efforts to integrate the management and operation of various transportation modes.

The first studies of JHRP were concerned with Test Road No. 1—evaluation of the weathering characteristics of stabilized materials. After World War II, the JHRP program grew substantially and was regularly producing technical reports. Over 1,500 technical reports are now available, published as part of the JHRP and subsequently JTRP collaborative venture between Purdue University and what is now the Indiana Department of Transportation.

Free online access to all reports is provided through a unique collaboration between JTRP and Purdue Libraries. These are available at: http://docs.lib.purdue.edu/jtrp

Further information about JTRP and its current research program is available at: http://www.purdue.edu/jtrp

## About This Report

An open access version of this publication is available online. This can be most easily located using the Digital Object Identifier (doi) listed below. Pre-2011 publications that include color illustrations are available online in color but are printed only in grayscale.

The recommended citation for this publication is:
Park, J., Yuan, C., \& Cai, H. (2016). Long-term pavement performance indicators for failed materials (Joint Transportation Research Program Publication No. FHWA/IN/JTRP-2016/10). West Lafayette, IN: Purdue University. http://dx.doi.org/10.5703/1288284316333


[^0]:    *Not applicable.

